



CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REPORT TRANSMITTAL (FORM 22MTA) Applicable to Municipal Transportation Agency Service-Critical Classes

Refer to Civil Service Commission Procedure for Staff - Submission of
Written Reports MTA for Instructions on completing and processing this Form

1. Civil Service Commission Register Number: _____ - _____ -
2. For Civil Service Commission Meeting of: September 15, 2025
3. Check One: Ratification Agenda
 Consent Agenda X
 Regular Agenda
4. Subject: SFMTA Position-Based Testing Report for FY 25
5. Recommendation: Adopt the report.
6. Report prepared by: William Miles II Telephone number: 415-646-2863
7. Notifications: **(Attach a list of the person(s) to be notified in the format described in IV.
Commission Report Format -A**
8. Reviewed and approved for Civil Service Commission Agenda:

Municipal Transportation Agency Director: kimberly ackerman

Date: September 3, 2025
9. Submit the original time-stamped copy of this form and person(s) to be notified (see Item 7
above) along with the required copies of the report to:

**Executive Officer
Civil Service Commission
25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720
San Francisco, CA 94102**

10. Receipt-stamp this form in the ACSC RECEIPT STAMP box to the right using the time-stamp in the CSC Office.

CSC RECEIPT STAMP

Attachment

Notifications

Julie Kirschbaum
SF Municipal Transportation Agency
julie.kirschbaum@sfmta.com

Kimberly Ackerman
SF Municipal Transportation Agency
kimberly.ackerman@sfmta.com

William Miles II
SF Municipal Transportation Agency
william.milesii@sfmta.com

Shivani Nath
SF Municipal Transportation Agency
shivani.nath@sfmta.com



MEMORANDUM

DATE: September 4, 2025

TO: Honorable Civil Service Commission

THROUGH: Kimberly Ackerman ^W
Human Resources Director, SFMTA Human Resources

FROM: William (Bill) Miles II ^{WEM}
Talent Acquisition Senior Manager, SFMTA Human Resources

Shivani Nath ^{SN}
Examinations and Classification Manager, SFMTA Human Resources

SUBJECT: **SFMTA Position-Based Testing Report for FY 25**

Background

The purpose of this report is to update the Civil Service Commission (CSC) on the Position-Based Testing (PBT) recruitment process at SFMTA. This report covers the period from July 1, 2024 through June 30, 2025.

The following report is submitted pursuant to Civil Service Rule 411A.5, which originally required the Director of Transportation/Municipal Transportation Agency ("MTA") to provide quarterly reports to the Civil Service Commission ("Commission") on any examinations administered under the Position-based Testing Program ("PBT") for Service-Critical classes at the MTA pursuant to Rule 411A.

According to CSC Rule 411A.5, the report must include, but not be limited to the following information for each examination:

- Applicable certification rule
- Duration of the eligible list
- Number of applicants
- Number of applicants deemed qualified under the terms of the examination announcement
- Number of candidates who participated in the examination
- Number of candidates were placed on the eligible list
- Number and types of protests submitted to the Director of Transportation



- the disposition of any such protests to the Director of Transportation (i.e., the response of, or any action taken by the Director of Transportation in response; and whether they were appealed to the commission)

In addition to the above, the Commission has requested that probationary releases from MTA Service-Critical PBT lists be added to this report.

Adopted PBT Lists

The following table provides the requisite information for the PBT examinations that were adopted for MTA Service-Critical classes pursuant to Civil Service Rule 411A between July 1, 2022 and June 30, 2023.

Job Code & Title	1054 IS Business Analyst – Principal	1094 IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1825 Principal Admin Analyst II	6335 Disability Access Coordinator
List ID	148969	155168	151603	148528
Adoption date	12/4/24	6/26/25	1/10/25	2/7/25
Certification rule	Rule of 10	Rule of 5	Rule of 10	Rule of List
List duration	12 months	24 months	12 months	12 months
# of applicants	177	274	95	33
# deemed qualified	88	98	58	13
# of candidates participated in the exam	88	69	58	13
# of candidates placed on the eligible list	61	69	58	10
# of appeals	None	None	None	None



Job Code & Title	8219 Parking Enforcement Administrator	9172 Assistant Operations Manager II – Transit Division	9172 Assistant Operations Manager II – Transit Division (Promotive Only)
List ID	153055	155016	154780
Adoption date	2/26/25	6/13/25	3/11/25
Certification rule	Rule of List	Rule of List	Rule of List
List duration	12 months	12 months	6 months
# of applicants	148	154	20
# deemed qualified	11	46	15
# of candidates participated in the exam	10	46	15
# of candidates placed on the eligible list	10	46	14
# of appeals	None	None	None

For the 1094 recruitment, list ID 155168, the minimum qualifications for this exam required four (4) years of experience performing analysis, installation, technical support, and system administration in a network environment and an associate degree which could be substituted with additional qualifying experience. Many applicants either did not meet the required years of experience or had experience in other IT-related areas, such as web or software development, computer programming, or unrelated IT fields, which did not meet minimum qualifications or align with the duties in the job announcement.



For the 8219 recruitment, list ID 153055, this position is responsible for the day to day activities of parking control officers and supervisors and the exam requires specific vehicle parking code and traffic control experience. Many candidates applied but did not possess the necessary experience to be deemed qualified.

In this Fiscal Year, SFMTA transitioned our 9172 Assistant Division Managers in Transit to Permanent Civil Service through List 154780. This process was discussed with the representing union, MEA, to ensure clarity of the scope of such appointments and to ensure that those who were the most tenured in the positions would have the most PCS seniority upon appointment. One candidate was originally deemed qualified but was unable to make it only the eligible list due to being separated from the MTA before list adoption. Simultaneously, SFMTA created a secondary eligible list, 155016, which will be used to fill future vacancies in these positions.

Appeals

As a standard practice, we advise applicants of their appeal rights in our job announcement. The standard language is as follows:

Applicants must be guided solely by the provisions of this announcement, including requirements, time periods and other particulars, except when superseded by federal, state or local laws, rules or regulations. Clerical errors may be corrected by posting the correction on the Department of Human Resources website at [Careers with Purpose | City and County of San Francisco \(sf.gov\)](https://careers.sfgov.gov/)

The terms of this announcement may be appealed under Civil Service Rule 411A.35.1. The standard for the review of such appeals is “abuse of discretion” or “no rational basis” for establishing the position description, the minimum qualifications and/or the certification rule. Appeals must include a written statement of the item(s) being contested and the specific reason(s) why the cited item(s) constitute(s) abuse of discretion by the Director of Transportation. Appeals must be submitted directly to the Executive Officer of the Civil Service Commission within 5 business days of the announcement issuance date. Information concerning other Civil Service Commission Rules involving announcements, applications and examination policies, including applicant appeal rights, can be found on the Civil Service Commission website at <http://sfgov.org/civilservice/>.

In addition, we further advise our applicants of their appeal rights in our non-qualifying letters with the following standard language:



Civil Service Commission Rules for the City and County of San Francisco specify announcement, application and examination policies and procedures, including applicant appeal rights. They can be found on the Civil Service Commission website at <http://sfgov.org/civilservice/rules>.

No appeals were received on any PBT examinations this fiscal year.

Probationary Releases

A review of records indicates that no individuals appointed through MTA Service-Critical PBT examinations were released from probation during FY 2025. Note that for the lists adopted during the FY, some individuals may still be serving their probationary period.

Recommendation

Adopt the report.