



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**DANIEL LURIE
MAYOR**

Sent via Electronic Mail

August 7, 2025

NOTICE OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING

SUBJECT: REPORT ON THE POSITION-BASED TESTING PROGRAM.

The above matter will be considered by the Civil Service Commission at a hybrid meeting (in-person and virtual) in Room 400, City Hall, 1 Dr. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, California 94102 and through Cisco WebEx to be held on **August 18, 2025, at 2:00 p.m.**

This item will appear on the Consent Agenda. Please refer to the attached notice for procedural and other information about Commission hearings.

Attendance by you or an authorized representative is recommended. Should you or your representative not attend, the Commission will rule on the information previously submitted and testimony provided at its meeting. All calendared items will be heard and resolved at this time unless good reasons are presented for a continuance.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

LAVENA HOLMES
Deputy Director

Attachment

Cc: Carol Isen, Department of Human Resources
Kate Howard, Department of Human Resources
Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources
Lisa Pigula, Department of Human Resources
John Kraus Department of Human Resources
Jennifer Wynn Landgren, Department of Human Resources
Commission File
Commissioners' Binder
Chron

NOTICE OF COMMISSION HEARING POLICIES AND PROCEDURES

A. Commission Office

The Civil Service Commission office is located at, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720, San Francisco, CA 94102. The telephone number is (628) 652-1100. The fax number is (628) 652-1109. The email address is civilservice@sfgov.org and the web address is www.sfgov.org/civilservice/. Office hours are from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

B. Policy Requiring Written Reports

It is the policy of the Civil Service Commission that except for appeals filed under Civil Service Commission Rule 111A Position-Based Testing, all items appearing on its agenda be supported by a written report prepared by Commission or departmental staff. All documents referred to in any Agenda Document are posted adjacent to the Agenda, or if more than one (1) page in length, available for public inspection and copying at the Civil Service Commission office. Reports from City and County personnel supporting agenda items are submitted in accordance with the procedures established by the Executive Officer. Reports not submitted according to procedures, in the format and quantity required, and by the deadline, will not be calendared.

C. Policy on Written Submissions by Appellants

All written material submitted by appellants to be considered by the Commission in support of an agenda item shall be submitted to the Commission office, no later than 5:00 p.m. on the fourth (4th) business day preceding the Commission meeting for which the item is calendared (ordinarily, on Tuesday). An original copy on 8 1/2-inch X 11 inch paper, three-hole punched on left margin, and page numbered in the bottom center margin, shall be provided. Written material submitted for the Commission's review becomes part of a public record and shall be open for public inspection.

D. Policy on Materials being Considered by the Commission

Copies of all staff reports and materials being considered by the Civil Service Commission are available for public view 72 hours prior to the Civil Service Commission meeting on the Civil Service Commission's website at <https://sf.gov/civilservice> and in its office located at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720, San Francisco, CA 94102. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Civil Service Commission after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials will be available for public inspection at the Civil Service Commission's during normal office hours (8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. Monday through Friday).

E. Policy and Procedure for Hearings to be Scheduled after 5:00 p.m. and Requests for Postponement

A request to hear an item after 5:00 p.m. should be directed to the Executive Officer as soon as possible following the receipt of notification of an upcoming hearing. Requests may be made by telephone at (628) 652-1100 and confirmed in writing or by fax at (628) 652-1109.

A request for a postponement (continuance) to delay an item to another meeting may be directed to the Commission Executive Officer by telephone or in writing. Before acting, the Executive Officer may refer certain requests to another City official for recommendation. Telephone requests must be confirmed in writing prior to the meeting. Immediately following the "Announcement of Changes" portion of the agenda at the beginning of the meeting, the Commission will consider a request for a postponement that has been previously denied. Appeals filed under Civil Service Commission Rule 111A Position-Based Testing shall be considered on the date it is calendared for hearing except under extraordinary circumstances and upon mutual agreement between the appellant and the Department of Human Resources.

F. Policy and Procedure on Hearing Items Out of Order

Requests to hear items out of order are to be directed to the Commission President at the beginning of the agenda. The President will rule on each request. Such requests may be granted with mutual agreement among the affected parties.

G. Procedure for Commission Hearings

All Commission hearings on disputed matters shall conform to the following procedures: The Commission reserves the right to question each party during its presentation and, in its discretion, to modify any time allocations and requirements.

If a matter is severed from the *Consent Agenda* or the *Ratification Agenda*, presentation by the opponent will be for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes and response by the departmental representative for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes. Requests by the public to sever items from the [*Consent Agenda* or] *Ratification Agenda* must be provided with justification for the record.

For items on the *Regular Agenda*, presentation by the departmental representative for a maximum time of five (5) minutes and response by the opponent for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes.

For items on the *Separations Agenda*, presentation by the department followed by the employee or employee's representative shall be for a maximum time limit of ten (10) minutes for each party unless extended by the Commission.

Each presentation shall conform to the following:

1. Opening summary of case (brief overview);
2. Discussion of evidence;
3. Corroborating witnesses, if necessary; and
4. Closing remarks.

The Commission may allocate five (5) minutes for each side to rebut evidence presented by the other side.

H. Policy on Audio Recording of Commission Meetings

As provided in the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance, all Commission meetings are audio recorded in digital form. These audio recordings of open sessions are available starting on the day after the Commission meeting on the Civil Service Commission website at www.sfgov.org/civilservice/.

I. Speaking before the Civil Service Commission

Speaker cards are not required. The Commission will take in-person public comment on all items appearing on the agenda at the time the item is heard. The Commission will take public comment on matters not on the Agenda, but within the jurisdiction of the Commission during the "Requests to Speak" portion of the regular meeting. Maximum time will be three (3) minutes. A subsequent comment after the three (3) minute period is limited to one (1) minute. The timer shall be in operation during public comment. Upon any specific request by a Commissioner, time may be extended. People who have received an accommodation due to a disability (as described below) may provide their public comments remotely. The Commission will also allow public comment from members of the public who choose to participate remotely. It is possible that the Commission may experience technical challenges that interfere with the ability of members of the public to participate in the meeting remotely. If that happens, the Commission will attempt to correct the problem, but may continue the hearing so long as people attending in-person are able to observe and offer public comment.

J. Public Comment and Due Process

During general public comment, members of the public sometimes wish to address the Civil Service Commission regarding matters that may come before the Commission in its capacity as an adjudicative body. The Commission does not restrict this use of general public comment. To protect the due process rights of parties to its adjudicative proceedings, however, the Commission will not consider, in connection with any adjudicative proceeding, statements made during general public comment. If members of the public have information that they believe to be relevant to a matter that will come before the Commission in its adjudicative capacity, they may wish to address the Commission during the public comment portion of that adjudicative proceeding. The Commission will not consider public comment in connection with an adjudicative proceeding without providing the parties an opportunity to respond.

K. Policy on use of Cell Phones, Pagers and Similar Sound-Producing Electronic Devices at and During Public Meetings

The ringing and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

Information on Disability Access

*** Temporary Wheelchair-accessible entrances are located on Van Ness Avenue and Grove Street. Please note the wheelchair lift at the Goodlett Place/Polk Street is temporarily not available. After multiple repairs that were followed by additional breakdowns, the wheelchair lift at the Goodlett/Polk entrance is being replaced for improved operation and reliability.**

The Civil Service Commission normally meets in Room 400 (Fourth Floor) City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place. However, meetings not held in this room are conducted in the Civic Center area. City Hall is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center, located 2 ½ blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving City Hall are 47 Van Ness Avenue, 9 San Bruno and 71 Haight/Noriega, as well as the METRO stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call (415) 923-6142. Accessible curbside parking has been designated at points in the vicinity of City Hall adjacent to Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week. For American Sign Language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact the Commission office to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Individuals with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call our ADA coordinator at (628) 652-1100 or email civilservice@sfgov.org to discuss meeting accessibility. In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate such people, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical-based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, or to obtain a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance, contact Victor Young, Administrator of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102-4689 at (415) 554-7724, by fax: (415) 554-7854, by e-mail: sotf@sfgov.org, or on the City's website at www.sfgov.org/bdsupvrs/sunshine.

San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (San Francisco Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code Section 2.100) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the San Francisco Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Ave., Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112 and web site <https://sfethics.org/>.

CSC RECEIPT STAMP

Notifications

Carol Isen, Human Resources Director
Department of Human Resources
1 S Van Ness Ave., 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103
Carol.isen@sfgov.org

Kate Howard
Department of Human Resources
1 S Van Ness Ave., 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103
Kate.howard@sfgov.org

Anna Biasbas
Department of Human Resources
1 S Van Ness Ave., 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103
Anna.biasbas@sfgov.org

Lisa Pigula
Department of Human Resources
1 S Van Ness Ave., 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103-5413
Lisa.Pigula@sfgov.org

John Kraus
Department of Human Resources
1 S Van Ness Ave., 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103
John.C.Kraus@sfgov.org

Jennifer Wynn Landgren
Department of Human Resources
1 S Van Ness Ave., 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103
Jennifer.Landgren@sfgov.org



DATE: August 7, 2025

TO: Honorable Civil Service Commission

THROUGH: Carol Isen
Human Resources Director

FROM: John Kraus
Exams Manager, Miscellaneous

Anna Biasbas
Director, Employment Services

SUBJECT: **Report on the Position-Based Testing Program**

Executive Summary

This annual report is to update the Civil Service Commission (CSC) on the Position-Based Testing (PBT) Program from July 1, 2024, through June 30, 2025.

Background

The CSC adopted Rule 111A on PBTs on February 6, 2006. Hiring departments or agencies are permitted to conduct recruitments under the PBT Program in consultation with the Department of Human Resources (DHR). The program was intended to streamline the hiring of permanent employees by offering departments a more straightforward approach compared to the alternative of a Class-Based Testing exam process. The stated goal of the PBT Program is to adopt eligible lists resulting from merit-based exam processes within 60 days of the posting of a Job Ad.

Analysis

Table 1 on page two shows that 282 (55%) of the 515 exams administered during fiscal year 2024-25 were PBTs. The number of PBTs decreased 16.81% compared to the previous year – 282 versus 339. DHR believes that the conversion of additional prevalent PBT classes (e.g. 1823 and 1824 Administrative Analyst classifications) to Continuous Class-Based Tests (CCT), the Citywide hiring freeze, and the new Enhancing Employment Opportunities for City Employees (EEOCE) rules which went live in April of 2025 may have resulted in a reduction of PBT recruitments.

The table also shows that the median length of time to conduct PBT recruitments decreased from 157 days to 77 days which is much closer to the 60-day goal. Data indicated that the recruitments which took over 60 days to complete were primarily in IT and management classes, which are all hard-to-fill and have unique sets of minimum qualifications per position.

Table 1

	PBT			CBT			Total Tests
	# of tests	% of all tests	Avg. # days	# of tests	% of all tests	Avg. # days	
FY 2006-2007	120	52%	99	109	48%	113	229
FY 2007-2008	180	61%	82	117	39%	111	297
FY 2008-2009	106	67%	67	52	33%	81	158
FY 2009-2010	142	56%	63	110	44%	80	252
FY 2010-2011	333	69%	42	152	31%	54	485
FY 2011-2012	268	70%	48	113	30%	90	381
FY 2012-2013	243	68%	58	113	32%	73	356
FY 2013-2014	305	65%	62	167	35%	81	472
FY 2014-2015	392	61%	58	251	39%	77	643
FY 2015-2016	418	60%	54	280	40%	88	698
FY 2016-2017	416	62%	57	254	38%	97	670
FY 2017-2018	380	60%	56	251	40%	74	631
FY 2018-2019	354	57%	61	265	43%	90	619
FY 2019-2020	316	61%	68	205	39%	96	521
FY 2020-2021	238	49%	86	244	51%	132	482
FY 2021-2022	297	61%	94	186	39%	91	483
FY 2022-2023	355	61%	84	224	39%	89	579
FY 2023-2024	339	61%	157	219	39%	116	558
FY 2024-2025	272	57%	77	208	43%	62	480

Average # days in this table corresponds to the median time frame between the job ad closing and list adoption.

Protests/Appeals

Three protests/appeals involving PBTs were received during fiscal year 2024-25. All of the protest/appeals were administratively resolved by DHR and/or at the departmental level. The three protests/appeals over 282 PBTs yields a rate of 1%.

Probationary Releases

The CSC requested on March 3, 2015, that DHR's reports on PBTs include information about the number of employees released from probation as an indication of the "reliability" of the PBT program in predicting on-the-job success.

One hundred and eighty-eight employees were released from probation from the City and County of San Francisco during fiscal year 2024-25. (This does not include releases from CCD, CRT, MTA or USD.) Ten of these 188 releases (5.32%) were hired from PBT lists. Nine of these releases were non-disciplinary and one was disciplinary. Moreover, these 10 releases represent 1.67% of the 598 hires made from PBT eligible lists during fiscal year 2024-25. Table 2 on page three shows the classes from which the 12 PBT-related probationary releases occurred.

Table 2

Class	# Released
1070-IS Project Director	1
1093-IT Operations Support Administrator III	1
1209-Benefits Technician	3
1767-Media Programming Specialist	1
1942-Assistant Materials Coordinator	1
2463-Microbiologist I/II	1
2785-Assistant General Services Manager	1
2975-Rent Board Specialist	1
TOTAL:	10

Conclusion

Nineteen years of data is ample evidence to conclude that the PBT Program has been generally successful in producing eligible lists faster for some classifications than Class-Based Testing without compromising the quality of the exam process. As indicated above, hard-to-fill recruitments affected the median time to conduct PBT recruitments, but not significantly. DHR will continue to support departments through training and guidance with efforts aimed at further reducing PBT timelines.

Appeals of PBTs occur in 1% of all cases and a retention rate of 98% [1.67% released from probation] strongly supports the reliability of the program. DHR anticipates that the new EEOCE CSC rules will further reduce the number of PBT recruitments.

Recommendation: Adopt the report.