

Additional Vaillancourt Fountain

Public Comments

(Received after 5:00 p.m. 10/07/2025 and as of 12:00 p.m.10/27/2025 via Email sent to ART-info@sfgov.org or Phone Call to 415-252-2266)

-----Original Message-----

From: Racine Christensen <[REDACTED]@me.com>

Sent: Thursday, October 9, 2025 1:18 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for Next SFAC meetings and RPD meeting

Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission:

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

SF Recreation and Parks seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events.

I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request:

- You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- You reject describing internationally renowned art as “a design constraint” to a redevelopment project.
- You grant key international and national stakeholders ample time to attend any SFAC proceedings.

Thank you.

Sent from my iPhone.

-----Original Message-----

From: racheleden <[REDACTED]@aol.com>

Sent: Thursday, October 9, 2025 1:19 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for Next SFAC meetings and RPD meeting

Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission:

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

SF Recreation and Parks seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events.

I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request:

- You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- You reject describing internationally renowned art as “a design constraint” to a redevelopment project.
- You grant key international and national stakeholders ample time to attend any SFAC proceedings.

Thank you,
Rachel

-----Original Message-----

From: [REDACTED]@gmail.com <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Saturday, October 11, 2025 11:20 AM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for SFAC meetings

Dear Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission,

Would you be so good as to include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for the following three meetings:

- (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting,
- (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and
- (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

SF Recreation and Parks seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events.

I very much oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition.

Instead, I would please request:

- You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- You reject describing internationally renowned art as “a design constraint” to a redevelopment project.
- You grant key international and national stakeholders ample time to attend any SFAC proceedings.

My thanks to you,

Hugo Armstrong

From: Xianna Rodriguez <[REDACTED]@mail.ccsf.edu>

Sent: Saturday, October 11, 2025 12:07 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for SFAC meetings

Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission:

Hello, I hope this message finds you well.

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

SF Recreation and Parks seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events.

I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request:

- You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- You reject describing internationally renowned art as “a design constraint” to a redevelopment project.
- You grant key international and national stakeholders ample time to attend any SFAC proceedings.

Thank you.

Sincerely,
Xianna Rodriguez

From: Lana Blackburn <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Saturday, October 11, 2025 9:13 PM

To: Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>

Subject: Preserve Embarcadero Plaza & Vaillancourt Fountain and rightsize the project - IT'S A VALUABLE TIMESTAMP OF THE 70-S

There are many ways to leave this unique artwork as a **timestamp** like so many other remnants of the past spread around the city! Think of Portals of the Past which survived the E&F and being moved to the Golden Gate Park now rekindle the imagination of people who pass by. Vaillancourt Fountains is so much more than an entrance to a Nob Hill residence! Why did the people who lived 100 years ago preserve the survivor of the tragic event and we cannot preserve an established art work of international fame which survived the 1989 earthquake?

Are there other brutalist artwork in the city from the 70-s? Where are the considerations for the diversity of artful expressions and embracing a variety of styles! Another park is nice but so predictable. Why can this fountain not stay where it's now but reinvented or reinterpreted in another way, i.e. with the plants replacing the rushing water? If it is too expensive to maintain, let's do something about it! Move it to another spot, reuse its part for another monumental sculpture (but leave a piece of it where it's now along with the pavement and the steps that bear signs and ticks of thousands of skateboards who learned their moves next to it).

PLEASE SAVE IT!

I urge you to preserve Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain.

Embarcadero Plaza, by renowned landscape architect Lawrence Halprin, is recognized by global experts for its historic significance. Vaillancourt Fountain, by renowned Québécois artist Armand Vaillancourt, is a key piece of San Francisco's urban history and is an internationally recognized Brutalist icon.

I support the stance of Docomomo US/NOCA on this matter and ask that San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department, San Francisco Arts Commission, the Board of Supervisors, and the project team consider:

- Rightsizing the project to better spend \$15-30+ million in public and private funds. This could include a more modest park refresh with a sustainable maintenance plan that would more effectively reflect the needs of residents, businesses, and visitors, and support downtown's economic recovery, while retaining our history and culture.
- Adaptive reuse of the Vaillancourt Fountain in any form, such as a backdrop to the much-discussed central stage.

- Adaptive reuse of Embarcadero Plaza to address accessibility issues while retaining the existing Lawrence Halprin design that is in the spirit of flexible, multi-use, world-renowned Spanish plazas and Italian piazzas.

- The plaza's preexisting world-class status, as demonstrated by the national and international support for retaining the plaza in its current form, such as from the Centre international d'art contemporain de Montréal, the Québec government, The Cultural Landscape Foundation (TCLF), the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS), and the international skateboarding community.

Thank you for recognizing the historical and cultural significance of Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain.

-----Original Message-----

From: Matt Silverman <[REDACTED]@ibelieveinswordfish.com>

Sent: Sunday, October 12, 2025 6:13 AM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for SFAC meetings

Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission:

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

SF Recreation and Parks seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events.

I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request:

- You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- You reject describing internationally renowned art as “a design constraint” to a redevelopment project.
- You grant key international and national stakeholders ample time to attend any SFAC proceedings.

Thank you.

Matt Silverman
Creative Director
Swordfish

415 [REDACTED] (c)

415 [REDACTED] (o)

-----Original Message-----

From: Linda Waterfield <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Monday, October 13, 2025 6:06 AM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Preserve Embarcadero Plaza & Vaillancourt Fountain and rightsize the project

Please say yes to the best sculptures in SF! I urge you to retain and rehabilitate Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain.

Embarcadero Plaza, by renowned landscape architect Lawrence Halprin, is recognized by global experts for its historic significance. Vaillancourt Fountain, by renowned Québécois artist Armand Vaillancourt, is a key piece of San Francisco's urban history and is an internationally recognized Brutalist icon.

I support the stance of Docomomo US/NOCA, the artists, and various other local, national, and international organization on this matter. I ask that San Francisco Recreation and Park Department, San Francisco Arts Commission, the Board of Supervisors, and the project team consider:

- Rightsizing the project to better spend \$15-30+ million in public and private funds. This could include a more modest park refresh with a sustainable maintenance plan that would more effectively reflect the needs of residents, businesses, and visitors, and support downtown's economic recovery, while retaining our history and culture.
- Adaptive reuse of the Vaillancourt Fountain in any form, such as a backdrop to the much-discussed central stage.
- Adaptive reuse of Embarcadero Plaza to address accessibility issues while retaining the existing Lawrence Halprin design that is in the spirit of flexible, multi-use, world-renowned Spanish plazas and Italian piazzas.
- The plaza's preexisting world-class status, as demonstrated by the national and international support for retaining the plaza in its current form, such as from the Centre international d'art contemporain de Montréal (MAC), the Québec government, The Cultural Landscape Foundation (TCLF), the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS), and the international skateboarding community.

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

Thank you for recognizing the established historical and cultural significance of Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain.

-----Original Message-----

From: Arrow Mueller <[REDACTED]@aol.com>

Sent: Monday, October 13, 2025 7:19 AM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment regarding Fountain

Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission:

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

SF Recreation and Parks seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan.

I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request:

The fountain should be re-purposed as a relic in a garden setting. Naive plants and trees should be allowed to grow and surround the fountain. Instead of water, as originally designed, sage and bay should abound. Climbing should be allowed.

Thank you.

Arrow Mueller

From: dsalmon@salmon.org <[REDACTED]@salmon.org>

Sent: Monday, October 13, 2025 8:46 AM

To: ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>

Subject: Vallaincourt Fountain: Lest We Forget

I hope you will not destroy the Vallaincourt Fountain.

The NY Times published an article about it this morning saying Herb Caen called it a 10 on the Richter scale.

Which is precisely correct: it celebrates the destruction of the old Embarcadero Freeway, a high-rise structure that ran along the Embarcadero ruining the view of the Bay. The fountain depicts the collapsed columns and turned them into a representation of the beauty of the event.

The young folk do not remember the freeway, but the historical memory the fountain represents should be continued. A tag on it explaining its relationship to the freeway destruction would help, as would repair of the water part that added beauty.

Save the Vallaincourt Fountain.

David Salmon

ENC: IMAGES





p.s. Your website doesn't really have a way to contact the Arts Commissioners. Please forward this to them.

From: JANET WETTER <[REDACTED]@awetter.com>
Sent: Monday, October 13, 2025 8:55 AM
To: ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>
Subject: The Vaillancourt Fountain

Good Morning,

I fear I missed a deadline for comment, while I was caring for my 95 year old mother-in-law.

I am a native San Franciscan, and remember in horror when the Vaillancourt Fountain was erected in our beautiful city.

I am hugely **IN FAVOR OF ITS REMOVAL** and am additionally dismayed to think our city would consider to afford \$29M to repair it!!!

Respectfully,

Janet Portman Wetter

From: Curtis Cavin <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, October 13, 2025 9:39 AM
To: ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>
Subject: Vaillancourt Fount

With ongoing debate about possible removal of the Vaillancourt Fountain, I dug out this photo I took on the early morning of Oct 18 1989 after the Loma Prieta Earthquake. Difficult to tell by the angle that the flagpole atop the Ferry Building is tilted, but note that the clock stopped at 5:04, the moment the EQ struck. As I walked under the Embarcadero Freeway I stopped next to a team of engineers inspecting the elevated freeway and discussing whether to keep it shut down.

Curtis Cavin
Sebastopol



From: Remik <[REDACTED]@bigosinski.art>
Sent: Monday, October 13, 2025 9:58 AM
To: ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>
Subject: Vaillancourt Fountain

Hello!

I just read about the potential fate of the Vaillancourt Fountain in the New York Times article, “San Francisco Wants to Destroy a 96-Year-Old’s Defining Artwork”, published on October 12, 2025. (<https://www.nytimes.com/2025/10/12/arts/design/vaillancourt-fountain-san-francisco.html>)

Without knowing the specifics of what is proposed to replace the Fountain, I encourage you to try to keep it and, from the looks of the photos, try to repair it. But, sometimes artwork can evolve over time. While I might understand Mr. Vaillancourt’s reluctance to make any changes to his work, a compromise could be reached by keeping the fountain but replacing the “water” with lush planting that looks like wavy water at the base and plant fountains from the concrete tubes. The use of plantings here would essentially both provide a physical barrier for the work, reduce liability but keep the visual narrative largely intact...

If all else fails, and you could find a wealthy benefactor, I’m sure the Vaillancourt Fountain would look great in Florida. For example, I could see it in downtown Jacksonville, and definitely cooler than the “Lerp” that was proposed there recently...

All the Best,
Rem

From: Kim Sykes <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Monday, October 13, 2025 1:43 PM

To: Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>

Subject: Preserve Embarcadero Plaza & Vaillancourt Fountain and right size project

I urge you to preserve Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain.

Embarcadero Plaza, by renowned landscape architect Lawrence Halprin, is recognized by global experts for its historic significance. Vaillancourt Fountain, by renowned Québécois artist Armand Vaillancourt, is a key piece of San Francisco's urban history and is an internationally recognized Brutalist icon.

I support the stance of Docomomo US/NOCA on this matter and ask that San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department take responsibility for making sure that the fountain remains part of the plans for the revitalization of the Embarcadero Plaza and that it remains a treasure for future San Franciscan's historical understanding and enjoyment.

Best wishes, Kim Sykes

-----Original Message-----

From: Roberto Castanon <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Monday, October 13, 2025 4:25 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for SFAC meetings

Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission:

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

SF Recreation and Parks seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events.

I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request:

- You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- You reject describing internationally renowned art as “a design constraint” to a redevelopment project.
- You grant key international and national stakeholders ample time to attend any SFAC proceedings.

Thank you.

Sent from my iPhone

-----Original Message-----

From: Harry <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 14, 2025 1:27 AM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for SFAC meetings

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission:

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

SF Recreation and Parks seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events.

I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request:

- You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- You reject describing internationally renowned art as “a design constraint” to a redevelopment project.
- You grant key international and national stakeholders ample time to attend any SFAC proceedings.

Thank you.

From: Haley Pratt <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 14, 2025 6:22 AM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Preserve Embarcadero Plaza & Vaillancourt Fountain and rightsize the project

I live in North Carolina but visit San Francisco often and have family that lives there. I absolutely love the Vaillancourt fountain. While some have commented that it is run down. I believe that its aging appearance only adds to its already beautiful vintage aesthetic. A city filled only with shiny new things has absolutely no character at all. San Francisco is the most beautiful city I have ever seen because it is unique and filled with history. I can understand if restoring it as working fountain is cost-prohibitive. I think it has plenty of inherent beauty even as a dry sculpture, and that there are ways to preserve it respectfully even if it isn't returned to full working condition. For me it would be an absolute tragedy to tear this down. I hope so much you reconsider and that I can visit this singular work of art for many years to come.

I urge you to retain and rehabilitate Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain.

Embarcadero Plaza, by renowned landscape architect Lawrence Halprin, is recognized by global experts for its historic significance. Vaillancourt Fountain, by renowned Québécois artist Armand Vaillancourt, is a key piece of San Francisco's urban history and is an internationally recognized Brutalist icon.

I support the stance of Docomomo US/NOCA, the artists, and various other local, national, and international organization on this matter. I ask that San Francisco Recreation and Park Department, San Francisco Arts Commission, the Board of Supervisors, and the project team consider:

- Rightsizing the project to better spend \$15-30+ million in public and private funds. This could include a more modest park refresh with a sustainable maintenance plan that would more effectively reflect the needs of residents, businesses, and visitors, and support downtown's economic recovery, while retaining our history and culture.
- Adaptive reuse of the Vaillancourt Fountain in any form, such as a backdrop to the much-discussed central stage.
- Adaptive reuse of Embarcadero Plaza to address accessibility issues while retaining the existing Lawrence Halprin design that is in the spirit of flexible, multi-use, world-renowned Spanish plazas and Italian piazzas.

- The plaza's preexisting world-class status, as demonstrated by the national and international support for retaining the plaza in its current form, such as from the Centre international d'art contemporain de Montréal (MAC), the Québec government, The Cultural Landscape Foundation (TCLF), the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS), and the international skateboarding community.

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

Thank you for recognizing the established historical and cultural significance of Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain.

From: Gary Strang <[REDACTED]@glsarch.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 14, 2025 9:27 AM

To: SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Board of Supervisors (BOS) <board.of.supervisors@sfgov.org>; Lurie, Daniel (MYR) <daniel.lurie@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; Matsuda, Diane (CPC) <diane.matsuda@sfgov.org>; CPC-Commissions Secretary <commissions.secretary@sfgov.org>; Aaron Fenton <afenton@bxp.com>; Robbie Silver <RSilver@downtownsf.org>; info@downtownsf.org

Subject: Support for Vaillancourt Fountain at Embarcadero Plaza

Dear Members of the Board of Supervisors, Mayor Lurie, and Commissioners,

Please see the attached pdf letter expressing support for the reinvigoration of Vaillancourt Fountain as an integral driver of future park improvements, and opposition to its impending demolition.

Thank you for your time and commitment to shaping San Francisco's future.

Gary Strang FASLA | FAIA

Principal

GLS Landscape | Architecture

2677 Mission Street #200

San Francisco, CA 94110

415.285.3614 x 501

415.420.7266 cell

www.glsarch.com

gary@glsarch.com

ENC: PDF

-----Original Message-----

From: robert elias <[REDACTED]@icloud.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 14, 2025 1:55 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for SFAC meetings

Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission:

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

SF Recreation and Parks seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events.

I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request:

- You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- You reject describing internationally renowned art as “a design constraint” to a redevelopment project.
- You grant key international and national stakeholders ample time to attend any SFAC proceedings.

Thank you.

-----Original Message-----

From: robert elias <[REDACTED]@icloud.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 14, 2025 1:55 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Preserve Embarcadero Plaza & Vaillancourt Fountain and rightsize the project

SERIOUSLY!!!! THIS IS another items in our city we trying to remove.. I urge you to retain and rehabilitate Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain.

Embarcadero Plaza, by renowned landscape architect Lawrence Halprin, is recognized by global experts for its historic significance. Vaillancourt Fountain, by renowned Québécois artist Armand Vaillancourt, is a key piece of San Francisco's urban history and is an internationally recognized Brutalist icon.

I support the stance of Docomomo US/NOCA, the artists, and various other local, national, and international organization on this matter. I ask that San Francisco Recreation and Park Department, San Francisco Arts Commission, the Board of Supervisors, and the project team consider:

- Rightsizing the project to better spend \$15-30+ million in public and private funds. This could include a more modest park refresh with a sustainable maintenance plan that would more effectively reflect the needs of residents, businesses, and visitors, and support downtown's economic recovery, while retaining our history and culture.
- Adaptive reuse of the Vaillancourt Fountain in any form, such as a backdrop to the much-discussed central stage.
- Adaptive reuse of Embarcadero Plaza to address accessibility issues while retaining the existing Lawrence Halprin design that is in the spirit of flexible, multi-use, world-renowned Spanish plazas and Italian piazzas.
- The plaza's preexisting world-class status, as demonstrated by the national and international support for retaining the plaza in its current form, such as from the Centre international d'art contemporain de Montréal (MAC), the Québec government, The Cultural Landscape Foundation (TCLF), the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS), and the international skateboarding community.

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

Thank you for recognizing the established historical and cultural significance of Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain.

From: Deborah McBride <[REDACTED]@samuelmerritt.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, October 14, 2025 6:51 PM
To: ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>
Subject: Please remove ugly fountain

Dear Sirs

Please remove the ugly fountain by the ferry building. It is indescribably ugly and broke. I am sure a new plan for the park without the fountain will improve the park's functionality and encourage people to come to the park

Thank you

Debbie McBride

Get [Outlook for iOS](#)

SMU - Internal Data

From: Johan Carlisle <[REDACTED]@igc.org>

Sent: Wednesday, October 15, 2025 3:28 PM

To: ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>

Subject: "San Francisco Wants to Destroy a 96-Year-Old's Defining Artwork"

To Whom It May Concern,

RE: "San Francisco Wants to Destroy a 96-Year-Old's Defining Artwork"

<https://www.nytimes.com/2025/10/12/arts/design/vaillancourt-fountain-san-francisco.html>

I hope you will not destroy one of my favorite public artworks.

When I first moved to San Francisco in 1971, the Vaillancourt Fountain impressed me and immediately made me feel like San Francisco was a place where I, being a creative person, could comfortably live.

Is there anything we, the people, can do to help protect this amazing work of art?

Sincerely,

Johan Carlisle

watershedthinking.com

-----Original Message-----

From: Don Lucchesi <[REDACTED]@comcast.net>

Sent: Wednesday, October 15, 2025 3:36 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Preserve Embarcadero Plaza & Vaillancourt Fountain and rightsize the project

As a lifelong San Francisco resident, I understand the controversy and negative opinions this fountain has generated. But it is an important part of our past and it should be preserved. Perhaps not in its present location, but it certainly could find a home in some of the eastern shore developments off Third St. Please consider saving what is an important part of 1970's SF architecture by not demolishing the fountain but simply moving it to another location.

Embarcadero Plaza, by renowned landscape architect Lawrence Halprin, is recognized by global experts for its historic significance. Vaillancourt Fountain, by renowned Québécois artist Armand Vaillancourt, is a key piece of San Francisco's urban history and is an internationally recognized Brutalist icon.

I support the stance of Docomomo US/NOCA, the artists, and various other local, national, and international organization on this matter. I ask that San Francisco Recreation and Park Department, San Francisco Arts Commission, the Board of Supervisors, and the project team consider:

- Rightsizing the project to better spend \$15-30+ million in public and private funds. This could include a more modest park refresh with a sustainable maintenance plan that would more effectively reflect the needs of residents, businesses, and visitors, and support downtown's economic recovery, while retaining our history and culture.
- Adaptive reuse of the Vaillancourt Fountain in any form, such as a backdrop to the much-discussed central stage.
- Adaptive reuse of Embarcadero Plaza to address accessibility issues while retaining the existing Lawrence Halprin design that is in the spirit of flexible, multi-use, world-renowned Spanish plazas and Italian piazzas.
- The plaza's preexisting world-class status, as demonstrated by the national and international support for retaining the plaza in its current form, such as from the Centre international d'art contemporain de Montréal (MAC), the Québec government, The Cultural Landscape Foundation (TCLF), the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS), and the international skateboarding community.

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

Thank you for recognizing the established historical and cultural significance of Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain.

My iPhone says hi.

From: Yury Bekerman <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Wednesday, October 15, 2025 6:39 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for SFAC meetings

The fountain is hideous and in disrepair. Tear it down. It's completely idiotic that I received a sponsored post about this on ig, urging me to send a message requesting the opposite. Thank you.

Yury Bekerman

-----Original Message-----

From: Jason Minton <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Thursday, October 16, 2025 12:17 AM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: My Public Comment for SFAC meetings

Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission:

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

Simple language here: I like the fountain. I've always liked the fountain since I was a little kid coming over from Oakland. So many things made S.F. feel special, and the fountain was, is, and should always be one of those special places alive in S.F.

Keep the fountain.

Thank you.

From: Alicia Marie Smith <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Thursday, October 16, 2025 8:21 AM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for SFAC meetings

Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission: Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message. SF Recreation and Parks seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan. The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events. I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request:

- You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- You reject describing internationally renowned art as “a design constraint” to a redevelopment project.
- You grant key international and national stakeholders ample time to attend any SFAC proceedings.

Thank you.

From: Ale Bandala <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Thursday, October 16, 2025 8:30 AM

To: Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>

Subject: Preserve Embarcadero Plaza & Vaillancourt Fountain and rightsize the project

I urge you to please preserve Embarcadero Plaza and most importantly, Vaillancourt Fountain!

Embarcadero Plaza, by renowned landscape architect Lawrence Halprin, is recognized by global experts for its historic significance. Vaillancourt Fountain, by renowned Québécois artist Armand Vaillancourt, is a key piece of San Francisco's urban history and is an internationally recognized Brutalist icon.

I support the stance of Docomomo US/NOCA on this matter and ask that San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department, San Francisco Arts Commission, the Board of Supervisors, and the project team consider:

- Rightsizing the project to better spend \$15-30+ million in public and private funds. This could include a more modest park refresh with a sustainable maintenance plan that would more effectively reflect the needs of residents, businesses, and visitors, and support downtown's economic recovery, while retaining our history and culture.
- Adaptive reuse of the Vaillancourt Fountain in any form, such as a backdrop to the much-discussed central stage.
- Adaptive reuse of Embarcadero Plaza to address accessibility issues while retaining the existing Lawrence Halprin design that is in the spirit of flexible, multi-use, world-renowned Spanish plazas and Italian piazzas.
- The plaza's preexisting world-class status, as demonstrated by the national and international support for retaining the plaza in its current form, such as from the Centre international d'art contemporain de Montréal, the Québec government, The Cultural Landscape Foundation (TCLF), the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS), and the international skateboarding community.

Thank you for recognizing the historical and cultural significance of Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain.

- Alejandra Bandala

From: David <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, October 17, 2025 2:08 PM
To: ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Te, Coma (ART) <coma.te@sfgov.org>; ART-Monuments-Memorials, SFAC <monumentsandmemorials@sfgov.org>; RPDInfo, RPD (REC) <rpinfo@sfgov.org>; Communications, RPD (REC) <rpdccommunications@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Kern, Dennis (REC) <dennis.kern@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>
Cc: info@ebparks.org; mediainquiries@ebparks.org; GovAffairs@ebparks.org; slandreth@ebparks.org; ybarial@ebparks.org
Subject: Proposal to Relocate and Reimagine the Vaillancourt Fountain in Oakland

Dear San Francisco Arts Commission, et al:

I am writing to suggest an alternative to the demolition of the Vaillancourt Fountain. Rather than destroying this historic and controversial work, San Francisco could donate the sculpture to the City of Oakland — where it could be reimaged as part of our region's shared industrial and artistic heritage.

My proposal is to relocate the fountain to the Judge John Sutter Regional Shoreline, near the Oakland side of the Bay Bridge. This site offers both symbolic and practical benefits:

- It directly connects to the Bay Area's industrial past, echoing the materials and labor that built our ports and bridges.
- It would become a distinctive landmark and tourist attraction, drawing visitors to Oakland's growing waterfront park system.
- The new setting could reinterpret the piece as a tribute to resilience and reinvention, values deeply tied to both Oakland's history and its future.

This relocation would preserve the fountain as an important example of mid-century public art, while giving it renewed meaning and a second life in a city that embodies the industrial spirit it reflects.

I hope the City of San Francisco might consider this collaborative solution — one that honors the artist, preserves regional art history, and strengthens cultural ties between our two cities.

Cheers,
David R. Geißler
~d
[REDACTED]@yahoo.com

“Expectation is the grandfather of disappointment.
The world can never own a man who wants nothing!”

From: Lynn Befera <[REDACTED]@mac.com>
Sent: Friday, October 17, 2025 7:26 PM
To: charlescollins1@sfgov.org
Cc: ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; daniel.lurie@sfgov.com; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>
Subject: tearing down the Vaillancourt Fountain

Dear President Collins, Director Remington, Mayor Lurie, and Supervisor Sauter:

I have been a San Francisco resident for the past 50 years, graduated from San Francisco State University in 1982, and now live in the second Noe Valley Victorian my husband and I renovated. I am a retired clinical psychologist and my husband has been a general contractor for the past 40 years. He employs many subcontractors and artisans, designs/builds solar systems, focusing on maintenance/new construction in San Francisco Bay Area commercial and private properties. We grew up in nearby Palo Alto and Millbrae, love and support this city, and plan to live out the rest of our lives here.

I have to agree with architecture critic's Allan Temko's description of the Vaillancourt Fountain as "technological excrescences...deposited by a giant concrete dog with square intestines." Art critic Alfred Frankenstein declared it was "not a great work of sculpture," while architecture critic John King called it "an act of defiant distraction." It is completely out of synch with the soaring San Francisco architectural masterpieces of Maybeck, Morgan, Pfleuger, Brown, and Polk. Further, the fountain has never looked finished, due to the intentionally rough, scabby external texture. It should have been demolished when the Embarcadero Freeway was torn down after the '89 earthquake.

Apart from its aesthetic violence, it uses tremendous amounts of water and energy, which were turned off, respectively, during the drought and energy crises, and will need at least \$29 million to resurrect it, money San Francisco absolutely does **not** have. The fountain requires regular maintenance and is probably an attractive nuisance and liability in its present state.

Ruth Asawa, one of the only remaining artists on the 1966 Arts Commission, rejected Vaillancourt's design, which should have given the other members some pause. Architect Lawrence Halprin didn't live long enough to "slit [his] throat," as he threatened when the fountain didn't prove to be among the "great works of civic art." The original model Vaillancourt submitted, and the one the Committee chose, wasn't even the design he ended up using, which should have been a red flag.

I can think of many places the \$29 million it would take to reanimate this monstrosity could go. There's always social services, all the mythical beds that never seem to materialize for people detoxing from addiction or having a mental illness crisis. There's decent

halfway/support housing for people in recovery or who are unable to live without social service support. There's the foster care system, chronically understaffed and unable to help the hundreds—or thousands, depending on the best estimate—of children abandoned or abused by their parents. There's the SF school system, paying teachers a living wage, or just doing the deferred maintenance of the buildings. There's affordable housing for our teachers, firefighters, nurses, and social workers so they aren't forced to commute for hours or finally leave for more affordable cities and states.

I'm sure there are many more places this money could go. But **not one more penny**, with the exception of the costs to dismantle it, which the City also does not have, should go towards this fountain. Armand Vaillancourt, a Canadian who seems tone deaf (or blind, perhaps) regarding San Francisco aesthetics, apparently--and wrongly--believes his creation should live forever. But he no longer owns it—the city of San Francisco does. No public work of art should be intended for indefinite display.

Unless Vaillancourt is willing to contribute his own money to maintain or move it, however, he has no legal standing, nor does he deserve a vote. At most, he gets one, and our citizens, forced to endure his bizarre experiment in sculpture all these years, should get the rest. Brutalist architecture generally has become dated, is rarely maintained or restored, and, frankly, appears brutish.

For all its many benefits: its natural beauty, tolerance, and amazing culinary choices, urban life can sometimes be difficult, cruel, and disheartening. Our city is presently under siege from a monomaniacal, vengeful despot gearing up to declare martial law, with the excuse that all of its residents are “insurgents.” In light of this, I am entreating you not to continue visiting this aesthetic violence upon us in the name of “public art,” too often perpetrated upon citizens who were never given a choice or even consulted. Rather, we are, especially now, in great need of uplift, moral support, and reminders of the better angels of our nature.

I wish the Arts Committee had listened to Ruth Asawa, who, like the little boy who spoke up on sighting the benighted, naked despot, stated she wasn't "willing to remain silent while we play the old game of the emperor's new clothes on the unsuspecting people of this city." I think it's time to rid our fair city of this "technological excrescence.”

Yours,
Lynn Befera, Psy.D
Clinical Psychologist

From: Noe Woolfolk <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Friday, October 17, 2025 10:31 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for SFAC meetings

Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission: Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message. SF Recreation and Parks seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan. The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events. I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request:

- You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- You reject describing internationally renowned art as “a design constraint” to a redevelopment project.
- You grant key international and national stakeholders ample time to attend any SFAC proceedings.

Thank you.

From: Noe Woolfolk <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Friday, October 17, 2025 10:31 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Preserve Embarcadero Plaza & Vaillancourt Fountain and rightsize the project

I urge you to retain and rehabilitate Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain. Embarcadero Plaza, by renowned landscape architect Lawrence Halprin, is recognized by global experts for its historic significance. Vaillancourt Fountain, by renowned Québécois artist Armand Vaillancourt, is a key piece of San Francisco's urban history and is an internationally recognized Brutalist icon. I support the stance of Docomomo US/NOCA, the artists, and various other local, national, and international organization on this matter. I ask that San Francisco Recreation and Park Department, San Francisco Arts Commission, the Board of Supervisors, and the project team consider:

- Rightsizing the project to better spend \$15-30+ million in public and private funds. This could include a more modest park refresh with a sustainable maintenance plan that would more effectively reflect the needs of residents, businesses, and visitors, and support downtown's economic recovery, while retaining our history and culture.
- Adaptive reuse of the Vaillancourt Fountain in any form, such as a backdrop to the much-discussed central stage.
- Adaptive reuse of Embarcadero Plaza to address accessibility issues while retaining the existing Lawrence Halprin design that is in the spirit of flexible, multi-use, world-renowned Spanish plazas and Italian piazzas.
- The plaza's preexisting world-class status, as demonstrated by the national and international support for retaining the plaza in its current form, such as from the Centre international d'art contemporain de Montréal (MAC), the Québec government, The Cultural Landscape Foundation (TCLF), the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS), and the international skateboarding community.

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message. Thank you for recognizing the established historical and cultural significance of Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain.

From: Julie Goodenough <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Friday, October 17, 2025 11:06 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for SFAC meetings

Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission:

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

SF Recreation and Parks seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events.

I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request:

- You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- You reject describing internationally renowned art as “a design constraint” to a redevelopment project.
- You grant key international and national stakeholders ample time to attend any SFAC proceedings.

I'm a native San Franciscan. I first encountered the fountain when I was a teenager. It was love at first sight. That you could walk through it and climb ladders to the top was mind blowing to me. Up to that point I'd only seen fountains that were strictly off limits for that sort of thing. Why would an art living city like San Francisco even consider removing this iconic work of art is beyond me. Yes, restoration will be difficult and expensive, but if an effort is made I'm sure it can be done. Maybe u2 can do a concert to raise funds and Bono can spray paint graffiti again. I've included one of my favorite photos of my daughter. She's walking under the fountain.



Thank you,

Julie Goodenough

-----Original Message-----

From: Sebastian <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Saturday, October 18, 2025 6:49 AM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for SFAC meetings

Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission:

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

SF Recreation and Parks seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events.

Additionally this fountain has a deep personal significance to me. It's a part of San Francisco that I associate with some of my formative years and an integral part of San Francisco's DNA. To tear down the fountain is to turn back time. SF should move forward with its identity in tact. So much of what makes San Francisco beautiful and unique is being erased. Let's not allow this to be another example of short sided planning.

I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request:

- You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- You reject describing internationally renowned art as "a design constraint" to a redevelopment project.
- You grant key international and national stakeholders ample time to attend any SFAC proceedings.

Thank you.

-Sebastian Caceres

From: tabbatha henry <[REDACTED]@tabbathahenry.com>

Sent: Sunday, October 19, 2025 7:31 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for SFAC meetings

Arts Commission and Rec & Park Commission:

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for these three meetings: (1) the next SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting, (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting, and (3) Rec & Park Commission meeting. Reply all when responding to this message.

SF Recreation and Parks seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events.

I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request:

- You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- You reject describing internationally renowned art as “a design constraint” to a redevelopment project.
- You grant key international and national stakeholders ample time to attend any SFAC proceedings.

Thank you.

Tabbatha Henry

From: Dan Silver <[REDACTED]@me.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 21, 2025 9:14 AM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; Lurie, Daniel (MYR) <daniel.lurie@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>

Subject: Vaillancourt Fountain - Don't tear it down

Gentlepersons:

As a frequent tourist, I treasure this glorious fountain. It is an artistic and cultural landmark. You should do independent studies on rehabilitation and take steps like other cities to care for fountains. *Please reject the request by the RPD to deaccession the Vaillancourt Fountain.* San Francisco must remain a city of arts and culture.

Sincerely,

Dan Silver, Los Angeles

From: E M <[REDACTED]@msn.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 21, 2025 9:16 AM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; Lurie, Daniel (MYR) <daniel.lurie@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>

Cc: news@email.tclf.org

Subject: Villaincourt Fountain

Gentlemen and unnamed women who support San Francisco's laudible artistic and cultural heritage.

I write in support of the rehabilitation and preservation of the Vaillancourt Fountain. Not only is it Vaillancourt's only public work in the United States, it has become an iconic contributor to San Francisco's image as a world class progressive cultural hub.

As a real estate and arts attorney in New York, which led the movement to preserve our precious past after the tragic loss of Penn Station and passage of a pioneering Landmarks Preservation Law, I have been an advocate for the rights of artists under VARA and the communities they serve to commemorate for future generations the diverse elevating contributions they make despite the ever present pressure to squeeze more profit or utility out of every site without exploring reasonable alternatives and without regard to the irrevocable harm to our cultural heritage.

Though not protected by VARA, the Vaillancourt Fountain is a unique monumental statement and symbol of an era and San Francisco and should be preserved and cherished regardless of differing aesthetic opinions of its merit and economic assessments of the site's alternatives. Don't be like the Taliban destroying the Buddhas of Bamiyan.

Thanks are due Charles Birnbaum and The Cultural Landscape for their indefatigable efforts to alert the public to the importance and vulnerability of our fragile heritage.

Elliott Meisel, Esq.

[REDACTED]

New York, NY 10024

917 [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]@msn.com

-----Original Message-----

From: kash <[REDACTED]@warmplanetbikes.com>

Sent: Saturday, October 25, 2025 4:59 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Summers, Ashley (REC) <ashley.summers@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Board of Supervisors (BOS) <board.of.supervisors@sfgov.org>
Subject: Save the Vaillancourt Fountain

My kids grew up playing on the fountain. It has a history we need to save.

Demolishing the fountain just because previous administrations willfully neglected it hoping everyone would forget how beautiful it is when the water is running is wrong. Please restore it so I will be able to bring my grandchildren there someday.

-----Original Message-----

From: Jan Markels <[REDACTED]@comcast.net>

Sent: Saturday, October 25, 2025 6:08 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Summers, Ashley (REC) <ashley.summers@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Board of Supervisors (BOS) <board.of.supervisors@sfgov.org>
Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for SFAC and SFRPD meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request

To SF Recreation & Parks, SF Arts Commission, SF Board of Supervisors,

SF Recreation and Park Department seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan. The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events.

I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request that:

- (1) You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- (2) You reject describing internationally renowned art as “a design constraint” to a redevelopment project.
- (3) You conduct an inquiry into the deferred maintenance of the Vaillancourt Fountain and ascertain if gross negligence has occurred.
- (4) You grant stakeholders other than project sponsors—such as the artists or recognized art and preservation organizations—the opportunity to present at SFAC proceedings.

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for the next occurrence of these meetings:

- (1) SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting • (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting • (3) SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting • (4) SF Board of Supervisors

****Recreation & Parks****: Please complete an ****Immediate Disclosure Request**** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment • 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version • MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities • Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)

Thank you.

Sent from my iPad

From: Donald Crabtree <[REDACTED]@gmail.com>

Sent: Saturday, October 25, 2025 6:51 PM

To: Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; Ferras, Suzie (ART) <suzie.ferras@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; Madland, Sarah (REC) <sarah.madland@sfgov.org>; Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Commission, Recpark (REC) <recpark.commission@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Summers, Ashley (REC) <ashley.summers@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>; Board of Supervisors (BOS) <board.of.supervisors@sfgov.org>

Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org

Subject: Public Comment for SFAC and SFRPD meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request

To SF Recreation & Parks, SF Arts Commission, SF Board of Supervisors,

SF Recreation and Park Department seeks Arts Commission approval to deaccession, remove, and demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain, accelerating their blank-slate, urban redevelopment plan. The Vaillancourt Fountain is an international landmark, symbolizing our city's diverse history, our relationship with Canada and Quebec, and countless gatherings and activist events.

I oppose deaccession, removal, or demolition. Instead, I request that:

- (1) You reject this attempt to follow the federal trend of history erasure; retain and rehabilitate this landmark for current and future generations.
- (2) You reject describing internationally renowned art as “a design constraint” to a redevelopment project.
- (3) You conduct an inquiry into the deferred maintenance of the Vaillancourt Fountain and ascertain if gross negligence has occurred.
- (4) You grant stakeholders other than project sponsors—such as the artists or recognized art and preservation organizations—the opportunity to present at SFAC proceedings.

Please include this as a public comment in or adjacent to the agendas for the next occurrence of these meetings:

- (1) SF Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee meeting
- (2) SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting
- (3) SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting
- (4) SF Board of Supervisors

****Recreation & Parks**:** Please complete an ****Immediate Disclosure Request**** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version
- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)

Thank you.

From: Geoff Sears <[REDACTED]@warehamdevelopment.com>
Sent: Sunday, October 26, 2025 9:05 AM
To: Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>
Cc: info@docomomo-noca.org; Geoff Sears <GSears@warehamdevelopment.com>
Subject: Vaillancourt Fountain

I implore you to NOT approve the destruction of Vaillancourt Fountain but rather to prioritize investment in its refurbishment so that it can remain an integral part of the City's history and urban design for many future generations of those who live in and visit our City.

I have lived in San Francisco for over 37 years, having moved here intentionally because of the beauty and richness of the City. My wife and I have raised three grown daughters here, one of whom has now returned to make this her permanent home with her husband.

I am an architect by training and a real estate developer by profession, so have studied and been a part of creating the built environment for my entire career. I have had the good fortune to study and to visit many cities in the US and overseas. I have seen many public places and works of public art. The Vaillancourt Fountain, particularly when fully functioning with the intended running water, is in my mind one of the most place-appropriate and powerful pieces of public art I have seen. It is so rich in the way it simultaneously harkens to such diverse forms: the California mountains and streams, a ghost of former Central Freeway, etc. I have also many, many times gathered with other members of the public in the Embarcadero Plaza for events, running races, treasure hunts and the like. It is a great "piazza" for the City.

I support the stance of Docomomo US/NOCA on this matter and ask that San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department, San Francisco Arts Commission, the Board of Supervisors, and the project team consider:

- Rightsizing the project to better spend \$15-30+ million in public and private funds. This could include a more modest park refresh with a sustainable maintenance plan that would more effectively reflect the needs of residents, businesses, and visitors, and support downtown's economic recovery, while retaining our history and culture.
- Adaptive reuse of the Vaillancourt Fountain in any form, such as a backdrop to the much-discussed central stage. If there is any way to return water to the piece, that would be desirable, but even "dry" it is so meaningful and should be preserved.

Thank you for recognizing the historical and cultural significance of Vaillancourt Fountain.

Geoff Sears

WAREHAM DEVELOPMENT

1120 Nye Street, Suite 400

San Rafael, CA 94901

(415) 457-4964 (Main Office)

(415) 459-4605 (Fax)

@warehamdevelopment.com

P Please consider the environment before printing this email



From: donald ino <[REDACTED]@yahoo.com>

Sent: Sunday, October 26, 2025 1:52 PM

To: Ginsburg, Phil (REC) <phil.ginsburg@sfgov.org>; Goodwin, Eoanna (REC) <eoanna.Goodwin@sfgov.org>; Collins, Charles (ART) <charles.collins1@sfgov.org>; Dhaliwal, Manraj (ART) <manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org>; ART-Info <ART-Info@sfgov.org>; SauterStaff <SauterStaff@sfgov.org>

Subject: Preserve Embarcadero Plaza & Vaillancourt Fountain and rightsize the project

To Whom It May Concern:

I urge you to preserve Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain.

Embarcadero Plaza, by renowned landscape architect Lawrence Halprin, is recognized by global experts for its historic significance. Vaillancourt Fountain, by renowned Québécois artist Armand Vaillancourt, is a key piece of San Francisco's urban history and is an internationally recognized Brutalist icon.

As a native San Franciscan, I, like many other citizens, initially couldn't appreciate the artistry and meaning of the Vaillancourt Fountain when it was first installed.

However, just like Sutro Tower, I've come to recognize the fountain as an integral icon that is truly unique to our city and how without it, San Francisco loses another aspect that makes it so very special. And, as I've matured over the decades, I've come to understand what the artist was trying to convey and how his concept chronicles a discrete segment of the city's history.

The fountain has been decried as unattractive, but the purpose of good art isn't to conform to a reality we want, rather it speaks truth as what is. In doing so, the Vaillancourt Fountain, to me, boldly says that even in brutalism and chaos, one can find life and beauty.

I support the stance of Docomomo US/NOCA on this matter and ask that San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department, San Francisco Arts Commission, the Board of Supervisors, and the project team consider:

- Rightsizing the project to better spend \$15-30+ million in public and private funds. This could include a more modest park refresh with a sustainable maintenance plan that would more effectively reflect the needs of residents, businesses, and visitors, and support downtown's economic recovery, while retaining our history and culture.
- Adaptive reuse of the Vaillancourt Fountain in any form, such as a backdrop to the much-discussed central stage.
- Adaptive reuse of Embarcadero Plaza to address accessibility issues while retaining the existing Lawrence Halprin design that is in the spirit of flexible, multi-use, world-renowned Spanish plazas and Italian piazzas.
- The plaza's preexisting world-class status, as demonstrated by the national and international support for retaining the plaza in its current form, such as from the Centre international d'art contemporain de Montréal, the Québec government, The Cultural Landscape Foundation (TCLF), the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS), and the international skateboarding community.

Thank you for recognizing the historical and cultural significance of Embarcadero Plaza and Vaillancourt Fountain.

Regards,
Don Ino
Richmond District

APPENDIX: Additional Enclosed PDF Attachments

In Support of the Vaillancourt Fountain at Embarcadero Plaza

My name is Gary Strang. I am a Fellow of the AIA as well as the ASLA. I have been practicing in San Francisco with a studio of 10-15 people since the early 1990s, addressing issues exactly like Vaillancourt Fountain that fall between the disciplines of architecture, landscape architecture and urban design. For 15 years, my team worked on the relocation of the Exploratorium to Pier 15, where we were ultimately responsible for the two acres of public and semi-public waterfront outdoor space that has come to be known as the outdoor Exploratorium. I am the Vice Chair of the BCDC (Bay Conservation and Development Commission) Design Review Board where I have served for the last 10 years; these comments do not represent BCDC.

I am writing to express my opinion and deep concern regarding the impending demolition of the Vaillancourt Fountain.

Great cities, the ones we choose to vacation in and to educate our children, are heavily activated by people precisely because they have accumulated many layers of architecture that record and represent significant and meaningful points in history. It would be shortsighted to wipe away this artifact which is an important product of the historic late 1960s era in the Bay Area. It represents a legacy of a unique community of influential designers, of which there were many besides Vaillancourt and Lawrence Halprin of Sea Ranch fame. A family tree of Halprin's office would show that an extraordinary number of architects, landscape architects and urban designers practicing locally and internationally today passed through or were trained by those who passed through Halprin's office at this time. Halprin is responsible for launching the career of San Francisco's own supergraphics inventor, Barbara Stauffacher Solomon, who was a mentor and friend for over 35 years.

The fountain is energetic and audacious in a way that is unlikely to be repeated in San Francisco's foreseeable future. Replacing it with lawn and trees would be a safe and uninteresting downgrade that erases the memory of the energy of San Francisco at that tumultuous and optimistic time, when the Embarcadero Freeway separated the downtown from the water's edge. Halprin was the first landscape architect to embrace cities and infrastructure in his work. He brought the same degree of intelligence to this design as he did to his other celebrated projects. The fountain masked the noise of the adjacent freeway and borrowed the blocky concrete forms of the freeway so that the sculpture would not be lost against the massive elevated structure. In traditional landscape design, this is referred to as "borrowed scenery." Importantly, the wall at the back of the fountain creates a strategically placed windbreak and a south-facing open space, dealing with the perennial issue of the Ferry Building outdoor space, which is the freezing wind.

In the hands of an equally bold and thoughtful contemporary designer, the sculpture could be incorporated into the new park design and reinvigorated in a contemporary way that need not require expensive pumps and chemicals. The concrete forms should be animated with water seasonally in a modest way that informs the design of the entire park by channeling our infrequent and heavier rains. When the Embarcadero is raised, creating a levee, drainage to the Bay will be impeded, and the basin could serve as a catchment area that is part of the contemporary solution. The mass of the fountain also provides an intermediate scale in the vastness of the Embarcadero open space between buildings; it frames the Ferry Building when

viewed from Market Street and it provides welcome perceptual separation from the traffic on the Embarcadero. San Francisco is only now recovering from the acknowledged mistakes of post war urban renewal, so it should not be controversial to acknowledge that buildings thought to be ugly or beyond repair are actually irreplaceable resources. Reuse is often more cost effective than building new if we calculate the long term costs and energy required to remove the foundations.

Vaillancourt's lifelong work is an act of free expression and resistance against oppression. He was outspoken in support of the native Americans who occupied Alcatraz during fountain construction. What does it say about the future of San Francisco as a leader in social and environmental issues to replace something provocative with rolling lawns? The fountain should serve as an historic anchor to whatever park improvements transpire. Instead of begrudging accommodating of the fountain with an unrelated design, as has been proposed, the park should be designed with the requirement that the fountain be fully integrated as a driver in the reinvigoration of the entire park. It would be a great loss to double down on the stylistic preferences of the moment and lose this history for future generations.

Sincerely



Gary Strang, FASLA, FAIA
Principal
GLS Landscape | Architecture

Please include this letter in the following public policy body meetings and public records, either for the date specified or the soonest scheduled.

*Arts Commission - Full Commission Meeting - November 3, 2025
Board of Supervisors Meeting - October 14, 2025
Arts Commission - Visual Arts Committee Meeting - October 15, 2025
Historic Preservation Commission Meeting - October 15, 2025
Recreation and Park Commission Meeting - October 16, 2025*