



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR**

**MINUTES  
Regular Meeting  
December 16, 2024**

**2:00 p.m.  
Room 400, CITY HALL  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

**This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id # 2664 768 6797. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.**

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN  
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: # 2664 768 6797  
Press # twice to listen to the meeting via audio conference  
Dial \*3 when you are ready to queue**

**LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR**

**COMMISSIONERS**

**KATE FAVETTI**

**President**

**ELIZABETH SALVESON**

**Vice President**

**F.X. CROWLEY**

**VITUS LEUNG**

**JACQUELINE MINOR**

**SANDRA ENG**

**Executive Officer**

***PUBLIC NOTICE:***

*The Commission will hold its holiday luncheon on Monday, December 16, 2024, at 11:30 a.m. at Doppio Zero (located at 395 Hayes Street). No Commission business will be discussed or actions taken. Members of the public may attend solely to hear and observe the luncheon.*

**CALL TO ORDER**

2:02 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

President Kate Favetti	Present
Vice President Elizabeth Salveson	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Vitus Leung	Present
Commissioner Jacqueline P. Minor	Present

President Kate Favetti presided.

**REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION  
OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON  
TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No. 2)**

Naj Daniels, SEIU Local 1021, offered comment at the year-end meeting to share respect and gratitude to the work of the Commission, its mission and its goals on behalf of the SEIU workforce, she is looking forward to the work before us in 2025. Airon Huang, 2736 Porter at Laguna Honda Hospital filed a written statement. Complaint - the employee is sixth on the eligible list and feels the hiring process is discriminatory, employee rejected based on interview skills due to language barrier.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)**

Regular Meeting of December 2, 2024 – 2:00 p.m.

**Action:** Adopted the Minutes. (vote of 5 to 0)

**ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)**

Items severed from the Ratification Agenda: PSC # DHRPSC0002633 v 1.01 from the Department of Public Health.

President Kate Favetti, announced that items #9 and #10 Proposed Amendments to Rules Volumes I and IV will be heard together.

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No. 5)**

Carol Isen, Human Resources Director expressed gratitude to the Commission for the cooperative working relationship that we've worked hard to build this year. We've accomplished a lot, looking forward to working together in the year 2025 and our continued work together. Acknowledged the Commission for the support offered to the Director and the Department of Human Resources.

**EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S REPORT (Item No. 6)**

Sandra Eng, Executive Officer, reported that the CSC continues with the training in the hearing room, training has been valuable, managers getting to know commissioners and much more comfortable presenting before the commission; with some managers retiring and new managers are coming in more and more departments are requesting in-person training. Looking forward to continuing training in the new year.

**0341-24-8      Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts.  
(Item No. 7)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004744 v 0.01	City Administrator	\$252,744	<p>The goal of this project is to develop a planning guidance document for local policymakers and building owners that addresses end-to-end financing strategies for earthquake risk reduction through the City and County's Concrete Building Safety Program, a proposed retrofit program (pending introduction and adoption of an ordinance). There are two primary objectives for developing a Financing Strategies Guidance Document for the Concrete Building Safety Program:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Increase building owners' understanding of available financing options, especially for those who haven't previously undertaken a major capital improvement project.</li> <li>2. Inform City policy makers of policy interventions and other programmatic actions complementary to a retrofit ordinance (e.g., special tax district, development incentives, loan loss reserve fund) that would increase access to capital and make retrofits more financially feasible for building owners.</li> </ol> <p>The scope includes four workstreams:            Workstream #1: Risk and Economic Benefits Analysis            Workstream #2: Existing Financing Strategies            Workstream #3: Policy Analysis            Workstream #4: Guidance Document            Completion of this scope requires specialized expertise in economics and structural engineering.</p>	New	24 months
DHRPSC 0004914 v 0.01	Public Health	\$444,444	<p>Contractor will provide qualified medical physicists to support the Department of Public Health (DPH) by performing maintenance, regulatory acceptance testing, calibration, safety surveys, and general support for radiology equipment. These services include developing quality control programs in all departments within the hospitals, conducting status reports on all radiology equipment, maintaining current knowledge of radiology regulations, and offering as-needed radiology consulting services. Work will be performed across various DPH locations, including Zuckerberg San Francisco General Hospital, Laguna Honda Hospital, and other sites, with a requirement to respond within three hours for emergency testing on equipment as needed.</p>	New	60 months

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004602 v 0.01	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$928,372	The Embarcadero Connectivity Plan will support the development of alternatives for both the Embarcadero corridor and critical elements of the transportation system in adjacent neighborhoods to ensure resiliency and connectivity for all major transportation modes and associated infrastructure. The plan will also aim to align resilience, mobility and economic recovery work in the Financial District and adjacent neighborhoods. The selected Consultant will assist with the synthesis of existing conditions, public outreach, technical analysis, alternatives development, and the production of an implementation framework and final plan.	New	36 months
DHRPSC 0004886 v 0.01	Municipal Transportation Agency  <i>Withdrawn</i>	\$1,500,000	To provide a mobile on-site facility to collect random, follow-up, reasonable suspicion, and post-accident breath and urine collection in compliance with Department of Transportation/Federal Transit Administration (DOT/FTA) Drug and Alcohol Testing Regulations.	New	60 months
DHRPSC 0004637 v 0.01	Public Utilities Commission	\$600,000	The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC) seeks to retain the services of two qualified Service Providers to provide as needed regional construction contractor certification, compliance; and support services for the Small Business Advisory Firm Committee to increase participation of small and micro construction, disadvantaged business enterprises, construction management, and related work professional service firms to support the work of the Hetch Hetchy Water Capital Plan, Water Capital Plan, which includes the Regional Water System(East Bay, Peninsula/West Bay) projects. Service providers would schedule and conduct site visits, and promote contracting opportunities for San Francisco Public Utilities Commission Local Business Enterprises (PUC-LBEs), located within the SFPUC regional water service area (from the Bay Area Peninsula to Yosemite), and provide as needed technical support, and administrative assistance for the ongoing efforts to reestablish the Small Firm Advisory Committee as required by San Francisco Chapter 14B Section (B).	New	48 months
DHRPSC 0001577 v 1.02	City Administrator	Current Approved Amount \$12,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$2,680,000 New Total Amount Requested \$14,680,000	The contractor will provide moving services for City and County of San Francisco departments on an intermittent, as-needed basis. These services will include, but not be limited to, moving items such as office furniture, documents, equipment, and related articles; the set-up and breakdown of cubicle walls and furniture; and move coordination/project management and planning, as may be required by departments.	Amendment	Increase months 0 Total months 84
DHRPSC 0002633 v 1.01	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$17,100,000 Increase Amount Requested \$1,903,000 New Total Amount Requested \$19,003,000	To provide security services to ensure the safety, security and welfare of patients/residents, visitors, vendors and staff at the San Francisco General Hospital (SFGH) and Laguna Honda Hospital (LHH), unarmed security guards will be assigned to fixed-position locations providing access control by screening people entering the facilities using visual inspection, as indicated. Unarmed security guards will also provide designated-route patrols of both interior and exterior locations. In addition, unarmed security guards will respond to incidents involving disturbances, violence and/or other needs to preserve order, including compliance with regulation pertaining to visitors, resident/patients, vendors, and the facility's premises. Contractor will provide regular written Daily Activity Reports and Incident Reports within Department designated turn-around times.	Amendment	Increase months 0 Total months 35

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004180 v 1.01	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$2,500,000 Increase Amount Requested \$1,325,000 New Total Amount Requested \$3,825,000	To provide as-needed and after-hours security guard services, and as-needed guard/driver services for the San Francisco Health Network for the Department's Opioid Treatment Outpatient Program (OTOP) clinics and vans in support of the Mobile Methadone Dispensing program, which operates at remote locations within the City. The contractor will also provide armed security guards for two primary care clinics located at Zuckerberg San Francisco General Hospital (ZSFGH) and at the Silver Avenue Family Health Center Clinic. Services will include armed and unarmed guards.	Amendment	Increase months 4 Total months 88

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004645 v 1.01	Human Resources	Current Approved Amount \$100,000 Increase Amount Requested \$1,100,000 New Total Amount Requested \$1,200,000	<p>The Department of Human Resources, Workers' Compensation Division, in partnership with the San Francisco Police Officers Association (SFPOA) and San Francisco Firefighters Association, Local 798 (Local 798), implemented an Alternative Dispute Resolution program (ADR) on 7/1/2019. The Agreement is intended to perform services as initiated in 2019. The service objective is to improve labor-management relations between the City and SFPOA/SFFA, and to provide an alternative dispute resolution process to the California state statutory system for claims by current and former (including retired) represented City employees in both bargaining units who have experienced or may experience an industrial illness or injury ("Covered Employees"). The Agreements were approved between the City, SFPOA, and Local 798, on December 17, 2018, and again on January 18, 2024. The authorizing resolutions on files 190051 (Local 798) and 190052 (SFPOA) were approved by the Board of Supervisors on 2/26/2019, and the Mayor on 3/8/2019.</p> <p>The Agreements made authorize the Joint Labor Management Committee, a body of SFPOA/Local 798 and Management representatives, to appoint an Ombudsperson to support employee interests in the ADR program. The Ombudsperson and his/her roles are defined in the resolutions as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* There shall be an Ombudsperson who shall provide aid and counsel for all Applicants.</li> <li>* The Ombudsperson shall be an individual with significant expertise and experience in the field of California workers' compensation.</li> <li>* The City will notify the Ombudsperson of all claims subject to this Agreement and will provide all records to the Ombudsperson electronically via secure email. The City will continue to provide all records to the Ombudsperson via secure email through the resolution of the claim or the end of the ADR Program.</li> <li>* Communications between the Ombudsperson and the Applicant, or the Ombudsperson and the City, are inadmissible in any proceeding.</li> </ul> <p>The duties of the Ombudsperson include:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Making a good faith effort to contact an Applicant in a timely manner, typically within one (1) business and in no event later than two (2) business days of notification.</li> <li>2. Receiving all documents filed with the ADR Program and assigning case numbers to each claim filed, as well as keeping an electronic claims file containing all documents related to the claim.</li> <li>3. Exercising independent discretion in fulfilling the responsibilities required under this Agreement on a case-by-case basis, and maintaining the confidentiality of communications from the Applicant or City; however, with approval from the Applicant or City, respectively, the Ombudsperson may disclose information or communications in order to further the Ombudsperson's duties and responsibilities under this Agreement.</li> <li>4. Seeking to resolve workers' compensation disputes between the Applicant and the City.</li> <li>5. Negotiating settlements between the Applicant and the City where appropriate, considering the interests of the City and the Applicant in doing so.</li> <li>6. Providing information to the DHR Workers' Compensation Director in the Ombudsperson's judgement and discretion for the purposes of enhancing communication consistent with this Agreement and resolving individual claims.</li> <li>7. Making recommendations to the Joint Committee to ensure that the ADR Program functions consistent with the terms of this Agreement.</li> <li>8. Being proactive and seeking to identify potential disputes, where possible, to ensure that all Applicants receive the compensation to which they are legally entitled.</li> </ol>	Amendment	Increase months 0 Total months 72

**Note:** *New Personal Services Contracts start date may not exceed eighteen (18) months after approval/commission meeting date.*

**Continued (Item No. 7)**

**Speakers:** Reanna Albert and Basil Price from the Department of Public Health spoke on PSC #DHRPSC0002633 v 1.01  
Naj Daniels, SEIU Local 1021 also spoke on PSC #DHRPSC0002633 v 1.01

**Action:**

1. Approved PSC #DHRPSC0002633 v 1.01 from the Department of Public Health. (Vote of 5 to 0)
2. Adopted the report. Approved the requests for the remaining proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0342-24-8      Review of Personal Services Contract Number DHRPSC0004878 from the Department of Public Health – Omit Posting. (Item No. 8)**

**Speakers:** Reanna Albert, Department of Public Health  
Aline Armstrong, Department of Public Health

**Action:** Adopted the report. Approved the request for proposed Personal Service Contract Number DHRPSC0004878; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0339-24-5      Proposed Amendments to Civil Service Commission Rules: 102 Definitions; 111 Examinations; 112 Eligible Lists; and 113 Certification of Eligibles to Implement the Pilot Program to Enhance Employment Opportunities for City Employees. (Item No. 9)**

**Speakers:** Lisa Pigula, Department of Human Resources  
Carol Isen, Department of Human Resources  
Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** The Civil Service Commission adopted the Executive Officer and the Human Resources Director staff report and incorporates line item changes to 111.18 and 111.39 to post the proposed revisions overall to Civil Service Commission Rules 102 Definitions, 111 Examinations, 112 Eligible Lists and 113 Certification of Eligibles in accordance with the Charter and Civil Service Rules for adoption following any necessary meet and confer or discuss with the Department of Human Resources Employee Relations Division, Commission Staff, and affected labor unions.

Line-item changes - The name of the rule would be term of rule (then the # of the rule) Enhancing Employment Opportunities for City Employees (EEOCE) Pilot Program. Instead of saying sunset and termination it would read “term of” and for the body of the rule the phrase, “sunset upon the expiration of the collective bargaining agreement ending on June 30, 2027” would be deleted (that phrase) and instead it would read that the rule shall terminate on June 30, 2027, absent action (remainder of the proposed rule would remain the same). The Human

Resources Director and the Municipal Transportation Agency Director shall report to the Civil Service Commission on the EEOCE Pilot Program six (6) months following the adoption by the Civil Service Commission and annually thereafter. The six-month report will be a progress report and incorporated as part of the annual reports, measures of key components (including the number of eligible lists, the number of selections) success of the program; the comprehensive annual report shall be complete with significant markers measuring the success of the program. In the second year, a comprehensive report will be due at the Civil Service Commission Meeting in May or the first meeting in June 2027 prior to the potential decision to extend the program or to make it permanent. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0340-24-5      Proposed Amendments to Civil Service Commission Rules: 402 Definitions; 411 Examinations; 412 Eligible Lists; and 413 Certification of Eligibles to Implement the Pilot Program to Enhance Employment Opportunities for City Employees. (Item No. 10)**

**Speakers:** William Miles II, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** The Civil Service Commission adopted the Executive Officer and the Municipal Transportation Agency Director staff report and incorporates line item changes to 411.18 and 411.40 to post the proposed revisions overall to Civil Service Commission Rules 402 Definitions, 411 Examinations, 412 Eligible Lists and 413 Certification of Eligibles in accordance with the Charter and Civil Service Rules for adoption following any necessary meet and confer or discuss with the Department of Human Resources Employee Relations Division, Commission Staff, and affected labor unions.

Line-item changes - The name of the rule would be term of rule (then the # of the rule) Enhancing Employment Opportunities for City Employees (EEOCE) Pilot Program. Instead of saying sunset and termination it would read “term of” and for the body of the rule the phrase, “sunset upon the expiration of the collective bargaining agreement ending on June 30, 2027” would be deleted (that phrase) and instead it would read that the rule shall terminate on June 30, 2027, absent action (remainder of the proposed rule would remain the same). The Human Resources Director and the Municipal Transportation Agency Director shall report to the Civil Service Commission on the EEOCE Pilot Program six (6) months following the adoption by the Civil Service Commission and annually thereafter. The six-month report will be a progress report and incorporated as part of the annual reports, measures of key components (including the number of eligible lists, the number of selections) success of the program; the comprehensive annual report shall be complete with significant markers measuring the success of the program. In the second year, a comprehensive report will be due at the Civil Service Commission Meeting in May or the first meeting in June 2027 prior to the potential decision to extend the program or to make it permanent. (Vote of 5 to 0)



**Public Comment:** Nicole Christian, MTA employee and SEIU Local 1021  
Kristin Hardy, President, SEIU Local 1021  
Brittany Hewett, SEIU Nurses Local 1021  
Carlos Gabriel, SEIU Local 1021 – LHH  
Jamie Lee, SEIU Local 1021  
Oumar Fall, SEIU Local 1021  
Brenda Barros, ZSFGH  
Pamela Karkazis, ZSFGH

**Public Comment on all matters pertaining to Items 13, 14, 15, and 16 including public comment on whether to hold Items 13, 14, 15, and 16 in closed session. (Item No. 11)**

Brenda Barros, ZSFGH

**Vote on whether to hold Items 13, 14, 15, and 16 in closed session. (Item No. 12)**

The Commission voted to go into Closed Session for items 13, 14, 15, and 16.  
(Vote of 5 to 0)

**0149-24-6 Appeal by Michael Lane of the Transportation Director's determination that by a preponderance of the evidence that there is insufficient evidence to establish findings of violations of the SFMTA's EEO Policy. (Item No. 13)**

**October 21, 2024:** Postponed to the meeting of December 16, 2024, at the request of the Appellant.

**Closed Session for this item started at 3:47 p.m. and the following were present:**

President Kate Favetti, Civil Service Commission  
Vice President Elizabeth Salveson, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner F.X. Crowley, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner Vitus Leung, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner Jacqueline P. Minor, Civil Service Commission  
Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission  
Kate Kimberlin, Office of the City Attorney  
Jennifer Burke, Department of Human Resources  
Amalia Martinez, Department of Human Resources  
MJ Johnson, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Michael Lane, Appellant  
Shamika Gordon, Civil Service Commission  
Lizzette Henríquez, Civil Service Commission

**Closed Session for this item ended at 5:20 p.m.**

**Speakers:** MJ Johnson, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Jennifer Burke, Department of Human Resources  
Michael Lane, Appellant  
Teresa Scism, Respondent

**Action:** The Civil Service Commission adopted the report and denied the appeal by Michael Lane and 1) communicated to the appellant the tremendous amount of courage he had to move forward with his complaint, his actions brought about positive changes at the Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA) benefitting both current and future employees, and the public. 2) Thanked the Department for their thorough report and for following up on the actions taken at the last commission meeting for the development of a consistent policy that addresses the employee and public safety and at the same time protecting employees' rights and taking the necessary corrective action. 3) Requesting a copy Preventing Workplace Violence Policy when completed, 4) suggest to MTA that they communicate to the appellant the avenues to take to report retaliation and, 5) recommend to the MTA to reach out to the appellant to determine whether all of the benefits to which he was entitled during his leave were given. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0132-24-6 Appeal by Chadwick LeDoux of Human Resources Director's determination that the Port of San Francisco did not violate the City's EEO Policy in denying Appellant's request for a religious accommodation that would exempt Appellant from the City's Vaccination Policy. (Item No. 14)**

**November 18, 2024:** Postponed to the meeting of December 16, 2024.

**Closed Session for this item started at 5:22 p.m. and the following were present:**

President Kate Favetti, Civil Service Commission  
Vice President Elizabeth Salveson, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner F.X. Crowley, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner Vitus Leung, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner Jacqueline P. Minor, Civil Service Commission  
Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission  
Kate Kimberlin, Office of the City Attorney  
Marvin Dunson III, Department of Human Resources  
Amalia Martinez, Department of Human Resources  
Jennifer Burke, Department of Human Resources  
Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources  
Janie White, Department of Human Resources  
Tish McNorton, Port  
Tim Felton, Port  
Chadwick J. LeDoux, Appellant  
Shamika Gordon, Civil Service Commission  
Lizzette Henríquez, Civil Service Commission

**Closed Session for this item ended at 5:31 p.m.**

**Speakers:** Marvin Dunson III, Department of Human Resources  
Chadwick J. LeDoux, Appellant

**Action:** Adopted the report, upheld the decision of the Human Resources Director, and denied the appeal by Chadwick LeDoux. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0041-24-7 Request for a Hearing by Adolfo Padilla Rios with the Public Utilities Commission on Their Future Employment Restrictions with the City and County of San Francisco. (Item No. 15)**

**Closed Session for this item started at 6:20 p.m. and the following were present:**

President Kate Favetti, Civil Service Commission  
Vice President Elizabeth Salveson, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner F.X. Crowley, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner Vitus Leung, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner Jacqueline P. Minor, Civil Service Commission  
Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission  
Kate Kimberlin, Office of the City Attorney  
Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources  
Giano Bito, Department of Human Resources  
Joy Chen, Public Utilities Commission  
Adolfo Padilla, Appellant  
Shamika Gordon, Civil Service Commission  
Lizzette Henríquez, Civil Service Commission

**Closed Session for this item ended at 7:04 p.m.**

**Speakers:** Joy Chen, Public Utilities Commission  
Adolfo Padilla, Appellant

**Action:** Denied the appeal and adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 1; Commissioner Leung dissented.)

**0052-24-7 Request for a Hearing by Joseph King with the Public Utilities Commission on Their Future Employment Restrictions with the City and County of San Francisco. (Item No. 16)**

**Closed Session for this item started at 7:05 p.m. and the following were present:**

President Kate Favetti, Civil Service Commission  
Vice President Elizabeth Salveson, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner F.X. Crowley, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner Vitus Leung, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner Jacqueline P. Minor, Civil Service Commission  
Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission  
Kate Kimberlin, Office of the City Attorney  
Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources  
Giano Bito, Department of Human Resources

Joy Chen, Public Utilities Commission  
Shamika Gordon, Civil Service Commission  
Lizzette Henríquez, Civil Service Commission

**Closed Session for this item ended at 7:11 p.m.**

**Speakers:** Joy Chen, Public Utilities Commission

**Action:** Denied the appeal and adopted the report. Appellant failed to appear. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**Reconvene in Open Session. Vote to elect whether to disclose any or all discussions on Items 13, 14, 15, and 16 in closed session (S.F. Admin. Code §67.12 (a)). (Item No. 17)**

**Reconvened in Open Session at 7:13 p.m.**

**Action:** The Commission voted not to disclose any discussions in closed session. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 18)**

The Commissioners wished staff Happy Holidays and requested staff to agendize a review of the 2025 required reports.

**ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 19)**

7:14 p.m.