City and County of San Francisco
Daniel Lurie, Mayor

Draft minutes for Civic Design Review, October 19, 2026

sfac san francisco arts commission

Draft Minutes

Chair Carney called the meeting to order at 2:01 pm.

1. Call to Order, Roll Call, Agenda Changes, Land Acknowledgment (16:12)

Commissioners Present
Patrick Carney, Chair
Janine Shiota, Vice President
McKenna Quint
Al Perez (left at 3:45pm)
Seth Brenzel
Jessica Rothschild

Commissioners Absent
Chuck Collins, President

Staff Present
Mary Chou, Civic Art Collection and Public Art Program Director
Matthew Goudeau, Executive Director of Arts and Culture
Manraj Dhaliwal, Commission Secretary

Agenda changes
Item 5, Candlestick Willie Mays Park Pump Sanitary Sever Pump Station has been tabled and adjusting time for public comment from 3 minutes to 2 minutes. No additional agenda changes were made.

Commissioner Rothschild announced the public meeting instructions

Commission Secretary Dhaliwal announced the public meeting instructions.

Commissioner Quint began the meeting by reading the Arts Commission's land acknowledgement statement.

2. General Public Comment
   (21:30)

Public Comment(s)
Dr. Bruce Colville, Retired Educator
Dr. Colville spoke in support of preserving the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument at its current location, emphasizing its historical significance in honoring Americans who fought against fascism during the Spanish Civil War. He urged the Committee to reconsider relocating the monument and stressed the importance of preserving San Francisco's history for future generations.

There was no additional public comment.

3. Embarcadero Plaza and Sue Bierman Park Renovation Project – Conceptual and Phase 1 Review + Embarcadero Plaza: Pavilion Conceptual Review (24:13)

The project team, led by the San Francisco Recreation and Park Department and HOK, presented the proposed renovation of Embarcadero Plaza and Sue Bierman Park. The approximately five-acre project aims to transform the existing spaces into a unified, accessible waterfront park that supports recreation, cultural programming, public gatherings, and downtown revitalization. Proposed improvements include a large multipurpose lawn accommodating approximately 5,000 people, a smaller community lawn, expanded pedestrian pathways, seating areas, native landscaping, stormwater gardens, and opportunities for public art. The design incorporates feedback from three community meetings and more than 2,500 survey responses. Construction is anticipated to begin in December 2026, with completion targeted for the end of 2027.

The project team also presented several preliminary designs for a new pavilion intended to serve as a central architectural feature and flexible performance space. The concepts draw inspiration from San Francisco's natural environment, cultural identity, and iconic bridges, emphasizing transparency and connectivity between the park's gathering spaces. Commissioners generally supported the proposed improvements and recognized the project's potential to create a significant civic destination. They encouraged further consideration of the balance between landscaping and hardscape, public art integration, pavilion functionality, accessibility, sound impacts on surrounding residences, and adequate infrastructure for performances and events. Commissioners also emphasized the importance of preserving the site's history and creating a cohesive artistic identity throughout the park.

A significant portion of the discussion and public comment focused on the proposed relocation of the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument. Members of the public expressed strong concerns about removing the monument,

emphasizing its historical and educational significance and requesting a clear preservation and relocation plan. Commissioners discussed the Arts Commission's review process and the need for coordination with the Visual Arts Committee, Recreation and Park Department, Port, project partners, and community stakeholders. The Committee unanimously approved the Combined Conceptual and Phase 1 Review for the park renovation, with a request to convene an informal meeting among the relevant parties to further discuss the monument's future. The Committee also unanimously approved the pavilion's Conceptual Review, with additional design development and review anticipated.

Commissioner Quint, seconded by Commissioner Shiota, moved to approve Conceptual and Phase 1 Review for Embarcadero Plaza and Sue Bierman Park Renovation Project with condition of meeting to discuss the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument, which includes a representative from following parties: BXP, Port Commission, Rec & Park, Civic Design Review, Visual Arts Committee and ALBA.

Public Comment(s)
Michele Hennessy, Gateway Apartments Resident and Neighborhood Representative
Hennessy expressed support for the proposed park design and appreciation for the project team's community engagement. Hennessy raised concerns about noise from performances and events affecting nearby residential buildings and requested continued neighborhood involvement in addressing sound impacts.

Alec Bash – Retired City Planner and Gateway Apartments Resident
Bash expressed support for the renovation but raised concerns about noise impacts on nearby residential buildings. Bash encouraged the project team to explore sound mitigation measures and maintain playground accessibility during construction, particularly for families with young children.

Mary Jane Large – President, Barbary Coast Neighborhood Association
Large emphasized the importance of Sue Bierman Park as essential neighborhood green space and highlighted the association's longstanding involvement in supporting the playground. Large requested efforts to minimize playground closures during construction and further consideration of noise impacts on surrounding residents.

Tad Sky – Street Artist
Sky expressed strong support for the proposed design and praised the project team's extensive community outreach. Sky appreciated the continued accommodation of street artists, consideration of weather conditions, expanded recreational opportunities, and accelerated construction timeline.

Ethan Silva – Public Art Fabricator
Silva discussed experience fabricating major public artworks, including Cloud Gate, and shared that artist Anish Kapoor had developed a potential sculpture for the park. Silva expressed interest in pursuing the installation, noting its potential to become an internationally recognized landmark.

Peter Bach – BXP Representative
Bach expressed strong support for the renovation and highlighted positive feedback from Embarcadero Center tenants. Bach commended the partnership between BXP and the Recreation and Park Department and encouraged the Committee to approve the project.

Megan Bierman – Abraham Lincoln Brigade Archives (ALBA)
Bierman opposed the proposed removal of the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument, emphasizing Sue Bierman's involvement in supporting its installation and historical significance. Bierman questioned the amount of lawn space proposed and urged the design team to reconsider the layout to accommodate the monument within the park.

Name Not Clearly Identified – Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument Advocate
The speaker emphasized the monument's historical importance and expressed concern about the limited notice and uncertainty surrounding its

relocation. The speaker requested a written preservation and relocation commitment, including consultation with the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Archives and artist Walter Hood, identified funding, and a clear timeline.

Peter Persoff – Abraham Lincoln Brigade Archives (ALBA)
Persoff emphasized the monument's connection to San Francisco's labor movement and the history of Americans who fought against fascism during the Spanish Civil War. Persoff urged the Committee to preserve the monument in a visible and accessible location to maintain its educational significance.

Chia Hamilton – Abraham Lincoln Brigade Archives (ALBA)
Hamilton shared a family connection to the Abraham Lincoln Brigade and described the monument's importance in educating visitors about the Spanish Civil War. Hamilton encouraged the Committee to preserve the artwork in a prominent public location where future generations can learn about its history.

Dan Wohlfeiler – Bay Area Resident and Documentary Filmmaker
Wohlfeiler discussed involvement in documenting the experiences of Abraham Lincoln Brigade veterans and emphasized the importance of preserving their legacy. Wohlfeiler requested a written commitment establishing a permanent location for the monument, identifying preservation and relocation funding, and outlining a clear timeline.

Alex Pinto – Ferry Bocce League Representative
Pinto requested clarification regarding the future of the Ferry Bocce Courts, noting inconsistencies in the project illustrations and concerns about potential displacement during construction. Pinto emphasized the importance of the courts to league participants and requested further communication regarding possible impacts.

Stan Shields – Retired Administrative Law Judge
Shields highlighted Sue Bierman's contributions to San Francisco and longstanding advocacy for preserving public spaces and historical resources.

Shields strongly opposed removing the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument from the park, emphasizing the importance of honoring Bierman's legacy.

Cecilia London – Abraham Lincoln Brigade Archives (ALBA)
London shared a family history of involvement in the Spanish Civil War and emphasized the historical importance of recognizing the Brigade's sacrifices. London opposed the monument's removal and expressed concern that placing it in storage could prevent its return to public display.

Paul Stein – Abraham Lincoln Brigade Archives (ALBA)
Stein urged the design team to incorporate the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument into the park rather than treating it as an obstacle to redevelopment. Stein requested that a suitable permanent location be identified and prepared before relocating the monument to avoid prolonged storage.

Brenda Hutchinson – Artist
Hutchinson discussed a connection to artist Ann Chamberlain, who collaborated on the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument, and emphasized the importance of preserving artistic legacy and historical memory. Hutchinson also expressed concerns about tree removal, the loss of the fountain, and the need for more contemplative spaces within the proposed park.

Martha Olson Jarocki – Abraham Lincoln Brigade Archives (ALBA)
Olson Jarocki emphasized the monument's connection to San Francisco's labor history and the sacrifices of those who fought during the Spanish Civil War. Olson Jarocki requested a firm commitment regarding the monument's future location, preservation funding, and relocation process before proceeding with its removal.

Caroline Berry – Abraham Lincoln Brigade Archives (ALBA)
Berry shared a family connection to the International Brigades and emphasized the importance of recognizing those who fought against fascism. Berry expressed concern that the monument could remain in storage and

urged the Committee to ensure its continued visibility in a prominent public location.

Leah Hassett – Abraham Lincoln Brigade Archives (ALBA)
Hassett raised concerns regarding the process and accelerated timeline for potentially removing the monument. Hassett emphasized its historical and educational importance to residents, visitors, and schoolchildren and urged the Committee to preserve its public accessibility.

There was no additional public comment.

The motion was unanimously approved.

Commissioner Quint, seconded by Commissioner Shiota, moved to approve Conceptual Review for Embarcadero Plaza: Pavilion.

Public Comment(s)
Kathy Sabatino – Vice President, Gizmo Art Production
Sabatino highlighted Gizmo Art Production's extensive experience fabricating and installing large-scale public artworks throughout San Francisco and nationally. Sabatino expressed interest in participating in the pavilion project and encouraged continued preservation of the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Dan Rabinowitz – Board Member, San Francisco Shakespeare Festival
Rabinowitz expressed strong support for the pavilion and park renovation, emphasizing the importance of accessible outdoor performance spaces. Rabinowitz highlighted the festival's longstanding history of providing free Shakespeare performances and noted that the proposed pavilion concepts could accommodate various theatrical and cultural activities.

Dr. Thomas King – San Francisco Resident
Dr. King encouraged the design team to further develop the pavilion into a distinctive, world-class artistic feature. Dr. King suggested exploring a design

or art competition while also identifying a suitable permanent location for the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument within the renovated park.

Tad Sky – Street Artist
Tad supported the pavilion's location but raised concerns regarding its practical functionality for performances and events. Tad recommended additional consideration of weather protection, electrical infrastructure, equipment access, and potential issues involving birds and people climbing the structure.

There was no additional public comment.

The motion was unanimously approved.

4. New Business and Announcements
   (3:03:04)

There was no new business or announcements given by Commissioners.

There was no public comment.

5. Adjournment
   (3:03:53)

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:49 pm

Draft minutes posted 10/30/2026, 5:00 pm, mscd

Policies

Accessibility Meeting Policy

Per the American Disabilities Act and the Language Access Ordinance, Chinese, Spanish, Tagalog, and/or American Sign Language interpreters will be available upon request. Additionally, every effort will be made to provide a sound enhancement system, meeting materials in alternative formats, and/or a reader. Minutes may be translated after they have been adopted by the Commission. For all these requests, please contact Commission Secretary Manraj Dhaliwal at least 48 hours before the meeting at 415-252-2247, manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org. Late requests will be honored if possible. The meeting room is wheelchair accessible.

利便参與會議的相關規定

根據美國殘疾人士法案和語言服務條例，中文、西班牙語、和/或美國手語翻譯人員在收到要求後將會提供翻譯服務。另外，我們將盡力提供擴音設備。同時也將會提供不同格式的會議資料，和/或者提供閱讀器。此外，翻譯版本的會議記錄可在委員會通過後提供。上述的要求，請於會議前最少 48 小時致電 415-252-2247 向 Manraj Dhaliwal, manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org 提出。逾期提出的請求，若可能的話，亦會被考慮接納。聽證室設有輪椅通道。

POLITICA DE ACCESO A LA REUNIÓN

De acuerdo con la Ley sobre Estadounidenses con Discapacidades (American Disabilities Act) y la Ordenanza de Acceso a Idiomas (Language Access Ordinance) intérpretes de chino, español, y lenguaje de señas estarán disponibles de ser requeridos. En adición, se hará todo el esfuerzo posible para proveer un sistema mejoramiento de sonido, materiales de la reunión en formatos alternativos, y/o proveer un leedor. Las minutas podrán ser traducidas luego de ser aprobadas por la Comisión. Para solicitar estos servicios, favor contactar a Commission Secretary, Manraj Dhaliwal, por lo menos 48 horas antes de la reunión al 415-252-

2247, manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org. Las solicitudes tardías serán consideradas de ser posible. La sala de audiencia es accesible a silla de ruedas.

Patakaran para sa pag-access ng mga Miting
Ayon sa batas ng American Disabilities Act at ng Language Access Ordinance, maaring mag-request ng mga tagapagsalin wika sa salitang Tsino, Espanyol at/o sa may kapansanan pandinig sa American Sign Language. Bukod pa dito, sisikapin gawan ng paraan na makapaglaan ng gami t upang lalong pabutihin ang inyong pakikinig, maibahagi ang mga kaganapan ng miting sa iba't ibang anyo, at/o isang tagapagbasa.
Ang mga kaganapan ng miting ay maaring isalin sa ibang wika matapos ito ay aprobahan ng komisyon.
Sa mga ganitong uri ng kahilingan, mangyari po lamang makipag ugnayan kay Commission Secretary Manraj Dhaliwal sa 415-252-2247, manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org. Magbigay po lamang ng hindi bababa sa 48 oras na abiso bago ng miting. Kung maari, ang mga late na hiling ay posibleng tanggapin. Ang silid ng pagpupulungan ay accessible sa mga naka wheelchair.

Agenda Item Information/Materials Available
Each item on the agenda may include the following documents:
1) Department or Agency or report;
2) Public correspondence;
3) Other explanatory documents.

Explanatory documents listed above, as well as documents created or distributed after the posting of this agenda to the Arts Commission will be available only electronically, please contact: Commission Secretary Manraj Dhaliwal at manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org or 415-252-2247. PLEASE NOTE: The Arts Commission often receives documents created or submitted by other City officials, agencies or departments after the posting of the Arts Commission agenda. For such documents or presentations, members of the

public may wish to contact the originating agency if they seek documents not yet provided to the Arts Commission.

Archives Available
A recording of this meeting will be available online, 48 hours after the meeting.

Cell Phone Or other Electronic Device Use at Hearings
Please silence all cell phones, pagers, and other sound-producing devices before the meeting begins.

If a device does go off during the meeting, please note that the Chair or President may ask the person responsible to step out of the room.

Disability Access
To obtain a disability-related modification or accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services, to participate in the meeting, please contact Manraj Dhaliwal at manraj.dhaliwal@sfgov.org or 415-252-2247, at least 48 hours before the meeting, except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline is 4:00 p.m. the previous Friday.

- Wheelchair accessible entrance is at Van Ness Avenue and Grove Street.
- There are elevators and accessible restrooms located on every floor.

Lobbyist Ordinance
Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (San Francisco Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code sections 2.100-2.160) to register and report lobbying activity.

For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, contact the Ethics Commission.

- 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102
- (415) 252-3100

- Ethics.Commission@sfgov.org

Meeting Procedures
1. Agenda items will normally be heard in order. Please note, that on occasion a special circumstance may necessitate that an agenda item be taken out of order. To ensure that an agenda item is not missed, it is advised to arrive at the beginning of the meeting. All agenda changes will be announced by the Chair at the top of the meeting.

2. Public comment will be taken before or during the Committee's consideration of each agenda item. Each speaker will be allowed to speak for the time allotted by the Chair at the top of the meeting or up to three (3) minutes.

3. During General Public Comment, members of the public may address the Commissioners on matters that are within the Arts Commission's jurisdiction and are not on the agenda.

4. Persons who spoke during the public comment period at a meeting of the Arts Commission may supply a brief written summary of the comments to be included in the minutes if it is 150 words or less. The Arts Commission may reject the summary if it exceeds the prescribed word limit or is not an accurate summary of the speaker's public comment.

5. Persons unable to attend an Arts Commission meeting may submit correspondence to the Arts Commission in connection with an agenda item. The Commission Secretary will post these documents adjacent to the agenda if they are one page in length. If they are longer than one page, the Arts Commission will make such documents available for public inspection and copying. Please note, correspondence submitted to the Arts Commission will NOT be read aloud during the meeting. Names and addresses included in these submittals will be public. Submittals may be

made anonymously. Written comments pertaining to this meeting should be submitted to art-info@sfgov.org.

Public Comment
Public comment in regard to specific agenda items will be taken before or during consideration of the item. Each speaker may speak for up to three minutes per agenda item, unless the Chair has announced a different length of time at the beginning of the meeting. Speakers may not transfer their time to another person. Any person speaking during a public comment period may supply a written summary of their comments to be included in the minutes if it is 150 words or less.

NOTE: The San Francisco Arts Commission is discontinuing remote public comment for all public meetings starting in December 2023. Public comment will be taken in-person, with remote access provided for those who require an ADA accommodation. Requests for accommodation must be made at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting, pursuant to Administrative Code Section 97.7. Late requests will be honored if possible. Please reach out to art-info@sfgov.org or by calling 415-252-2255 with any questions or to make an accommodation request

Sensitivity to chemical-based products
In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity, or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical-based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

Sunshine Ordinance
Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that

deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review.

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, http://www.sfgov.org/sunshine/

For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact by mail to Administrator, Sunshine Ordinance Task Force.

- 1 Dr. Carlton b. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102
- (415) 554-7724
- By fax at 415-554 7854
- sotf@sfgov.org