

# Racial Equity Action Plans: City Jobs

## Updated Template and Resources

### Citywide mandate

The City's racial equity ordinance mandates that every department work with the Office of Racial Equity to implement a "Racial Equity Action Plan." ORE and City departments collaborated to create this citywide template for Racial Equity Action Plans. The template outlines actions that can help prevent racial discrimination, close any racial disparities, and ensure City jobs are fair for everyone.

### How to use this document

Use this resource as a "menu" of equity practices and select actions that are most relevant to any racial disparities within your department. Consider factors like department size, service type, resources, and staff feedback.

Many departments set racial equity priorities during their regular budget and planning process. In the spring, ORE asks all departments to finalize their upcoming priorities and report on the past year's accomplishments in an annual progress report.

- **Winter budget and work plan:** Identify racial equity priorities and resources
- **Spring progress report:** Report on prior year accomplishments and priority actions for the coming year

### What updates have been made since 2020?

This revised template captures learnings from City departments over the last five years:

- It streamlines actions that were similar and suggests new actions that departments have identified as important.
- It lists citywide resources and policies that are relevant to each action.

**The updated template is intended to help departments that are updating or re-publishing their action plans. If your department would prefer to continue using the 2020 template, reach out to ORE.**

### Building transformative change over time

ORE encourages all departments to focus on actions that:

- Address staff feedback and workforce data about potential racial disparities
- Lead to meaningful systems change, not just ticking off boxes

Your department can adapt the actions in the template to better fit your context. Actions can also be split into smaller steps or combined into larger initiatives. While some actions may not apply to very small departments, all departments are expected to take steps to increase racial equity and ensure fairness for all in the workplace.

## Working with the Civil Service Commission and Department of Human Resources

For many actions in the template, there are relevant federal or state employment laws, Civil Service Commission Rules, Department of Human Resources employment policies, and/or collective bargaining agreements with labor unions (available online). The Civil Service Commission, Department of Human Resources, as well as the City Attorney's Office are always available to provide guidance and advice to your department on specific policies or situations.

### Data about racial equity in City jobs

Data continues to show patterns of occupational segregation both citywide and within departments. ORE and departments have identified several data indicators that are helpful for analyzing citywide issues as well as for developing department initiatives.

When using workforce data, it is essential that your department protect people's privacy. Your department must aggregate and anonymize data for analysis and reporting, as well as ensure data cannot be used to harm any individual person. Employment decisions must never be based on a person's race/ethnicity, gender identity or expression, immigration status or other protected classes. DHR has detailed guidance on how to redact workforce data.

#### Citywide indicators

- New hires and promotions
- Median pay rate
- Appointment type (permanent civil service, temporary exempt, etc.)
- Corrective actions
- Voluntary and involuntary separations
- Senior leadership and commissioners
- Workplace injuries
- Equal Employment Opportunity complaints

#### Additional department indicators

- Pass rates throughout the selection process (applications, interviews, offers, etc.)
- Staff experiences at work (harassment, discrimination, etc.)
- Professional development (median funds used per employee, trainings and conferences attended, etc.)

## Definition

### Disparity

Differences or gaps in outcomes between groups of people, often by race and gender. A disparity can be observed through quantitative or qualitative data. A disparity in and of itself does not imply any specific fault, causation, or significance. **It is important to analyze disparities for potential causes.**

## Contents: Racial Equity Action Plan template

<b>Creating Racial Equity Action Plans</b>	pp. 4-5
<b>1. Recruitment and Hiring</b>	pp. 6-7
<b>2. Retention, Professional Development, and Promotions</b>	pp. 8-10
<b>3. Corrective Actions</b>	p. 10-11
<b>4. Culture of Inclusion and Belonging</b>	pp. 11-14
<b>5. Boards and Commissions</b>	p. 14-15

Actions to develop and manage a Racial Equity Action Plan for your department

Actions to improve specific workforce practices in your department

Note: The print version of this template lists general citywide policies and practices. For more resources and examples of specific department practices, visit the Office of Racial Equity's internal website for City departments.

## Creating Racial Equity Action Plans: How to develop and sustain your department's plan

### Designate Racial Equity Leaders – each year

- Designate Racial Equity Leaders for your entire department.** Include division-specific Racial Equity Leaders if your department budget is over \$10 million/year. Provide this information to ORE.
  - *Required by legislation*
  - Many departments have created a centralized equity team to serve as their Racial Equity Leaders; in these situations, it is essential to have a liaison on their human resources and finance teams. Other departments have designated their Department Personnel Officer and human resources staff as Racial Equity Leaders.
- Create supporting committees, working groups, and affinity groups as needed** to implement racial equity initiatives and engage your entire department.

### Develop Racial Equity Action Plan and measure progress – ongoing

- Collect and analyze data to identify any racial disparities or racial equity issues in your department workforce.** Conduct regular staff surveys (annual, etc.). Focus on drop-offs in race/ethnicity and potential disparate impacts.
  - DHR Workforce Report: citywide data and initiatives related to racial equity
  - DHR and the Controller's Office have created demographic data dashboards for most departments:
    - Applicant demographics and time to hire (applications, interviews, offers)
    - Employee demographics (pay, classification, appointment type, promotions, separations)
    - Senior leadership and commission demographics
  - Departments are responsible for collecting the following data directly from their staff:
    - Disciplinary actions – *required by DHR*
    - Workplace injuries and accommodation needs – *required by DHR*
    - Professional development (funds used per employee, trainings and conferences attended, etc.)
    - Staff experiences at work (harassment, discrimination, etc.)

- Many departments conduct staff surveys every one to two years; some alternate a long survey and a short “pulse” survey. They also hold focus groups and interviews to understand specific staff experiences and needs.

---

**Develop your department’s Racial Equity Action Plan.** Decide on priority actions for your current year.

- *Required by legislation*
- Many departments align or integrate their Racial Equity Action Plan with their strategic plan and budget processes.

---

**Provide your department’s Racial Equity Action Plan to all staff, the public, and ORE.** Give regular updates to leadership, commissioners, staff, and community members.

- *Required by legislation*

---

**Document any equitable workforce procedures specific to your department in a resource or guide.** Review with your Racial Equity Leaders and relevant committees or working groups. Roll out to all staff, evaluate outcomes, and adapt as needed.

- Civil Service Commission Rules and Advisers: Regulations about the City’s merit system
- DHR e-Library: Citywide workforce policies and resources
- Many departments have created guides for their staff on equitable procedures for: recruitment, hiring, and onboarding; professional development; corrective action.

---

**Report annually on your department’s progress** in achieving racial equity.

- *Required by legislation*
- ORE and departments have collaborated on a citywide template for these progress reports. The template is typically revised and released each winter.

## 1. Recruitment and Hiring

### Increase effectiveness of department hiring practices

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| <p><input type="checkbox"/> <b>Analyze the overall diversity of the applicant pool throughout the selection process</b>, for both previous and current job openings. Investigate any drop-offs in race/ethnicity (e.g. by classification or job type).</p> <p><b>Review your department’s outreach, selection, and background processes</b> for any obstacles that unfairly discourage or disqualify job applicants.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Civil Service Commission Rules: Allows for demographic analysis of an applicant pool if there is ethnic or gender underrepresentation in that classification or occupational category. Outlines when examination processes may be extended or reopened due to underrepresentation relative to the labor market and other considerations.</li> <li>• DHR Conviction History Program: Administers fingerprinting and conviction history review for many – but not all – departments. In 2023, they updated their policy to shorten the “lookback” period for convictions and narrow the “nexus” of relevant job responsibilities.</li> </ul> <p>While DHR reviews conviction history and provides a recommendation, your department is responsible for 1) identifying which job responsibilities are relevant and 2) making the final decision about a candidate.</p> <p>Note that some departments have their own fingerprinting equipment (e.g. Airport, Recreation and Parks, Human Services Agency); others conduct their own “nexus” review (e.g. Fire Department, Human Services Agency); and others manage their own background process from beginning to end (e.g. Sheriff’s Office, Police Department, District Attorney, Municipal Transportation Agency).</p> |
| <p><input type="checkbox"/> <b>Reduce unnecessary or outdated minimum qualifications and degree requirements.</b> Reject “degree inflation” that worsens racial and class disparities by requiring a four-year college degree for jobs that haven’t required degrees previously. Consider how to allow work experience to substitute fully for educational credentials.</p>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• DHR Classification and Compensation: Administers the classification system for City jobs. In recent years, they have analyzed and modernized minimum qualifications for hundreds of classifications. Your department can develop a proposal to update the minimum qualifications for a classification and bring them to DHR for review and approval.</li> </ul>  |
| <p><input type="checkbox"/> <b>Shorten wait times and reduce delays</b> that can put applicants at an economic disadvantage by improving coordination in your department throughout the hiring process.</p>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• For most departments, DHR has created a data dashboard to track “time to hire.”</li> <li>• Many departments have created example hiring timelines and set guidelines for how HR analysts and hiring managers can be more responsive to applicants.</li> </ul>  |
| <p><input type="checkbox"/> <b>Use holistic and accurate assessments of skills and experience.</b> Consider alternatives to multiple choice tests, essay questions, and oral interviews. Share example topics with candidates in advance.</p>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Civil Service Commission Rules: Establishes the many ways that your department may evaluate candidates, such as work samples, performance tests, and probationary periods.</li> </ul>  |

## Action

## Citywide resources & practices

**Ensure hiring panels are diverse and trained** in equitable selection processes.

- DHR Evaluator Selection Policy: Outlines requirements for interviewers, panelists, and evaluators who review applicant qualifications. Example criteria: subject matter expertise; mandatory training; racial and gender diversity.

- Expand certification to the “Rule of 10 Scores” or “Rule of List”** instead of considering only the top three scores from applicants, in discussion with relevant unions.

- While the Civil Service Commission Rules establish the “Rule of Three Scores” as the default, there may already be a different agreement in place for certain positions (e.g. “Rule of Seven Scores,” “Rule of List”).

To expand certification beyond the default number or what was previously agreed upon with the relevant union – in other words, to consider more candidates for a position – your department must notify and reach agreement with the union *before* posting a job opening.

- Provide consistent and supportive onboarding into your department**, including for staff, volunteers, interns, and contractors.

- DHR Citywide Onboarding Checklist: A mandatory list of trainings, policies, and forms that must be provided to every new employee.

Consider practices like pairing every new person with a longstanding employee, weekly check-ins, etc.

## Build pipelines into your department

- Provide paid internships or fellowships** for entry-level as well as mid-career candidates to gain skills and knowledge that are relevant to your department.

**Provide paid pre-apprenticeships or apprenticeships** to train and certify candidates for specific occupations in your department.

Ensure participants receive mentoring and career development support throughout the program. Collect constructive feedback about their experiences and adjust the program accordingly.

- Opportunities for All: Universal paid internship program for local youth, including placements at City departments, non-profits, and businesses
- DHR San Francisco Fellows: Post-college fellowships with City departments for one year
- DHR ApprenticeshipSF: Administers all apprenticeship programs for City departments. Apprenticeship programs must be certified by the State of California and meet requirements for on-the-job and academic training.

- Build department and hiring manager relationships with non-traditional outlets.** Develop an expansive recruitment process that stretches beyond existing protocols.

- DHR Diversity Recruitment Team: Available to provide resources and advice on advertising jobs and outreach to external organizations. Convenes regular working groups with human resource staff in City departments on recruitment efforts.

## Action

## Citywide resources & practices

Consider community-based organizations, racially diverse professional and trade-based associations, re-entry programs, community college systems, public schools, trade schools, and other educational institutions.

- Expand job outreach and announcement lists** to include all staff in your department.

## 2. Retention, Professional Development, and Promotions

### Ensure salaries and benefits meet or exceed industry standards

- Conduct annual internal reviews of salary and benefits** within the department and against industry standards to identify pay parity issues.
  - Citywide salary and benefits are determined through collective bargaining with labor unions and DHR. Note that some departments have set additional pay steps or pay premiums for specific positions.
- Increase flexibility in your department's practices for scheduling shifts, paid time off, and leaves to better meet staff needs.** Consider differences in rank and seniority, caregiving responsibilities, religious and cultural holidays, etc.
  - Citywide paid time off and leave policies for all departments are determined through collective bargaining with labor unions and DHR. At this time, the amount of paid time off varies by union.
  - Many departments have created a shared calendar of major cultural and religious observances, and directed staff to avoid scheduling events and meetings on those days.

### Create transparent paths to promotion

- Identify classifications that do not have a clear promotional path** ("dead end") within the department or the City, or that have a low rate of promotion. Focus on "drop-offs" in race/ethnicity (e.g. 182x Administrative Analyst series).
    - DHR Classification and Compensation: Administers the classification system for City jobs. In recent years, they have analyzed and modernized minimum qualifications for hundreds of classifications. Your department can develop a proposal to update the minimum qualifications for a classification and bring them to DHR for review and approval.
- Create a clear upward path by using alternative classifications or adding bridging responsibilities to existing roles.**

## Action

## Citywide resources & practices

- Create transparent processes and communicate standards** for raises and promotions.

- Citywide salary steps and benefits are determined through collective bargaining with DHR and the labor unions.

Note that some departments or even divisions may have step adjustments that are specific to their positions.

- Develop a process for acting or interim roles** so that staff can gain new work experience and receive appropriate credit or compensation.

Consider rotating acting assignments among all qualified staff.

- Civil Service Commission Rules: Requires that any temporary “out-of-class” work be documented so that City staff receive credit should they apply for other positions in the City. This applies even if the additional responsibilities do not meet all the requirements for an “acting assignment.” Ideally, the documentation should be done by the manager or staff during the “out-of-class” assignment (“contemporaneous”). The Civil Service Commission Rules allow for documentation after the fact (“non-contemporaneous”) with the approval of the department head and DHR.

An employee is *not* required to meet the minimum qualifications for the temporary assignment classification.

- Acting assignment pay rates are set through collective bargaining with labor unions and DHR. Different unions have established different conditions and time periods during which staff may receive acting assignment pay.

- Ensure that annual performance evaluations include career development opportunities and advancement goals** for all staff, part-time and full-time. Encourage a culture where staff actively contribute to their work plans and performance evaluations.

**During the evaluation process, discuss staff needs both at work and outside of work** that may be affecting their performance, and identify ways to accommodate them.

- DHR Performance Plan and Appraisal Report: A template that your department may use in annual performance evaluations. Many departments have adapted these for their context and needs.

## Offer professional development opportunities that center individual goals

- Assess training and professional development opportunities** for all staff on an ongoing basis. Identify any disparities or obstacles to accessing professional development.

## Action

## Citywide resources & practices

- Ensure all staff have opportunities for both internal and external professional development, regardless of seniority and appointment type.**

**Develop an equitable procedure for your department** to approve professional development requests and provide stipends (registration, travel, other costs for conferences or courses).

- DHR Workforce Development: Provides a variety of trainings and classes for City staff. Available to help your department design trainings on specific topics.
- City University: Provides tuition subsidies for City staff, such as at City College of San Francisco, San Francisco State University College of Extended Learning, UC Berkeley Extension
- City staff are able to receive reimbursement through their unions for classes, conferences, and other professional development. At this time, each union has negotiated a different amount of tuition reimbursement with the City.
- Many departments have established their own additional budget for staff professional development.

- Facilitate mentorships, job shadowing, informational interviews, and other ways for staff to learn from each other about developing their careers.**

- City Career Center: Provides career advising and development resources for City staff at City Hall. Drop-in hours and scheduled appointments are available.

## 3. Corrective Actions

### Create clear and equitable protocols for corrective actions

- Conduct annual internal reviews of corrective actions and separations** to identify any disparities or potential patterns of bias.

- All City departments are required to record corrective actions and report this data to DHR each year.

- Standardize corrective actions to ensure all staff are treated fairly, compassionately, and consistently across your department.**

- Some departments have implemented internal committees or other processes to review proposed corrective actions for fairness and consistency.

- Ensure ongoing learning for all staff about preventing bias and discrimination** in corrective actions, as well as EEO and union protections.

- Some departments have developed their own internal training programs for new supervisors, as well as for staff who are considering becoming supervisors.

**Provide supervisors with training, coaching, or other resources** to strengthen their ability to support all staff effectively and equitably.

- Implement alternative dispute resolution** opportunities in your department to resolve interpersonal issues.
- DHR Equitable, Fair, and Respectful Workplace Policy: Outlines expectations for City staff to work earnestly, collegially, and collaboratively with each other. Includes resources for individuals and managers on resolving conflict, including third-party resolution.

## 4. Culture of Inclusion and Belonging

### Develop an effective organizational culture

- Ensure the department's mission, values, and policies** commit to a culture of equity and belonging where employees can thrive.
- Facilitate ongoing discussions with staff about how to address their needs inside and outside of the workplace.** Incorporate stay interviews and exit interviews. Center the most vulnerable individuals, such as those with multiple worksites or shift schedules.
 

**Engage staff in department decision-making processes.** Maintain a simple and anonymous process for staff to provide input to senior leadership.
- Enable staff and leadership to participate in learning, conferences, and department discussions that promote a deeper understanding of racial equity.** Program department meetings to include education and engagement on topics related to equity.

## Action

## Citywide resources & practices

**Support and provide space for affinity-based discussions and affinity groups.**

**Build mutual understanding of diverse cultures** through team building and community building activities (e.g. heritage month events).

- |  |  |
|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> <b>Honor and protect individual forms of identity expression</b> (e.g. using gender pronouns, modifying outdated dress codes, affirming diverse hairstyles and hair textures, etc.). Ensure all staff, especially supervisors, understand how to prevent bias and discrimination related to individual or culturally specific identity expressions. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• DHR Gender Inclusion Policy: Requires that all people must be treated with dignity and respect, regardless of gender, gender identity, and gender expression. Includes resources on adding chosen names to employee personnel files and supporting people who are transitioning gender identities.</li></ul> |
| <input type="checkbox"/> <b>Provide spaces for staff to take breaks, be in community, access resources, and for religious and cultural practices.</b> Incorporate public art and decor that reflects the cultural traditions of local communities.   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <i>Required by legislation.</i></li></ul>  |

## Ensure safety and accessibility at work

- |   |   |
|---|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> <b>Monitor and analyze any disparities in injuries at department worksites.</b> Identify ways to proactively reduce injuries and improve ergonomic and safety equipment for staff.<br><br>Ensure your department's Injury and Illness Prevention Plan and Workplace Violence Prevention Plan are up to date. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <i>Required by legislation.</i></li><li>• All departments are required to maintain an Injury and Illness Prevention Plan and Workplace Violence Prevention Plan. These should be submitted to the DHR Health and Safety Division.</li></ul>   |
| <input type="checkbox"/> <b>Improve physical accessibility, digital accessibility, and language accessibility</b> for your department. Ensure your department processes for accommodation and language access requests are clear for staff and visitors. Consider the needs of people with disabilities, seniors, families, etc.      | <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <i>Required by legislation.</i></li><li>• DHR Reasonable Accommodation Policy: Required processes for all departments to provide reasonable accommodations to applicants and staff with disabilities.</li><li>• <a href="#">SF Office on Disability and Accessibility</a>: Assists departments in making all programs and facilities usable for people with disabilities.</li></ul> |

## Action

## Citywide resources & practices

- [ADM Digital and Data Services](#): Digital Accessibility and Inclusion Standard for all department websites and online content.
- [DHR Equal Employment Opportunity](#): Investigates discrimination, harassment, and retaliation complaints from staff, contractors, interns, volunteers. Large departments also have EEO teams (examples: AIR, DPH, MTA, etc.). Note that this is separate from state and federal EEO filing and investigation processes.
- [DHR Access to City Employment](#): Alternate pathway for people with disabilities to apply for entry-level City jobs. Contact DHR for your department to participate.
- [CA Disability Access Services](#): State resource on disability laws and physical, digital, communication accessibility.
- DHR Language Diversity Policy: Outlines employee rights to speak their native language in the workplace and when your department may and may not require staff to speak English
- [Language Access Ordinance](#): Establishes when your department is required to provide translation and interpretation into the City's "threshold languages," as well as into other languages. OCEIA has many resources and trainings to support your department.

Many departments have translated materials and provided interpretation at important events such as all-staff meetings.

- Ensure all staff have easy access to regular departmental communications and can also share information with each other.** Provide and maintain any necessary processes, equipment or facilities (e.g. email lists, tablets, bulletin board, etc.).

- Many departments have issued tablets or cell phones to staff who work outdoors or at multiple worksites, instead of requiring them to use their personal devices.

- Monitor and analyze Disaster Service Worker deployments** for your department to ensure assignments are equitable and credited. Ensure staff needs during deployment (e.g. PPE, caregiving responsibilities, etc.) are fully met.

## 5. Boards and Commissions

### Ensure board/commissions center the communities most affected by their decisions

- Update bylaws and/or board/commission priorities to align with department racial equity goals.**

**Ensure your department's presentations to commissioners include racial equity analyses.** Consider ongoing learning opportunities for commissioners and support staff about racial equity in decision-making.

- Create board/commission seats for representatives from the communities most affected by department decisions** and eliminate give/get requirements.

- Facilitate mentorships between newer and more experienced board/commission members.**

- Enable community members to participate meaningfully in commission meetings and events** (e.g. accessibility requests, language needs, remote participation, food during meetings, childcare). Consider the needs of people with disabilities, with shift work, with caregiving responsibilities, etc.

- *Required by legislation*