



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**DANIEL LURIE
MAYOR**

**MINUTES
Regular Meeting
July 7, 2025**

**2:00 p.m.
Room 400, CITY HALL
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2663 531 1016. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: #2663 531 1016
Press # twice to listen to the meeting via audio conference
Dial *3 when you are ready to queue**

DANIEL LURIE, MAYOR

COMMISSIONERS

**KATE FAVETTI
President
JACQUELINE MINOR
Vice President
VITUS LEUNG
ADAM WOOD**

**SANDRA ENG
Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at civilservice@sfgov.org, or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. **Effective January 1, 2025, public comment received by email or voicemail at least three hours prior to the start of a meeting will be provided to the members of the Civil Service Commission and will be included in the record on the Civil Service Commission website. These public comments will no longer be read aloud at meetings.** During commission meetings, members of the public may use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code #2663 531 1016.

CALL TO ORDER

2:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

President Kate Favetti	Present
Vice President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Commissioner Vitus Leung	Present
Commissioner Adam Wood	Present

President Kate Favetti presided.

REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA

Jesse Stanton, a member of SEIU L1021 and a 2905 Sr. Eligibility Worker with the Human Services Agency. I am here today to talk about an issue that's been addressed a couple times before this Commission which is the release from probation for 2905 within the Human Services Agency. As we know, 2905s are released from probation in larger numbers and at a higher rate than any other classification within the city. We know this because of the report of future employment restrictions and probationary releases for the semi-annual periods going back to July of 2023. The Department of Human Resources was reporting job class and title; numbers are released from probation every six months on those reports and those reports did reveal in fact that 2905s are released in the highest numbers and at the highest rates. And we have been trying to address this with the department; we've called attention to this fact a couple times at this body and we are still working on that with the department. It's a challenge, onboarding can be a challenge and it's a challenging job and we understand that there are struggles there, but we believe that the numbers are too high, and we believe that there are some improvements that could be made to bring those numbers down. One of the concerns we have, however, that I would like to address here to the Commission today is that this report, the semi-annual report on future employment restrictions and probationary releases from the period has been changed to an annual report and the name has been changed. Now we expect this report to be published in August. This year it was changed from semi-annual to an annual report, but we note that the name of the report is now the annual report on future employment restrictions placed report on separations and resignations of permanent civil service and exempt employees with future restrictions that were imposed or appealed, and the restrictions subsequently reduced rescinded, and the appeal withdrawn. I understand that that is a very detailed title and that that does address a matter of concern for the Commission, however, the title of the report has changed to remove any reference to the release from probation period. It was just in 2023, the period July to December 2023 was the 1st time the department reported the numbers broke out by classification and it seems like they are intending to not do that anymore going forward.

Gabrielle Wilson, I'm here because I would like to fight for my position. After 17 years as an educator, in the same school district successfully where most of the children students qualify for free lunches and had English as a second language issues, newcomer issues as well. I decided it was time for me to step aside there and pursue a different challenge, a job where I could use my desire to uplift community and make a positive impact on someone's life, I felt like my qualifications and experiences fit very nicely with the qualifications, passed a test and on an interview and I accepted a position of Senior Eligibility Worker. There was no mention made of the difference between senior and junior eligibility worker during my abbreviated time there. So here in San Francisco, I felt it was an entry level position with an overstated title. Nonetheless, I was already in, committed and quite elated to be in an environment where I could make a difference and possibly even move up within ranks. However, during the following weeks, the training was 90 % computer usage, and I believe I spent nearly seven and a half hours per day sitting in front of a computer, but this was not enough. I was given a laptop and digital tools so I could study remotely, but I didn't achieve that goal until it was too late. There were many flaws in the software. I can type 85 words a minute and teach others how to write, and yet this curriculum had more to do with rope memorization and robotics. So, I needed more time and attention with the few instructors that we had, once I fell behind, there was really no getting ahead, yet there were more months before my probation was to end. I believe with more time I can achieve all requisite benchmarks and make a positive difference as an Eligibility Worker for the most fragile of San Francisco. In closing, this is the least diverse position with regards to race that I've ever worked in. Thank you

Alexandra Sokoll, Thank you for giving me the opportunity to speak today, we were all given this handout clearly outlining and defining what the upcoming training will be consisted of as well as important specifics for accomplishing the goal of counting what's ahead. I also would like to mention that when a training officer was referring to a particular handout, I often was the first who had it pulled out and ready, clearly supporting my organization and familiarity with notes, materials, and subject matter. Nowhere in the above neither the key to success nor in the outline of the trainee evaluation, is there a mention that if I do not pass the 1st assessments at the minimum average score of 70, I will be at the least or not let go to even proceed to my last 4th assessment, nor does it mention that I will not be allowed to proceed to OJT. I was never invited, nor offered an opportunity to review, nor discussion of my performance, especially after second assessment, and since it was not a computer generated where you can clearly see true or false multiple choice, where all humans and we all made mistakes. Nobody allowed us to see what was done, where I did wrong, and there could have been mistakes human error and my score could have been better. In these several weeks, we were advised by one of the training officers that 30 plus percent of the trainees did not pass the 1st assessment.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES - Action Item

Regular Meeting of June 16, 2025 – 2:00 p.m.

Action: Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 4 to 0)

ANNOUNCEMENTS

None.

Items severed from the Ratification Agenda:

- PSC #DHRPSC0005306 v 0.01 from the Department of Public Health.
- PSC #DHRPSC0005309 v 0.01 from the Department of Public Health.
- PSC #DHRPSC0005148 v 0.01 from the Port

HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No. 5)

None.

EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S REPORT (Item No. 6)

Sandra Eng, Executive Officer, reported to the Commission how happy she was to be able to again work with “Opportunities for All” program this year. Catherine, the student intern, returned from the previous year.

0161-25-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 7)

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0005306 v 0.01	Public Health	\$4,000,000	The services to be performed include Public Health Grant and Research Development, focusing on identifying funding opportunities, applying for grants, and consulting on research projects in areas like behavioral health, community health, sexual health, and chronic disease prevention to meet the City's goals. Public Health Organizational Development, Technical Assistance, and Training involves developing training materials, leading sessions, and providing technical support to public health workers to build skills, engage with communities, and ensure compliance with state, federal, and local regulations. Public Health Program Evaluation and Community Needs Assessment includes evaluating program effectiveness, conducting community needs assessments, analyzing data, and offering recommendations to improve public health strategies, ensuring programs meet community needs. Finally, Public Health Program Implementation and Project Management covers planning, managing, and executing public health projects such as disease control, vaccination campaigns, and health education programs, ensuring they are completed on time and within budget.	New	48 months
DHRPSC 0005309 v 0.01	Public Health	\$9,999,999	Provide language interpreter services in 87 languages, with focus on nine most frequently used languages: Spanish, Cantonese, Vietnamese, Mandarin, Russian, Taishanese, Tagalog, Arabic, and Korean. Services must be available 24/7/365, including holidays, with a call response time of 30 seconds and a 95% success rate. Interpretation will be available in-person, by phone, or via video remote interpreting (VRI) across administrative, professional, and clinical/medical settings at all Department of Public Health (DPH) locations, including Jail Health Services and other designated sites. Interpreters must be medically trained, culturally competent, and comply with HIPAA, Culturally and Linguistically Appropriate Services (CLAS) standards, and Title VI of the Civil Rights Act and Joint Commission requirements. The contractor will deliver timely, reliable, and confidential services while providing regular usage reports, quality assurance metrics, and data insights to help DPH monitor service effectiveness and improve language access programs.	New	24 months

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0005242 v 0.01	Human Services Agency	\$800,000	Accept referrals from the FCS RFA unit and conduct outreach to identified caregivers and/or foster parents utilizing engagement strategies identified in the California Core Practice Model (CPM). For more information regarding CPM, please follow https://www.cdss.ca.gov/inforesources/foster-care/title-iv-e-california-well-being-project/core-service-interventions . Complete Family Evaluations and submit to FCS RFA unit.	New	48 months
DHRPSC 0005161 v 0.01	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$15,000,000	The consultant and its sub-consultant will provide specialized engineering and technical support services in a broadarea of technical disciplines to supplement the Transit Division staff in the procurement, rehabilitation, maintenance and support of its Transit Vehicle Fleet, Transit Related Equipment, Maintenance of Way, Various Transit Systemsand Facilities. The SFMTA plans to award up to three contracts for the As-Needed specialized engineering services. Each of the three contracts will be established for a period not to exceed five years, at a cost not to exceed \$5,000,000. The PSC amount of \$15,000,000 is for 3 contracts.	New	60 months
DHRPSC 0005375 v 0.01	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$95,000,000	The scope of this project is to perform system replacement and mid-life overhaul of 152 standard (40') Hybrid Electric New Flyer vehicles and 69 articulated (60') Hybrid Electric New Flyer vehicles. The Contractor will provide all repairs, warranties, labor, inspections, tools, materials, parts, facilities and equipment required to complete this work, which includes removing and replacing major vehicle systems such as engines, traction motor, energy storage system, cooling system, axles, brakes, air systems, interior and exterior body work, including pick-up and delivery of the coaches. All rehabilitation work will be performed off-site. Contractor will prepare all required detailed drawings, schematics, design calculations, stress analysis, and other specified technical documentation in connection with this project. Contractor will also support warranties on all rebuilt components. SFMTA staff will conduct outgoing and incoming coach inspections and perform in-house rebuilt components for the Contractor.	New	60 months
DHRPSC 0005407 v 0.01	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$600,000	As-needed installation services for network inside SFMTA vehicles and Facilities. SFMTA has several projects that require as-needed help to complete installations of network equipment. Once the initial installation is completed, we rely on city workers to maintain and repair the equipment. We use this as-needed help to ensure upgrades are completed in a reasonable timeframe.	New	18 months

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0005148 v 0.01	Port Commission	\$20,000,000	<p>The exact scope of work for consultant assistance during the next four to five years is not fully known, but based on projects underway, Port staff anticipates that support will be needed in the categories of work shown in Table 1 below.</p> <p>Table 1: Categories of Work</p> <p>PRIMARY CATEGORIES OF WORK</p> <p>Structural Engineering Construction Management</p> <p>Marine Structures Engineering Including design and analysis of piers and wharves, including seismic retrofit, vertical load capacity evaluation, repair/upgrade design and structural assessment</p> <p>Special Inspections and Testing</p> <p>Coastal Engineering: including shoreline protection, sediment transport, evaluation of sea level rise and resilience design</p> <p>Architecture and Building Envelope</p> <p>Geotechnical Engineering: including deep foundations, near shore and offshore projects, and seismic and soil-structure interaction studies</p> <p>Historic Preservation</p> <p>Civil Engineering: including traffic engineering, and street, sewer, and hydrology/stormwater design per City of San Francisco standards, and Caltrans Standards</p> <p>ADA Design and Inspections</p> <p>Mechanical Engineering & Plumbing: Including plumbing design for potable water, sanitary sewer system, irrigation system, fire sprinkler system, gas distribution system, HVAC systems, and sewer and water systems under marine structures.</p> <p>Inspection and assessment of existing infrastructure (Structural, Architectural, Utilities)</p> <p>Electrical Engineering: Including medium and low voltage power system design</p> <p>Cost Estimating</p> <p>Fire Protection Engineering Constructability Reviews including Value Engineering and Peer Review</p> <p>Naval Architecture: Including analysis and design mooring and berthing systems and floating structure facilities.</p> <p>Specification Writing</p> <p>Surveying: Including aerial and bathymetric techniques, and underground utility location.</p> <p>Built Environment Sustainability Consulting</p> <p>Including Envision, LEED, local Green Building, Solar, Energy, and Utility requirements, and specification writing/review.</p> <p>SECONDARY CATEGORIES OF WORK</p> <p>Environmental: Including hazardous materials testing, sampling evaluation and monitoring; specification writing; CEQA and NEPA)</p> <p>Data Management</p> <p>Library Sciences</p> <p>Enterprise Asset Management</p> <p>System Development</p> <p>Project Management</p> <p>Signage Design and Reproduction</p> <p>Including graphic design, interpretive and wayfinding signage</p> <p>Demolition Engineering</p> <p>Building Code Development</p> <p>Corrosion Engineering</p> <p>Cruise Terminal Operations</p> <p>Railroad Engineering</p> <p>Consulting</p> <p>Utilities Piping and Metering</p> <p>Marina Design</p> <p>Shoreside Power Design</p> <p>Crane Inspection, Testing and Certification</p> <p>Services Building Occupancy Resumption Program – inspections</p> <p>Grant Application Support</p> <p>Building/Encroachment Permit Plan Checking</p> <p>Review</p> <p>Including Architectural, ADA, Civil, Structural, Mechanical, Plumbing, and Electrical</p> <p>Dry Dock Inspection and Design</p> <p>Marine Biology</p> <p>Landscape Architecture</p> <p>Including horticulturist and playground design.</p> <p>Arborist</p> <p>TERTIARY CATEGORIES OF WORK</p> <p>Archeology</p> <p>Elevator/Escalator Consulting</p> <p>Life-Cycle Cost Analysis</p> <p>Computer Drafting and modeling</p> <p>Forensic Investigation</p> <p>Transportation and Traffic Engineering</p> <p>Construction Litigation</p> <p>Support</p> <p>Community Relations</p> <p>Economic Studies</p> <p>Lighting Design including photometric analysis</p>	New	48 months

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004829 v 0.01	Public Utilities Commission	\$8,000,000	The scope of work includes six major service categories. 1. Watershed Planning Services focused not only on stormwater management, but also enhancing flood resilience while maximizing benefits like climate resilience, urban design, pedestrian safety, and biodiversity. 2. Policy Development, Strategic Planning, and Operational Strategy Services specifically in the field of green infrastructure, with a focus on bringing national best practices to bear in San Francisco to develop and support policies for stormwater, green infrastructure, and flood resilience that also facilitate multi-agency cooperation and blended funding for multi-benefit projects. 3. Program Development Services, which will support adaptation, improvement, and integration of industry best practice into existing stormwater, green infrastructure and flood resilience programs and partnerships. 4. Stormwater Management Ordinance Implementation Support & Regulatory Compliance Services, with specialized focus on monitoring state regulatory changes (especially in the Municipal Separate Storm Sewer System -MS4 Permit and National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System -NPDES Permit). Support sought includes innovative compliance strategies and updating tools and outreach materials to align with stormwater regulations as-needed. Supporting Stormwater Management Ordinance (SMO) compliance through project reviews, audits, and engagement with design teams is also included in this section. 5. Watershed Stewardship & Community Engagement Services, to support watershed stewardship programs, including developing and implementing outreach and engagement strategies and event planning supported by place-based content and graphic design. 6. Support Services for Green Infrastructure Implementation, with specialized services in green infrastructure maintenance planning, asset assessment, and training.	New	48 months
DHRPSC 0005302 v 0.01	Public Utilities Commission	\$1,500,000	The SFPUC seeks PSC approval to enter into 5 separate agreements of \$250,000 with qualified professional services Contractors to provide construction safety and pre-qualification services. Services provided by the Contractor shall include reviewing safety prequalification statements and documents submitted by construction contractors desiring to contract with the City. The selected Contractor will review OSHA forms 300 and 300A concerning injury and illness rates, lost work rates, and the rate of OSHA violations; corporate safety documents; and any explanations of OSHA Violations. After review of these documents, the Contractor will evaluate the submissions to determine if the construction contractor is qualified to bid on CCSF construction contracts.	New	60 months
DHRPSC 0005370 v 0.01	Public Utilities Commission	\$100,000,000	This is highly specialized wastewater treatment work that provides new nutrient removal processes to assist the Wastewater Enterprise in meeting new regulatory permit requirements from the Regional Water Quality Control Board (RWQCB) for the Southeast Plant.	New	144 months

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0005373 v 0.01	Public Utilities Commission	\$80,000,000	<p>The City is seeking to retain the services of up to four (4) qualified Proposers, each at a value of \$20 million. The work will consist of assisting the SFPUC with operations and maintenance support services, including asset management services, and engineering services that are limited to condition assessment, capital planning, and needs assessment, as well as environmental and regulatory compliance for the SFPUC Water Enterprise.</p> <p>Required skills under this contract pertain to proven expertise and extensive experience in the following tasks to include, but not limited to: (1) Water Services (Water Supply, Storage, Delivery, and Transport Services, Water Quality Services, Water and Wastewater Treatment Services; (2) Power Services (Hydrogeneration and transmission equipment and controls); (3) Operations and Management Services (Management Improvement Services, Asset Management Services, Specialized Technical Operation/Maintenance Services, Land Management Services, Security, Asset Control, and Emergency Response, Environmental and Regulatory Compliance Services, Hazardous Materials and Waste Services, Health and Safety Services, Condition assessment and project prioritization; and On-site Operational Client Engagements. In addition, Federal and State environmental and regulatory agencies require reporting and compliance in numerous areas including water quality, water treatment, water supply and storage, power operations, hazardous materials, and health and safety. The as-needed services provided by these contracts include, but are not limited to: inspections and condition assessments, Occupational Safety & Health Administration (OSHA) policies and procedures interpretation and compliance, hazardous materials and waste management and planning; and cultural resources management and species monitoring.</p>	New	60 months

Note: *New Personal Services Contracts start date may not exceed eighteen (18) months after approval/commission meeting date.*

Speakers: My Lan Do Nguyen and Nikole Trainor spoke on PSC #DHRPSC0005306 v 0.01, Department of Public Health
My Lan Do Nguyen and Justin Dodderman, Department of Public Health and Carey Dall and Kristen Hardy, from SEIU Local 1021 spoke on PSC #DHRPSC0005309 v 0.01
Erica Petersen PSC # DHRPSC0005148 v 0.01, Port of San Francisco

Action:

1. Approved PSC #DHRPSC0005306 v 0.01 from the Department of Public Health reducing the amount to \$4,000,000. (Vote of 4 to 0)
2. Approved PSC #DHRPSC0005309 v 0.01 Department of Public Health. (Vote of 3 to 1; Commissioner Leung dissented)
3. Approved PSC #DHRPSC0005148 v 0.01 from the Port. (Vote of 4 to 0)
4. Adopted the report. Approved the requests for the remaining proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0162-25-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contract
#DHRPSC0005245 v 0.01 from the Department of Public Health.
(Item No. 8)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0005245 v 0.01	Public Health	\$30,000,000	To provide security services to ensure the safety, security and welfare of patients/residents, visitors, and staff at the Zuckerberg San Francisco General Hospital, (ZSFG), Laguna Honda Hospital (LHH), and Primary Care and Behavioral Health Community Clinics, unarmed security guards will be assigned to fixed-position locations providing access control by screening people entering the facilities using visual inspection, as indicated. Unarmed security guards will also provide designated-route patrols of both interior and exterior locations. In addition, unarmed security guards will respond to incidents involving disturbances, violence and/or other needs to preserve order, including compliance with regulations pertaining to visitors, resident/patients, vendors, and the facility's premises. Contractor will provide regular written Daily Activity Reports and Incident Reports within Department designated turn-around times.	New	60 months

June 16, 2025: Postponed PSC #DHRPSC0005245 v 0.01 from the Department of Public Health to the meeting of July 7, 2025, at the request of SEIU and the department.

Speakers: MyLan Do Nguyen, Department of Public Health
Basil Price, Department of Public Health

Public Comment: Kristin Hardy, SEIU L1021, representing Naj Daniels rep for the Sheriff Department, when the original meet and confer occurred they had agreed upon \$18M and they just got notification that the numbers were wrong and they are increasing it to \$24M but the Union has not agreed on
Oumar Fall, SEIU L1021, informed the Commission that he had just received notification of the increase from \$18M to \$24M

Action: Continued to the meeting of July 21, 2025. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0163-25-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contract
#DHRPSC0005289 v 0.01 from the Department of Public Health.
(Item No. 9)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0005289 v 0.01	Public Health	\$8,500,000	Provide program administration services, financial management and reporting, performance/quality management and service delivery in support of specific behavioral health programs for Department of Public Health (DPH) clients. These services include managing funds for designated behavioral health projects, provide timely and accurate financial and annual audit reports, manage/monitor subcontractor performance and provide human resource management specific to accomplishing project goals.	New	48 months

June 16, 2025: Postponed PSC #DHRPSC0005289 v 0.01 from the Department of Public Health to the meeting of July 7, 2025, at the request of the department.

Speakers: MyLan Do Nguyen, Department of Public Health
Michelle Ruggels, Department of Public Health
Carey Dall, SEIU L1021

Action: Adopted the report. Approved the request for proposed Personal Services Contract #DHRPSC0005289 v 0.01 reducing the amount to \$8,500,000; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 3 to 1; Commissioner Leung dissented)

0084-25-4 Appeal by ChongLiang Guo of their disqualification from the 2119 Health Care Analyst Examination. (Item No. 10)

Speakers: David Chalk, Department of Public Health
ChongLiang Guo, Appellant
Scott DeWolfe, Department of Public Health
Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources

Action: Denied the appeal and adopted the report of the Department of Public Health. (Vote of 3 to 1; Commissioner Leung dissented)

COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 11)

Commissioner Minor made a second request for an update from the EEO division on the status of its case handling and where we stand in case closures. She knows that the EEO division has taken in a body of work from several departments, so she does think it's time for the Commission to receive updates so that we can stay abreast of the commitments that we and the department have made to move these EEO cases as expeditiously as we can through the system to get resolution for our employees.

ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 12)

3:57 p.m.