



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**DANIEL LURIE
MAYOR**

**MINUTES
Regular Meeting
March 16, 2026**

**2:00 p.m.
Room 400, CITY HALL
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2662 87 7959. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: #2662 87 7959
Press # twice to listen to the meeting via audio conference
Dial *3 when you are ready to queue**

DANIEL LURIE, MAYOR

COMMISSIONERS

**KATE FAVETTI
President**

**JACQUELINE MINOR
Vice President**

**VITUS LEUNG
ADAM WOOD**

**SANDRA ENG
Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at civilservice@sfgov.org, or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at (628) 652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. **Effective January 1, 2025, public comment received by email or voicemail at least three hours prior to the start of a meeting will be provided to the members of the Civil Service Commission and will be included in the record on the Civil Service Commission website. These public comments will no longer be read aloud at meetings.** During commission meetings, members of the public may use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line (415) 655-0001, Access Code #2662 87 7959.

CALL TO ORDER

2:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

President Kate Favetti	Present
Vice President Jacqueline P. Minor	Excused
Commissioner Vitus Leung	Present
Commissioner Adam Wood	Present

President Kate Favetti presided.

REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No. 2)

Steve Zeltzer, I'm a member of the United Front Committee for Labor Party and I'm here today to raise the issue of the physical altercation that took place instigated by Mayor Lurie in San Francisco in the Tenderloin where the mayor has a habit of going around in the Tenderloin and bullying, in my view, racist incidents attacking Black residents of the Tenderloin. This situation led to a physical altercation in which a person was injured, and Tony Phillips was arrested. The fact of the matter is the mayor is under the Civil Service Commission Rule. He should not be inciting physical confrontations in the City and County of San Francisco which puts city employees and the public in danger. We're calling for him to be removed from office and an investigation. On top of that Tony Phillips has been kept in jail. The City is spending tens of thousands of dollars against him even though the public defender said that he was the victim of an assault instigated by Mayor Lurie. Mayor Lurie denied that was the cause of the incident. We have to protect the health and safety of San Francisco. The billionaires that run San Francisco are blaming the homeless, the poor people living in campers for the housing problem. That is not the problem, gentrification is the cause of the billionaires who want to remove people, the working-class people and poor people, from their homes and remove them out of the city. It has to stop. Frankly you've got a lot of empty mansions in Pacific Heights. Let's put the homeless in there, in those mansions. There are 60,000 empty flats in San Francisco, spotted by speculators. Many of them nobody lives in them. Let's require that they be used for the working people of San Francisco. This is a threat to public employees, and the mayor is not above the law. He has to be held accountable by this Commission and the people of San Francisco. We don't need a mayor policing and bullying people in the streets, which is what he's doing. We're calling for this Commission to take that action and furthermore there's an attack on this Commission by the mayor who wants to get rid of the commissions and wants to have one man rule, one person rule, in San Francisco. We need checks and balances. We need oversight, and I know that he has passed resolutions to the Board of Supervisors which don't require competition for bidding and allow the mayor to give out contracts to non-union companies which this commission has done in the past. The contracts that you've let out are taking away from work that city workers could do in San Francisco. We need a policy to require that if work can be done by public workers it should be done and it shouldn't be contracted out. Thank you.

Brenda Barros, I work at San Francisco General for almost 40 years and I'm here once again, unfortunately, to talk about the issue with Black workers. I'm here as a union steward representing my members who are Black and who are facing this discrimination in the workplace and unfair treatment in the workplace. I see examples over and over again where punishment is not distributed the same to everybody. Honestly if you are White and you are verbally abusive to somebody, you'll get a talking to. If you're Black, you're going to get disciplined. They're going to hold you accountable and it's just not fair. This whole system is not fair, and it needs to be addressed. We've said it before. Carol knows and I've been saying this is not something I just started saying this has been going on for years and for as long as I've been here. It seems to be getting worse. The problematic part for me is that more people are coming to me now, not less. You would think after some of the proposed changes were made that it would have got better, no, it has been reversed. It feels like we're moving backwards. It's not moving forward. It's moving backwards and I'm just here to speak for the other workers like me. We're just fed up. We're not going keep taking this as I told somebody else, I don't want to be outside with a bullhorn saying San Francisco is the most racist place I've ever been. I don't, I want to work with you guys to come up with something better. I don't see the effort that is needed in order to improve it. I just want to say that while all these other things are going on that issue cannot fall off the map. It still needs to be addressed. No matter what commissions they change, I don't care who they have doing it, it cannot fall off the radar, and it needs to be addressed for once and for all. We need to have permanent changes so that the next generation won't have to go through this.

Cheryl Thornton, I work for the Department of Public Health I'm here today on my own, volition, my own time. Good afternoon commissioners. I would like to comment regarding a former employee who requested a hearing before the Civil Service Commission roughly a year ago. This employee was barred from all classifications and has been waiting for due process related to her termination and an employment restrictions that affect her un-employment eligibility. Over the past year, we've sent multiple emails to the director of Human Resources Carol Isen seeking information about the status of this request. We also reached out to Luenna Kim, HR director for the Department of Public health as well as Louise Brooke Houston, who's over the office of Civil Rights for the Department of Public Health. We did receive a response indicating that the department would be working on this request. However, as of today there has been no update, no hearing scheduled. I understand that the departments are short-staffed and that processes can take time, but employees are still entitled to due process and waiting for more than a year for a hearing raises serious concern. My question today is simply, where is the employees due process? Ms. Fields identifies herself as female African American. She lost her employment a year ago she's had no due process, and this is an example of what Ms. Barros was explaining here about what Black employees face. They have these rules in place, but yet somehow or another they are just not followed. We want to know why this commission is still in place and how can you help us? How? It's not fair to keep people waiting and not give them due process and then at the end just rule against them and say that we can't do anything. This woman lost her livelihood. She's 60 years old. She gave over ten years of service to the City and County of San Francisco. So please stop letting DPH say that they're going to respond to this request and they don't do anything. It's not fair. Thank you.

Chris Moore, I'm very happy to be here before this commission, I'm glad you're still here as a lever of accountability for our billionaire mayor for however long that lasts. I'm here because on the afternoon of March 5th I saw Dan Lurie and his goon squad attack and assault Tony Phillips, an unhoused man on Cedar Street during the first Thursday Tenderloin Artwalk. I am a volunteer. I was across the street bartending at the time of the attack and assault. The last time that I checked, the mayor's job is not to run around the City and start fights with our most marginalized brothers and sisters. I know this because I read all about what the mayor's job is before I launched my own mayoral campaign in the last cycle. I did not win. We need leaders with vision for all San Franciscans not bodyguards. We need leaders that have to hold the law for our most vulnerable neighbors. We need leaders who hold the dignity of Civil Service. What we do not need is a bumbling Bruce Wayne running amuck and stirring up more **** for our beleaguered citizens. We need real leadership. Thank you.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)

Regular Meeting of March 2, 2026 – 2:00 p.m.

Action: Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 3 to 0)

ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)

Items severed from the Ratification Agenda:

PSC #DHRPSC0006087 v0.01 from the Human Services Agency
PSC #DHRPSC0006032 v0.01 from the Human Services Agency
PSC #DHRPSC0002549 v2.03 from the Department of Early Childhood

Items severed from the Consent Agenda:

Item #10 Follow-up Report on Personal Services Contract Number DHRPSC0005116 from the Department of Public Health.

Public comment, including public comment on any additional Ratification or Consent items that the public would like severed from the agenda.

Brenda Barros, at a time when they're laying people off, at a time when the mayor says that the budget is so dire, I don't understand how you can approve all this money. Where's this money going to come from? Because what we fear is going to come out of our rights as workers. Because where else is it going to come from? The mayor says there's no money. I mean, he's been all over the news everywhere saying there's no money. I don't know how all this stuff is getting approved when there's no money. Where's this money coming from? I think that, you know, all this contracting out is really just a tactic, right? To eliminate civil service. They want us to be gone as civil service employees and your job is to protect us as civil service employees and to make sure we're not gone. We hope that the decisions you start making lead to that because I mean it's getting really difficult for us to believe that you guys are here to protect us when we see over and over and over again, our jobs going out of the door to somebody else.

Cheryl Thornton, I work down in the tenderloin in a health clinic and right now yes, the department is facing all these cuts to public health. We do work with a lot of community partners that provide resources. But over the years, working as an employee, what I've seen in my lived experience is, the more contracts they add, the more bureaucracy and fragmentation of services. And then sometimes the services are there as resources for the clients. Other times they're not. I just think that if there is some way to make these resources a livable wage, a public worker wage, and a public worker, a civil servant, then a lot of the people who have been traumatized and retraumatized over and over again will get the services that we need to offer them, and will have a chance of recovery. Nobody wants to be down in the gutter in the street, with nothing to eat, nowhere to sleep. So, we owe it to humanity to do better. The contracting out, all it's doing is providing somebody with an opportunity to make a lot of money. But the underserved community is getting less and less of the resources, and that's why you see in the county that the average median age for a Black person is 62 and for citywide it's 82. A lot of the Black people that are remaining in San Francisco are very poor people. They're not the only group and we will see these same disparities. But if we want to get better, because I go to my job every day to advocate for people, to help them, and it breaks my heart when we can't, and we just have to turn them back out to the streets with nothing. There was a lady in the office the other day trying to get to her daughter's funeral, and she had no money to get to Richmond, and she came to us and we had no way to help. It's really devastating for the workers. Thank you. For the residents of San Francisco, it's not a good use of money.

Steve Zeltzer, Millions and billions of dollars have been contracted out in the City of County of San Francisco, and you've approved that they could go to nonpublic employees. Why are nonpublic workers doing it when they can be done by public workers? Public workers have protections that other workers don't have. They have healthcare, they have better benefits. If you do public work, it's our position. If you do public work in San Francisco, cleaning up the streets, tending to bathrooms, you should be a public worker. Health Right 360 is a private company that you give money to, a "nonprofit." They're doing public work. Why shouldn't they be public workers paid as public workers? This is what we say as a principle. There needs to be a charter amendment in San Francisco and the state of California to stop the contracting out and privatization of public workers jobs. Because that is the way the billionaires, as has been said earlier, make profit. They profit from busting public worker unions and contracting out and we, the people of San Francisco and working people have to stop it. It's growing. It's also part of the program of project 2025, which is now the federal government program. They've gotten rid of millions of workers, they're busting unions of federal unions, and also, they're getting rid of particularly Black workers in the United States, in federal service and in public service. This is a pattern. It's an organized pattern of racism, systemic racism and union busting, and we have to stop it here in San Francisco and we have to stop it nationally.

(0042-26-1) Commendation for Patrick O’Riordan, Department Head, Department of Building Inspection for his dedicated service to the City and County of San Francisco. (Item No. 5)

Speaker: Patrick O’Riordan

Action: Accepted the Commendation. (Vote of 3 to 0)

HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No. 6)

Carol Isen, Madam President members of the commission. I have one item that I wish to report on. On March 9th we opened applications for our 1st ever San Francisco Public Safety Trainee Program. We are running an internship in partnership with the Police Department and City College of San Francisco. We've received a grant from the Crankstart Foundation through Opportunities for All. We're offering a paid internship for emerging workers aged 19 to 24 who are interested in checking out the possibility of serving in law enforcement in San Francisco. We're taking applications now. They will close on April 3rd if you know anybody that you want to direct our way. The program will run from June 22 to July 30th. It's a paid internship and you have to either live or go to school in San Francisco in order to be eligible. I brought some flyers with me about it. This is something that we have long been wanting to do. The Police Department is still 500 officers short, and our staff has gotten deeply involved in working with the department and other partnerships in order to generate some interest and enthusiasm about becoming a police officer in San Francisco. I brought information from our workforce and organizational development team to share with you. We're really excited about this. It fits nicely with our other work through apprenticeship SF. To help build careers and support emerging workers. Thank you for that.

Public Comment: Cheryl Thornton
Steve Zeltzer
Brenda Barros

EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S REPORT (Item No. 7)

Sandra Eng, Commissioners, just to give you an update, we have not been able to do our usual trainings in the hearing room, but we have been doing smaller trainings on PSCs because we do have some retirements of our knowledgeable contract managers and we have some changes in PSC coordinators. We're doing more of one hour training, just to refresh everyone about why the Commission hears requests for personal service contracts and the need for transparency. It's very informative, it helps us actually fully develop a PSC training in partnership with the DHR. There were some concerns about contacting the union and the requirements for PSCs., I've shared that there is a difference between what is stated in the MOU and the importance of transparency with the Civil Service Commission. It has been a valuable opportunity for our office because it helps us decide the type of material that we need to update, such as our Civil Service Advisor on personal service contracts. There appears to be more questions about PSC procedures because our contract managers are aware of the importance of coming before the Civil Service Commission. They are asking more questions when they can modify or extend PSCs, and we're also learning that there may be some challenges with the PSC database for unusual circumstances, but we plan to work with GovOps and OCA.

**(0036-26-8) Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts.
(Item No. 8)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0006052 - v0.01	City Administrator	\$2,900,000	Services for contractors coming onto City property to fuel individual City vehicles with gasoline and diesel fuels using the contractor's fuel tanker truck and dispensing equipment. The contractor's trucks and drivers will supply gasoline and diesel fuels upon request from individual vehicle operators.	New	60 Months
DHRPSC 0001015 - v0.01	Public Works	\$5,000,000	Design and Construction Administration Support for the Powell Street Improvement Project: This contract will provide preparation of final design documents, including full construction documents. The contractor will provide technical Support for the stakeholder engagement on Powell Street and around Union Square, including incorporation of community input, businesses and interagency approvals into construction documents. As part of the construction design, the contract will lead utility coordination with multiple utility providers and City agencies, including conflict identification, resolution, and schedule integration. Finally, the scope includes construction administration support, such as response to RFIs, review of submittals for design conformance, design clarifications during construction, and coordination with City staff. Public Works and City staff are involved, playing a critical supporting role, but we don't have the bandwidth to take the lead without affecting timelines.	New	36 months
DHRPSC 0006087 - v0.01	Human Services Agency	\$2,000,000	The consultant shall provide technical assistance, guidance and best practices for the Family First Prevention Services Act (FFPSA), and how to plan, implement, and evaluate promising, supported or well supported prevention services for San Francisco Child Welfare, Behavioral Health, Juvenile Probation, Department of Early Childhood and Community-Based Organization (CBOs). This scope shall include the following subject areas: prevention program development and implementation that leverages a public and private partner network; determination of funding sources for services; development of provider and county capacity and processes to capture services costs in alignment with FFPSA requirements and California Department Social Services (CDSS) instructions for claiming; continuous quality improvement utilizing programmatic and data evaluation and findings; and related coaching, supervision, and capacity building for all partner agencies. The expected outcome is development and implementation of an integrated and comprehensive citywide prevention services pathway that increases economic stability, reduces child maltreatment, and improves child welfare permanency outcomes through coordinated prevention programs provided to children, youth and families of the City and County of San Francisco.	New	36 months

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0006032 - v0.01	Human Services Agency	\$810,000	Provide visitation, individualized one-on-one, peer support activities and counseling for the parents/guardians of children who are dually involved in the child welfare and criminal justice systems. Incarcerated visitation services include assisting Protective Services Workers (PSWs) in arranging, scheduling, navigating and confirming parent / guardian child visits in jails under the jurisdiction of the City and County San Francisco (CCSF) Sheriff Department. Participate in the San Francisco Children of Incarcerated Parents Partnership (SFCIPP), a coalition of social service providers, representatives of government bodies, advocates and others who work with or are concerned about children incarcerated parents and their families. Participate in Visiting Committee that includes Facility Command staff, SFSO Program staff, Community Based Organization staff. CWW provides services to parents/legal guardians whose children are involved in the child welfare system and who are incarcerated in one of the two San Francisco County jails: • County Jail #2 - 425 7th Street, SF • County Jail #3 - 1 Moreland Dr., San Bruno	New	48 months
DHRPSC 0006025 - v0.01	Public Utilities Commission	\$2,000,000	The selected contractor(s) will be responsible for implementing a comprehensive state lobbying strategy for the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC), on legislative and regulatory issues related to water, wastewater, power, infrastructure, and other issues as directed. The scope of work includes: • LEGISLATIVE TRACKING • STATE REPRESENTATION • POSITION AND STRATEGY DEVELOPMENT • DRAFT MATERIALS • LOBBYING STRATEGY • MEETINGS • MEMBERSHIP ASSOCIATIONS • DEVELOP AND IDENTIFY STATE FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES • REPORTS	New	60 months
DHRPSC 0002549 – v2.03	Early Childhood	Current Approved Amount \$10,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$20,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$30,000,000	Original coordinator's email: MAhn@sfgov.org. This request is for professional training and technical assistance for department funded programs providing direct services to children (birth to 5) and their families. Program improvement may also be made available as continuing education to department staff whose roles involve support of funded programs. Technical assistance and program improvement will be provided broadly to address issues of program quality, administrative capability, and fulfillment of state and local early care and education requirements.	Amendment	Increase months 24 Total months 83
DHRPSC 0002550 – v1.01	Early Childhood	Current Approved Amount \$10,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$10,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$20,000,000	Services are for the design, access, and support of information system solutions for the Department of Early Childhood (DEC). Information technology management system solutions are defined as technology-based systems that assist DEC staff and clients by providing childcare web-based waitlist; Program Evaluation and Assessment systems; Website Creation and Content Development Applications; contract management; and other ancillary services including training, technical support, installations, and upgrades of DEC's information technology.	Amendment	Increase months 59 Total months 119

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0005624 – v1.01	Municipal Transportation Agency	Current Approved Amount \$658,009.40 Increase Amount Requested \$1,231,955.90 New Total Amount Requested \$1,889,965.30	Safety inspection(s) of our lifting device assets including Cranes, Gantries, Jib Cranes, Storage Stackers and Mechanical lifting such as Blocks and Chain Hoists. Repairs to such devices and systems to proper manufacturers specifications and applicable regulations. Monitoring wear limits and recommending repairs in a preventative manner keeping equipment operational for normal and emergency use when needed. Emergency repairs as needed.	Amendment	Increase months 0 Total months 60

Note: New Personal Services Contracts start date may not exceed eighteen (18) months after approval/commission meeting date.

Speakers: Elizabeth Leone and Denard Ingram from the Human Services Agency and Naj Daniels, SEIU 1021 spoke on PSC #DHRPSC0006087 v0.01.
Elizabeth Leone and Mirna Palma from the Human Services Agency and Naj Daniels, SEIU 1021 spoke on PSC #DHRPSC6032 v0.01.
Tracy Fong and Meenoo Yasher from the Department Early Childhood and Jegy Sering, SEIU spoke on PSC #DHRPSC0002549 v2.03.

Action:

1. Approved PSC #DHRPSC0006087 v0.01. (Vote of 3 to)
2. Approved PSC#DHRPSC0006032 v0.01 with the condition to report back to the Commission in three (3) years with a feasibility study assessing what it will require to bring this work back in-house. (Vote of 3 to 0)
3. Continued PSC #DHRPSC0002549 v2.02 to the meeting of April 6, 2026. (Vote of 3 to 0)
4. Adopt the report. Approve the requests for proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 3 to 0)

Public Comment: Brenda Barros
Cheryl Thornton

(0037-26-8) Follow-up Report on Personal Services Contract Number DHRPSC0002669 (formerly PSC #43520-23/24) from the Department of Public Works. (Item No. 9)

Action: Adopted the report. (Vote of 3 to 0)

(0038-26-8) Follow-up Report on Personal Services Contract Number DHRPSC0005116 from the Department of Public Health. (Item No. 10)

Speakers: My Lan Do Nguyen, Department of Public Health
 Gillian Otway, Department of Public Health
 Erika Thorson, Department of Public Health

Action: Adopted the report. (Vote of 3 to 0)

Public Comment: Steve Zeltzer
 Cheryl Thornton
 Brenda Barros

(0039-26-8) Follow-up Report on Personal Services Contract Number DHRPSC0004718 from the Public Utilities Commission. (Item No. 11)

Action: Adopted the report. (Vote of 3 to 0)

(0256-25-7) Request for a Hearing by Oscar Pena, former 2977 Education Integration Specialist on their Future Employment Restrictions with the San Francisco Unified School District. (Item No. 12)

Action: Postpone to a future meeting in May 2026, at the request of the appellant. (Vote of 3 to 0)

(0040-26-8) Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contract #DHRPSC0005857 - v0.01 – from the Public Defender following the Fact finding Process. (Item No. 13)

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0005857 - v0.01	Public Defender	\$200,000	Standard janitorial services are needed for the new PDR office space located at 8 Boardman. The lease contract for this space was recently executed with a 60-month term beginning on a commencement date that's currently pending confirmation. Services will include routine cleaning as listed in OCA's Term Contract.	New	60 months

Speaker: Lyslynn Lacoste, Public Defender

Action: Adopted the report. Approved the request for proposed Personal Services Contract; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 3 to 0)

(0041-26-1 Discussion on the Commission Streamlining Task Force (CSTF) Recommendations for the Civil Service Commission including proposed CSTF Charter Amendments forwarded to the Board of Supervisors. (Item No. 14)

Speakers: Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission
President Kate Favetti
Commissioner Adam Wood

Action: No action.

Public Comment: Williams Miles II

COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 15)

Commissioner Leung requested a status update on Ms. Field situation.

Commissioner Wood requested the discussion of the charter amendments coming from the Mayor's Office at a future meeting affecting the Civil Service Commission.

ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 16)

3:58 p.m.