



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**DANIEL LURIE  
MAYOR**

**MINUTES  
Regular Meeting  
July 21, 2025**

**2:00 p.m.  
Room 400, CITY HALL  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

**This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2662 498 7435. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.**

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN  
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: #2662 498 7435  
Press # twice to listen to the meeting via audio conference  
Dial \*3 when you are ready to queue**

**DANIEL LURIE, MAYOR**

**COMMISSIONERS**

**KATE FAVETTI  
President  
JACQUELINE MINOR  
Vice President  
VITUS LEUNG  
ADAM WOOD**

**SANDRA ENG  
Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org), or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. **Effective January 1, 2025, public comment received by email or voicemail at least three hours prior to the start of a meeting will be provided to the members of the Civil Service Commission and will be included in the record on the Civil Service Commission website. These public comments will no longer be read aloud at meetings.** During commission meetings, members of the public may use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code #2662 498 7435.

**CALL TO ORDER**

2:04 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

President Kate Favetti	Present
Vice President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Commissioner Vitus Leung	Present
Commissioner Adam Wood	Present

President Kate Favetti presided.

**REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA.**

None.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Regular Meeting of July 7, 2025 – 2:00 p.m.

**Action:** Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**President Kate Favetti** shared solemn news that Gloria Sheppard, a former Civil Service Commission staff member has passed on. She welcomed Gloria's family and friends present at the meeting. Gloria Sheppard worked in the Civil Service Commission office as a Personnel Technician (1203) from July 7, 1999, until her retirement on February 2, 2013, she was an extraordinary person. President Favetti has wonderful memories of Gloria, her strength, her kindness, her compassion, her competence, her outstanding organizational skills. President Favetti has a true appreciation for the many times Gloria advised her and provided wise insight on appeals and life in general. Gloria was responsible for organizing and maintaining the meetings agendas, materials, records and making sure that this very important function of our office ran smoothly. Gloria was outstanding in her job, but little did we know that she was such a powerhouse in her church community where she was a respected leader. In the office, Gloria often spoke proudly of her son Shawn and her family. Gloria made a major difference in our office life and in her community. President Favetti acknowledged how much we respect Gloria and will adjourn our meeting today in Gloria's memory.

**Commissioner Jacqueline Minor**, expressed she did not know Gloria personally, Commissioner Minor was appointed to the commission after Gloria had retired. Commissioner Minor shared, *“when I learned that she had passed and had the opportunity to read both her obituary and see that glorious funeral program that the family prepared, (the family shared Gloria prepared it, herself). Oh, that's even more touching! Someone who lived her life in an organized way and was prepared to leave here in an organized way. I just wanted to express my sympathy to you, and to thank you for showing up today so that you could be a part of this acknowledgement and give us the opportunity to hear from you as well. That photo that is on the video stream is absolutely beautiful. There is something about the light and glow that is coming off of Gloria in that what looks like a gold dress and it probably says as much about her life and her spirit as any words could say. So, thank you so much for being here and I look forward to hearing your comments as well.”*

**Sandra Eng, Executive Officer**, expressed her appreciation that Gloria's family can be with us here today. Executive Officer Eng shared, *“we purposely put up Gloria's photo so those that did not know Gloria could see who she was, she normally sat in the commission clerk area here monitoring everything that went on at these commission meetings. It was amazing how much she did in the office, her role in the City was actually her second career. Anyone who visited our office would encounter Gloria, she and Elizabeth (who is now hosting these Webex meetings); together, they were the front line of the civil service commission. When employees and applicants came in with their concerns or issues, Gloria would be right there to help them. Gloria was very a firm believer in rights, when she heard somethings going on in the City and she knew it was not correct, she would not hesitate to come into my office, and she would stand there firmly and tell me ‘you need to do something right now, you need to call that department’, she wanted to make sure we addressed issues immediately. I was very proud to work with her because she took a stand, and she was also very proud. When Obama became president, she bought every newspaper in every language from all around the City and brought them to the office. She even gave me the Chinese newspaper, and I told her I could not read it, but she didn't care because it had his photo right in front. Gloria had great impact on the Civil Service Commission, with the staff. I'm sorry that you cannot see Elizabeth, who worked closely with Gloria in our office. Gloria was very passionate about her work, especially with appellants who came into our office, she also worked well with all our executive officers. She spoke her mind and was a very strong team player. When I offered to help her, she said, ‘No, because you're just going to slow me down’, that's how strong of a team player she was. Gloria was incredible and we are so grateful to have the family here.”*

**Eliza Gary** (Gloria's sister), *“First of all, I will apologize for being late, we had a senior moment, and we were in the wrong place, so, but we finally made it and with heartfelt thanks for what you all are doing today to honor our sister. I have my other sister here. We are the last two left, her husband, Maurice and two of Gloria's church leaders, the Gordons, are also with us. There's one thing about Gloria, and you've just testified to that, Gloria was Gloria everywhere she went - at home and at work. I worked with her at Pac Bell for quite a few years myself before she retired from there, I thought she had retired, but Gloria worked until a month before she passed away. She still worked and she always worked in jobs that involved people, she always impacted the people around her. She was never that concerned about herself, but she wanted everybody else to be satisfied, she wanted everybody else to do it the right way, she did not want to publish or put anything out that was not decent. It had to be right, even the dressing that she cooked for Christmas dinner, and she's the only one that could do it for the family, it had to be right. I just want to thank you all for taking the time out to honor our sister, it was very sudden,*

*very shocking for us. We apologize that the word didn't get to you soon enough, but she did leave a message that somebody be contacted here, and that's how much she loved you all. So, thank you all. Thank you."*

**Viola McClain** (Gloria's sister), *"I also apologize for our lateness, but I just want to say how thankful we are to you for honoring our sister today. Thank you. (President Favetti assured the family they arrived right on time) Thank you that's how good God is. That's what we say in Louisiana on the way we are going to be just on time. So, thank you for that, but again, thank you guys so much for honoring Glory. She was my buddy, we miss her, I miss her so much. I'm not the talker, she's (Eliza's) the talker, but I just wanted to come here and say for myself how thankful and how grateful we are to you for honoring her today. She will be sorely, sorely, sorely, sorely missed. Thank you. God bless you all."*

Items severed from the Ratification Agenda:

- PSC #DHRPSC0005352 - v0.01 from the Department of Public Health

### **HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No. 5)**

Carol Isen, Human Resources Director, informed the Commissioners that they are considering a amendment proposal to the rules on the way we handle Police Officers' eligible lists. Director Isen shared, I just want to talk a little bit more about this and give you our target date for when we want to come back to the Commission. The Department of Human Resources and the San Francisco Police Department are pursuing several efforts to increase the Q2 Police Officer candidate pool, one of the concerns that we found in working with the SFPD is that external jurisdictions are monitoring our lateral lists and taking actions to disincentivize those laterals from pursuing positions within the San Francisco Police Department. In addition, when lateral names appear on our publicly posted eligible lists, other jurisdictions are then attempting to poach those same officers from their home agencies. So, the public posting of those lists sets off these chain reactions for the people who are making the application (to join SFPD). So, we're going to ask this Commission to consider a rule change that would allow DHR not post the names (of eligibles) online. The Police Officer's Association, as we understand it, is in favor of this, they're going to want to appear before this commission to express their support and we hope to have this draft rule, in front of the commission at your September 15<sup>th</sup> meeting. If there are any concerns, you can let us know either now or subsequently. Certainly, you know how to find us as we work towards the preparation of this rule change. That's my report. Thank you.

### **EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S REPORT (Item No. 6)**

Sandra Eng, Executive Officer, reported several reports coming from the Civil Service Commission office at a later meeting. The year-end report and the annual report that Lavena is working with staff on it may be in the meeting of September 15<sup>th</sup> due to no meeting on August 4<sup>th</sup> (lack of quorum and August 18<sup>th</sup> (special meeting). Also, the adoption of the rules on removing DeID although we're ready, we're still waiting for just a few more closing matters that need to be taken care of by DHR before we can return to the commission to adopt the rules. So those are all the reports that are upcoming that may have to be heard in September.

**0166-25-8      Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts.  
(Item No. 7)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0005439 - v0.01	Public Health	\$9,000,000	Contractor(s) must provide pick up/drop off and processing to clean and disinfect a high volume of soiled hospital laundry seven days per week, including holidays, for Laguna Honda Hospital (LHH) and Zuckerberg San Francisco General Hospital (ZSFGH) to enable compliance with Title 22 of the State of California Department of Health Code of Regulations, San Francisco Department of Public Health Infection Control Policies, and Joint Commission (accreditation) requirements.	New	24 months
DHRPSC 0005352 - v0.01	<b>Health Service System</b>	<b>\$250,000</b>	Request for Proposal (RFP) for Off-site Professional Call-Center for the San Francisco Health Service System Member Health Benefits Services Unit during annual Open Enrollment period.	New	12 months
DHRPSC 0002245 - v2.01	City Administrator	Current Approved Amount \$11,250,000 Increase Amount Requested \$8,330,000 New Total Amount Requested \$19,580,000	Contractor shall provide shuttle bus services for members of the public and various City departments including the District Attorney's Office (DA), Department of Public Health (DPH), and Recreation and Park Department (RPD). The shuttle buses must be available on a scheduled-time basis and on as-needed basis, particularly where the use of public transportation is not a viable option such as during peak commute, early morning and late evening hours when the use of public transportation can be challenging. Additionally, Shuttle bus drivers must be able to assist passengers with boarding and offboarding, as well as the loading of any personal items with which they require assistance.	Amendment	Increase months 24 Total months 114

**Note:** *New Personal Services Contracts start date may not exceed eighteen (18) months after approval/commission meeting date.*

**Speakers:** Michael Visconti, Health Service System  
Naj Daniels, SEIU Local 1021  
Olga Stavinskaya-Velasquez, Health Service System

**Action:** 1. Approved PSC #DHRPSC0005352 - v0.01 with the condition to modify the amount to \$250,000 and the duration to twelve (12) months. Report back to the Commission in six (6) months.  
(Vote of 4 to 0)  
2. Adopted the report. Approved the requests for the remaining proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration.  
(Vote of 4 to 0)

**PublicComment:** Jesse Stanton, SEIU Local 1021, think it's unseemingly for a city department to come up here and say on the record that they struggled to complete one of their core functions. Open enrollment happens every year, this is their main time to shine, and they have to contract it out, that is strange.

**0162-25-8      Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contract  
#DHRPSC0005245 v 0.01 from the Department of Public Health.  
(Item No. 8)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0005245 v 0.01	Public Health	<b>\$18,000,000</b>	To provide security services to ensure the safety, security and welfare of patients/residents, visitors, and staff at the Zuckerberg San Francisco General Hospital, (ZSFG), Laguna Honda Hospital (LHH), and Primary Care and Behavioral Health Community Clinics, unarmed security guards will be assigned to fixed-position locations providing access control by screening people entering the facilities using visual inspection, as indicated. Unarmed security guards will also provide designated-route patrols of both interior and exterior locations. In addition, unarmed security guards will respond to incidents involving disturbances, violence and/or other needs to preserve order, including compliance with regulations pertaining to visitors, resident/patients, vendors, and the facility's premises. Contractor will provide regular written Daily Activity Reports and Incident Reports within Department designated turn-around times.	New	<b>36 months</b>

**June 16, 2025:**      Postponed PSC #DHRPSC0005245 v 0.01 from the Department of Public Health to the meeting of July 7, 2025, at the request of SEIU and the department.

**July 7, 2025:**      Continued to the meeting of July 21, 2025.

**Speakers:**      MyLang Do Nguyen, Department of Public Health  
Naj Daniels, SEIU Local 1021

**Action:**      Adopted the report. Approved the request for proposed Personal Services Contract #DHRPSC0005245 v 0.01 with the condition to modify the amount to \$18,000,000 and the duration to thirty-six (36) months; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration.  
(Vote of 4 to 0)

**Public Comment on all matters pertaining to Items 11, 12, and 13, including public comment on whether to hold Items 11, 12, and 13 in closed session. (Item No. 9)**

None.

**Vote on whether to hold Items 11, 12, and 13 in closed session. (Item No. 10)**

**Action:**      The Commission voted to go into Closed Session. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0051-25-6      Appeal by Harun David of Transportation Director's determination that by a preponderance of the evidence that there is insufficient evidence to establish findings of violations of the SFMTA's EEO Policy. (Item No. 11)**

**Closed Session started at 3:13 p.m. and the following were present:**

President Kate Favetti, Civil Service Commission  
Vice President Jacqueline P. Minor, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner Vitus Leung, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner Adam Wood, Civil Service Commission  
MJ Johnson, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Leanne Nhan, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Shanika Bell, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Harun David, Appellant  
Kate Kimberlin, Office of the City Attorney  
Sarah Fabian, Office of the City Attorney  
Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission  
Lavena Holmes, Civil Service Commission  
Elizabeth Aldana, Civil Service Commission  
Lizzette Henríquez, Civil Service Commission  
Shamika Gordon, Civil Service Commission

**Speakers:**      MJ Johnson, Municipal Transportation Agency  
                         Harun David, Appellant

**Action:**            Adopted report. Sustained decision of Transportation Director; denied appeal by Harun David. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**Closed Session for this item ended at 3:44 p.m.**

**0082-25-6      Appeal by Sandra (ess) Goldsworthy of Transportation Director's determination that by a preponderance of the evidence that there is insufficient evidence to establish findings of violations of the SFMTA's EEO Policy. (Item No. 12)**

**Closed Session started at 3:57 p.m. and the following were present:**

President Kate Favetti, Civil Service Commission  
Vice President Jacqueline P. Minor, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner Vitus Leung, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner Adam Wood, Civil Service Commission  
Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission  
Kate Kimberlin, Office of the City Attorney  
Sarah Fabian, Office of the City Attorney  
MJ Johnson, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Charles Drane, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Sandra (ess) Goldsworthy, Appellant  
Lavena Holmes, Civil Service Commission  
Lizzette Henríquez, Civil Service Commission  
Elizabeth Aldana, Civil Service Commission  
Shamika Gordon, Civil Service Commission

**Speakers:**      MJ Johnson, Municipal Transportation Agency  
                     Sandra (ess) Goldsworthy, Appellant

**Action:**          Adopted report. Sustained decision of Transportation Director; denied appeal by ess Goldsworthy. Highly recommended mediation. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**Closed Session for this item ended at 4:37 p.m.**



**0097-25-7 Request for a Hearing by John A. Nathan, former 7514 General Laborer with the San Francisco Department of Public Works on Their Permanent Future Employment Restrictions. (Item No. 13)**

**Closed Session started at 4:40 p.m. and the following were present:**

President Kate Favetti, Civil Service Commission  
Vice President Jacqueline P. Minor, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner Vitus Leung, Civil Service Commission  
Commissioner Adam Wood, Civil Service Commission  
Jesse Franklin, Department of Public Works  
Stephanie Cruise, Department of Public Works  
Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission  
Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources  
Kate Kimberlin, Office of the City Attorney  
Giano Bitto, Department of Human Resources  
John Nathan, Appellant  
Guadalupe Flamenco, Appellant's wife  
Lavena Holmes, Civil Service Commission  
Lizzette Henríquez, Civil Service Commission  
Elizabeth Aldana, Civil Service Commission  
Shamika Gordon, Civil Service Commission

**Closed Session for this item ended at 5:24 p.m.**

**Speakers:** Jesse Franklin, Department of Public Works  
John Nathan, Appellant  
Guadalupe Flamenco, Appellant's spouse  
Stephanie Cruise, Department of Public Works

**Action:** Adopted the report and denied the appeal. Upheld Department of Public Works' decision to restrict the future employment of John A. Nathan with the City and County of San Francisco for six (6) months effective May 1, 2025, and satisfactory six (6) months' work experience outside City and County service. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**Reconvene in Open Session. Vote to elect whether to disclose any or all discussions on Items 11, 12, and 13 in closed session (S.F. Admin. Code §67.12 (a)). (Item No. 14)**

**Reconvened in Open Session at 5:27 p.m.**

The Commission voted not to disclose any discussions in closed session. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 15)**

Commissioner Minor requested that when planning for the next calendar year, she would like the commission staff to review not having a meeting the 1<sup>st</sup> Monday in July in order to give staff and commission as well as all of the people that support commission meetings (thinking specifically of DHR), a planning window for knowing that there would not be a commission meeting, around July 4<sup>th</sup>.

**ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 16)**

The meeting was adjourned at 5:36 p.m. in memory of Gloria Sheppard.