

**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MERIT SYSTEM AUDIT PROGRAM  
FISCAL YEAR 2024-2025**

**Prepared by:**  
Preeti Grewal  
Senior Human Resources Analyst  
Civil Service Commission

## **INTRODUCTION:**

The role of the Civil Service Commission is to oversee and protect the civil service merit system for the City and County of San Francisco.

The Civil Service Commission is authorized by Charter (Article X Section 10.101. General Powers and Duties) to establish rules, policies, and procedures to carry out the merit system provisions of the Charter. The Commission provides oversight and hears appeals on examinations, eligible lists, minimum qualifications, classification, discrimination complaints, future employment restrictions with the City, and other merit system matters.

In its effort to ensure compliance of the civil service merit system, the Commission delineates responsibilities and goals to the Civil Service Commission Department Staff for the purposes of coordinating/conducting open dialog and discussion on the merits of existing rules, policies and procedures; make recommendations for change; and, where departmental staff, employee organizations, employees, applicants and members of the public can obtain consistent, fair and concise information on the merit system, the jurisdiction of the Civil Service Commission, and the application of its Rules, policies and procedures.

## **COMPLIANCE REVIEW AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE**

Charter Section 10.101 states, "The Commission shall have the power to inquire into the operation of the civil service merit system to ensure compliance with merit principles and rules established by the Commission." The Civil Service Commission at its meeting on October 16, 2006, gave general directions for the Civil Service Commission staff to conduct audits to determine if City and County departments are adhering to Federal and California State Law as well as compliance with existing Civil Service Commission Rules, policies, and procedures.

Under its Charter Authority, the Civil Service Commission staff conducts an annual Audit Program. The purpose of the Audit Program is to ensure compliance with merit system Rules, policies and procedures established by the Civil Service Commission through the investigation of the conduct or actions of appointees in all positions.

## **MERIT SYSTEM AUDIT PROGRAM GOALS & OBJECTIVES**

The Merit System Audit Program was designed to assess compliance of Civil Service Commission Rules, policies and procedures utilized by City and County departments. Commission audit reviews may include, but are not limited to auditing departmental records,

determining compliance with departmental and merit system practices, and interviewing and applying relevant merit system Rules, policies, and procedures. When an audit/review is conducted and completed, Civil Service Commission staff prepares a written report outlining the subject matter of the audit, an analysis and summary of the findings, and if identified to be applicable, recommendations regarding areas requiring corrective action will be noted. The results and/or recommendation of an audit review could also include scheduling the matter for Civil Service Commission consideration and action if necessary or appropriate.

In summary:

- The audit is a mechanism utilized to assist departments in reviewing their internal procedures regarding the compliance of Civil Service Commission Rules, policies and/or procedures.
- The audit review provides an assessment as to whether there is compliance with required documentation and/or records and recommends changes that may be needed to meet compliance standards.

## **ACKNOWLEDGMENT**

**Appreciation is extended to the departments and their staff who graciously participated in the audit.**

## **FISCAL YEAR 2024-25**

### **AUDIT OBJECTIVES**

All candidates selected for permanent civil service, provisional and exempt appointments must meet the minimum qualifications for the jobs to which they are appointed. It is the City's policy that employment verifications for all applicants be completed by departmental Human Resources professionals prior to an offer of employment with the City and County of San Francisco. This means that prior to extending an employment offer, or processing a candidate's appointment, hiring departments are required to verify information provided by the applicant regarding their qualifying experience and education, licenses, certifications, etc. Throughout this fiscal year, the Commission received numerous complaints alleging that appointees did not meet the required qualifications for the position to which they were appointed.

Therefore, this fiscal year the Commission focused on reviewing the following selection and appointment practices for thirteen (13) management recruitments conducted by various City departments to assess the department's compliance with applicable Charter provisions, Commission Rules, and merit system policies and procedures.

The position recruitments for the following departments listed below were selected for the Fiscal Year 2024-25 Merit System Audit Program.

Department	Classification	Job Type
Human Services Agency	0923 Manager II	Permanent Civil Service
Department of Public Works	0931 Manager III, 0932 Manager IV, 0933 Manager V	Permanent Civil Service
Department of Public Works	0931 Manager III, 0932 Manager IV, 0933 Manager V	Permanent Civil Service
Public Utilities Commission	0931 Manager III, 0932 Manager IV, 0933 Manager V	Permanent Civil Service
Recreation and Park Department	0922 Manager I	Permanent Civil Service
Department of Public Health	0941 Manager VI	Permanent Civil Service
Department of Homelessness & Supportive Housing	0932 Manager IV	Permanent Civil Service
San Francisco Office of the controller	0931 Manager III	Permanent Civil Service
San Francisco Airport Commission	0941 Director VI	Permanent Civil Service
Department of Children, Youth and Their Families	0953 Deputy Director III	Permanent Exempt
San Francisco Arts Commission	0951 Deputy Director I	Permanent Exempt

## STANDARDS

### Charter Sec. 10.101 General Powers and Duties

The Civil Service Commission shall adopt rules, policies and procedures to carry out the civil service merit system provisions of this charter and, except as otherwise provided in this Charter, such rules shall govern applications; examinations; eligibility; duration of eligible lists; certification of eligibles; leaves of absence for employees and officers; appointments; promotions; transfers; resignations; lay-offs or reduction in force, both permanent and temporary, due to lack of work or funds, retrenchment or completion of work; the designation and filling of positions, as exempt, temporary, provisional, part-time, seasonal or permanent; status and status rights; probationary status and the administration of probationary periods,

except duration; pre-employment and fitness for duty medical examinations, except for the conditions under which referrals for fitness for duty examinations will be made, and the imposition of new requirements; classification; conflict of interest; and such other matters as are not in conflict with this Charter; provided, however, that the minimum rule for the certification of eligibles shall be the Rule of Three Scores, and provided further that rules for leave due to illness or disability shall be approved by the Board of Supervisors. Changes to the rules may be proposed by members of the Commission, the Executive Assistant or the Human Resources Director and approved or rejected by the Commission. The Commission may, upon ten days' notice, make changes in the rules, which changes shall thereupon be printed and be in force; provided that no such changes in rules shall affect a case pending before the Commission.

### **Civil Service Commission Rules**

**Rule 110.9 Qualifications of Applicants** states in part,

“Every applicant for an examination must possess and maintain the qualifications required by law and by the examination announcement for the examination. Experience gained in violation of Commission Rules shall not be recognized. City and County employees shall receive credit only for the duties of the class to which they are appointed or assigned unless sufficient and credible documentation is provided to verify the performance of other duties. Employees may receive credit for duties not usually performed by incumbents in a classification if their employee file contains contemporaneous documentation that the duties were assigned and performed. By way of example but not limitation, records that describe and verify the out-of-class assignment that may be accepted as documentation include a valid performance appraisal completed during the normal evaluation period, payroll records filed at the time of the assignment and Notice of Assignment. Credit for duties not usually performed by incumbents in a class based on non-contemporaneous documentation shall require the certification of the Appointing Officer and the approval of the Human Resources Director...”

**Rule 111A.18 Adequacy of Examinations:** The Human Resources Director shall approve the adequacy of the examination to rate the capacity of the applicants to perform the job. Examinations may include, but are not limited to one or more testing devices such as written examinations, oral interviews, performance exercises, assessment centers, successful completion of requirements imposed by other authorities for the award of certification, licensure, academic recognition (e.g. degree, course completion), placement on a roster as provided in Sec. 111A.27, or any other devices or methods to determine merit and fitness for tested positions.

**Rule 111A.24.1 Posting of Tentative Eligible List Examination Score Report:** At the beginning of the inspection period the Tentative Eligible List Score Report shall be posted and made available for public inspection.

**Rule 112.1 Types of Eligible Lists:** The names of applicants passing all phases of an examination shall be placed on one of the following types of eligible lists in the order of total score. Eligibles with tie scores shall be listed in alphabetical order. Applicant information, including applicant names on eligible lists shall not be made public, unless required by law; however, an eligible list shall be made available for public inspection upon request once the eligible list is exhausted or expired and referrals resolved.

**Rule 112.1.2 Continuous Eligible List:** A continuous eligible list may be used for a class after the Human Resources Director has designated the class as a "continuous list class." Each time an examination for such a class is given, the names of the eligibles resulting from the examination shall be added to the existing eligible list, ranked by the eligible's score on the examination taken. For eligibles with the same score, names shall be listed alphabetically.

**Rule 113.7.4 Rule of the List:** The confidential list of names of all eligibles on the eligible list shall be certified to each available position. When Eligible List is Exhausted An eligible list adopted under the Rule of the List shall be exhausted when there are fewer than one third of the number of eligibles on the original list still available provided, however, if the original list had nine (9) or fewer eligibles, at least three (3) eligibles must be available; for original lists with forty five (45) or more names, at least fifteen (15) eligibles must be available. In the event that application of the one-third formula specified above results in a fraction, the next highest number shall be used. Use of the list when there is fewer than the minimum certification available shall be at the discretion of the appointing officer.

**Rule 114.25 Exclusions from Civil Service Appointment** states:

All permanent employees of the City and County shall be appointed through the civil service process by competitive examination unless exempted from civil service examination and selection process in accordance with Charter provisions. Appointments excluded by Charter from the competitive civil service examination and selection process shall be known as exempt appointments. Any person occupying a position under exempt appointment shall not be subject to civil service selection, appointment, and removal procedures and shall serve at the pleasure of the appointing officer.

#### **Policies of the Civil Service Commission and the Department of Human Resources**

#### **Department of Human Resources Memorandum No. 08-2010 – Verification of Employment History Information and Access to Employment Records in PeopleSoft**

This memorandum outlines procedures and policies regarding obtaining employment history and reference checks for current and past City employees prior to making a job offer. It states in part, "It is the City's policy that employment verifications for all applicants be completed by departmental human resources professionals prior to an offer of employment with the City and County of San Francisco. It is particularly important that departmental human resources professionals review and verify employment history information for current and past City

employees who are under consideration for appointment to a City position (e.g., promotion, transfer, "Prop F" hire, etc.). To facilitate that review, departmental human resources professionals now have access to the PeopleSoft system for purposes of employment verification prior to employment."

**Department of Human Resources Policy on Verifying Possession of Minimum Qualifications**  
(in-service conducted at HR Professional meeting on 8/19/2009)

"All candidates selected for permanent civil service, provisional and exempt appointments must meet the minimum qualifications for the jobs to which they are appointed at the time of the deadline published on the announcement. **"Prior to extending an employment offer, hiring departments shall verify information provided by the applicant regarding their qualifying experience."**

The policy provides specific instructions on "how" and "when" to verify an applicant's qualifications:

- When an applicant's qualifying experience was obtained through employment with the City and County of San Francisco the verification should be performed by the Department Personnel Officer or designee, who will check available PeopleSoft records. Credit for experience obtained outside of the employee's class will only be allowed if it was recorded and placed in the personnel file at the time the assignment was made. Qualifying experience of City and County employees should be verified prior to the examination. City and County experience should be verified by the recruiting analyst at the time of application.
- To verify work experience earned outside of City and County of San Francisco employment, the hiring authority must contact the candidate's current and/or former employers to confirm dates of service, job titles(s) and duties performed. A record of this contact must be made. If this verification information cannot be obtained, the hiring authority shall keep a written record of the due diligence efforts that were made. The hiring authority must seek verification from a candidate's current and/or former employers prior to making an employment offer. Verification may be solicited at the time of reference checks.

**Civil Service Commission Policy and Procedures on Exempt Appointments** states in part,

"...Exempt appointment is defined as an appointment to a permanent or temporary position exempt from competitive civil service selection, appointment, and removal procedures in accordance with the Charter. Exempt employees are considered "at will" and serve at the discretion of the department head...Exempt appointees must possess the minimum requirements for their class or position as established by the last examination announcement or class specification, whichever was issued most recently with a statement of the minimum qualifications. The department must verify and document that the individual meets the

minimum qualifications for his or her exempt position in accordance with the Department of Human Resources' policies and procedures; such documentation must be maintained in the employee's personnel file in accordance with the Commission's "Citywide Employee Personnel Records Guidelines..."

## **SUMMARY ANALYSIS OF AUDIT FINDINGS**

### **Minimum Qualifications**

Minimum qualifications (MQs) as listed on the job/examination announcement are formal statements describing what is required for individuals to have to compete further in the employee selection process. They are descriptions of the education, training, work experience, licenses, certifications, etc., that one must have to possess the competencies needed to perform a job at entry. Applicants who do not meet the stated MQs are eliminated from the selection process. Screening applications based on MQs is considered a selection procedure that is covered by the Federal Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures. To withstand Title VII lawsuits that allege discrimination or other illegal hiring practices, any MQ that is used to screen applicants must be job-related and consistent with business necessity. Generally, the minimum qualifications for the tested position will remain the same as the minimum qualifications that are stated in the class specification.

### **Verification as Part of the Application Process**

Applicants may be required to submit verification of qualifying education and experience, at any point in the application, examination, or departmental selection processes. All documents related to verification of minimum qualifications are required to be obtained prior to the appointment date of the candidate and are to be in the Official Employee Personnel File (OEPF) exhibiting compliance of procedures and policies. This refers to all candidates selected for permanent civil service, provisional or exempt appointments. In general, there are several documents that can be requested and used to assess employment verification of experience:

- Transcripts, licenses, or certifications
- Standard letters (on letterhead) from employers
- Performance evaluations that describe duties performed
- DHR Employment Verification form
- PeopleSoft records or appointment processing form

The following provides limited information regarding experience and can be used when other verification is not obtainable:

- W2 form
- Income tax returns

- Paycheck stubs

## **FINDINGS:**

All the appointees reviewed for this audit were deemed by their respective department appointing officers or designees to have met the minimum qualifications for the position to which they were appointed. The Department of Human Resources (DHR) policy requires that all documents related to verification of minimum qualifications are to be obtained prior to the appointment date of the candidate and are to be in the OEPF exhibiting compliance of procedures and policies. This applies to all candidates selected for permanent civil service, provisional or exempt appointments.

The DHR policy provides specific instructions on “how” and “when” to verify an applicant’s qualifications. To verify work experience earned outside of City and County of San Francisco employment, the hiring authority must contact the candidate’s current and/or former employers to confirm dates of service, job titles(s) and duties performed. A record of this contact must be made.

In general, there are also several documents that can be requested and used to assess employment verification of experience:

- Transcripts, licenses, or certifications
- Standard letters (on letterhead) from employers
- Performance evaluations that describe duties performed
- DHR Employment Verification form
- PeopleSoft records or appointment processing form

## **OVERALL SUMMARY:**

A total of thirteen (13) appointments were audited for compliance in verifying the qualifying education and experience of appointees selected for Permanent Civil Service or Permanent Exempt management positions.

Departments provided documentation verifying their appointees' qualifications. One department provided the verification during the audit.

This year’s audit illustrates how the Merit System Audit Program is indeed a constructive mechanism utilized to assist departments in reviewing their internal procedures regarding the compliance of Civil Service Commission Rules, policies, and Department of Human Resources procedures.

## **AUDIT REVIEWS**

## **DEPARTMNET OF HUMAN SERVICE AGENCY**

### **0923 Manager II**

#### **About the Department of Human Service Agency**

Human Services Agency of the City and County of San Francisco. Support individuals, families, and communities with food, health care, financial, employment, child-care, in-home, and protective services. Human Services Agency builds well-being in our communities by offering programs that make children and adults feel connected, valued, and supported. From financial assistance to nutrition, health care coverage, employment, and protective services, our dedicated professionals are here to lend support for all in need.

#### **Overview**

The Human Resources Manager for the department was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted with the assistance of the Human Resources Manager.

Class 0923 Manager II Eligibility Section Manager – Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

#### **Job Announcement**

The Department of Human Service Agency (HSA) announced the Permanent Civil Service (PCS) 0923 Manager II (Eligibility Section Manager) position on February 5, 2024, and the job announcement was closed on February 16, 2024. The announcement was listed under the position-based test (PBT) 0923-135575 and the Request to Fill (RTF) 01126045 recruitment ID. The certification rule was Rule of the List.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

The Minimum Qualifications included on the Request to Fill (RTF) were as follows:

**Education:** Possession of a baccalaureate degree from an accredited college or university, with major college coursework in economics.

**Experience:** Four (4) years of verifiable experience analyzing programs that determine eligibility for public assistance in a public or private social service agency or organization.

**Note:** Experience must be equivalent to the City's Eligibility Worker Supervisor (2907), Hospital Eligibility Supervisor (2909), Program Specialist (2913), Program Specialist Supervisor (2915), or Program Support Analyst (2917).

### **Post-Referral Selection Process:**

This was a Permanent Civil Service (PCS) appointment. The certification rule was the Rule of the List; therefore, all eligibles on the eligible list are reachable.

The Human Services Agency (HSA) invited all fifteen (15) eligible candidates on the eligible list for interviews. Two (2) of the fifteen (15) candidates declined to participate; therefore, HSA interviewed the remaining thirteen (13) eligibles. Based on the appointee's current role and experience, she scored the highest in the interviews and was selected for the 0923 position.

The Hiring Manager/Director for the Class 0923 Manager II (Eligibility Section Manager) San Francisco Benefits Net Director.

### **Qualifications of Appointee**

The appointee holds a master's degree in public administration from an accredited college or university. She has over eleven (11) years of City and County San Francisco (CCSF) experience, including:

- HSA-2913 - Program Specialist: June 10, 2013, to July 21, 2024
- HSA-2917 - Program Support Analyst: July 21, 2024, to October 12, 2024

### **Review of Documents/Findings**

The appointee meets the qualifications for the 0923 Manager II position. The certification rule for was the Rule of the List. Verification of qualifications and confirmation of qualifying experience were conducted through City and County San Francisco (CCSF) People and Pay job summary.

The appointee met the minimum qualifications, was a reachable eligible, and successfully completed a competitive selection process.

## **DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS**

### **0931 Manager III**

#### **About the Department of Public Works**

San Francisco Public Works is one of the largest and most complex municipal operations in the City, with a workforce of nearly 1,800 and a \$453 million annual operating budget. The department's active capital project portfolio exceeds \$3 billion. As one of San Francisco oldest City departments, it is also one of the most forward-thinking.

As a 24/7 operation with a diverse set of responsibilities, the Department of Public Works touches every neighborhood in San Francisco. The staff designs and manages construction of civic buildings and streets, cleans and greens the right of way, maintains civic buildings; trains people for jobs, keeps the right of way free of hazards, paves the streets, repairs bridges and public stairways, expands accessibility and works at the forefront addressing some of San Francisco's biggest challenges, including homelessness. Public Works relies on a large roster of partnerships to help deliver programs and projects: nonprofits, contractors, sister government agencies and volunteers. We seek to have racial equity tenets be the grounding in all our work. The core values of integrity, responsiveness and respect strengthen the department's foundation.

#### **Overview**

The Human Resources and Operations Director for the department was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted with the assistance of the Human Resources and Operations Director.

#### **Class 0931 Manager III – Permanent Civil Service Status**

#### **Job Announcement**

The Department of Public Works (DPW) announced the Permanent Civil Service (PCS) 0931 Manager III (Resilience and Disaster Planning Manager) position on May 3, 2024, and the job announcement closed on May 18, 2024. The announcement was listed under the Position Based - Testing (PBT) 0931-144669 recruitment ID. The certification rule was Rule of the List.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

The Request to Fill (RTF) approval for this appointment listed the following qualifications.

- Possession of a baccalaureate degree from an accredited college or university.

- Five (5) years of professional emergency/disaster planning and management of which three (3) years must have been in a supervisory role supervising professional staff involved in emergency/disaster planning management.

### **Post-Referral Selection Process**

This was a Permanent Civil Service (PCS) appointment. The certification rule was Rule of the List; therefore, all eligibles on the eligible list are reachable.

The Request to Fill (RTF) was submitted and approved, allowing for the recruitment and selection interview process to be conducted by the certification rule of Rule of the List. A notice of certification was sent out to six (6) eligible candidates on the list. The top four (4) ranks (1 to 4) were invited to the interview process. The candidate with the highest score in the interview process was appointed. All candidates were asked the same set of job-related, standardized questions designed to assess the knowledge, skills, and abilities required for the position, ensuring a consistent and equitable interview process.

The Hiring Manager of this position was the Director of Public Works.

The appointee was offered the job class 0931 Manager III position by the Department of Public Works on January 18, 2025.

### **Qualifications of Appointee**

The appointee holds a master's degree in public administration from an accredited college or university and has thirteen (13) years of City and County of San Francisco (CCSF) and external experience as following:

- San Francisco Department of Public Health (2593-Health Program Coordinator III): December 2019 – September 2024
- Santa Clara County Office of Emergency Management (Senior Emergency Planning Coordinator): July 2019 – November 2019
- San Mateo County Public Health Department (EMS Management Analyst): January 2019 – June 2019
- Nusura Consulting (Director of State): December 2017 – November 2018
- Hagerty Consulting (Senior Management Associate): June 2016 – November 2017
- Mt. Sinai Beth Israel (Administrative Manager): May 2015 – June 2016
- City of Boston (Regional Planner): September 2013 – May 2015

**Review of Documents/Findings:** The appointee meets the minimum qualifications for the position/appointment. Verification of qualifications and confirmation of qualifying experience were conducted through City and County San Francisco (CCSF) People and Pay job summary.

The appointee met the minimum qualifications, was a reachable eligible, and successfully completed a competitive selection process.

## **DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS**

### **Class 0932 Manager IV – Permanent Civil Service Status**

#### **Job Announcement**

The Department of Public Works (DPW) announced the Permanent Civil Service (PCS) 0932 Manager IV (Employee and Labor Relations Director) position on September 27, 2024. The job posting closed on October 21, 2024. This announcement was listed under the position-based testing (PBT) recruitment ID: 0932-151182/REF45178J. The certification rule was Rule of the List.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

The Request to Fill (RTF) approval for this appointment includes the following qualifications:

- Possession of a Baccalaureate Degree from an accredited college or university with a major in Industrial/Organizational Psychology, Human Resources, Public Administration, Business Administration, Management, or a closely related field.
- Seven (7) years of professional human resources experience in a complex organization, with at least three (3) years of experience supervising professional staff.

#### **Qualifications of Appointee**

The appointee holds a bachelor's degree in Negotiation from an accredited college or university.

She has ten (10) years of external experience as a Labor Relations Manager as follows:

- Kroger Manufacturing (Human Resources Consultant): December 7, 2007 – April 1, 2014.
- Ports America (Senior Labor Relations Manager): June 9, 2014 – April 25, 2017.

#### **Post-Referral Selection Process**

This was a Permanent Civil Service (PCS) appointment, and the certification rule was the Rule of the List. The Request to Fill (RTF) was submitted and approved, allowing recruitment and selection to proceed under the Rule of the List.

Nine (9) eligible candidates were on the list. A Notice of Certification (NOC) was issued, and nine (9) candidates were invited for interviews. One (1) candidate declined; therefore eight (8)

interviews were conducted. A meet-and-greet followed for the top three (3) finalists. the appointee was selected. The Department of Public Works (DPW) offered her the Class 0932 Manager IV position on January 18, 2025.

All candidates were asked the same set of job-related, standardized questions designed to assess the knowledge, skills, and abilities required for the position, ensuring a consistent and equitable interview process.

The hiring manager for this position was 0941-Director of Human Resources.

#### **Review of Documents/Findings**

DPW verified qualifications and experience with documentation maintained in the employee's personnel file.

The appointee met the minimum qualifications, was a reachable eligible, and successfully completed a competitive selection process.

## **DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS**

### **Class 0933 Manager V – Permanent Civil Service Status**

#### **Job Announcement**

The Department of Public Works (DPW) announced the Permanent Civil Service (PCS) 0933 Manager IV (IT Applications Manager – Information Technology) position on April 17, 2024. The job posting, listed under recruitment ID Position-Based Test (PBT)-0933-142439, closed on May 1, 2024. The certification rule was Rule of the List.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

The Request to Fill (RTF) approval for this appointment indicated the following qualifications.

- Possession of a Baccalaureate Degree from an accredited college or university with a major in computer science or a closely related field.
- Eight (8) years of experience overseeing enterprise application delivery, of which three (3) years must include experience supervising Technology (IT) professionals.

#### **Qualifications of Appointee**

The appointee holds a bachelor's degree in computer science mathematics from an accredited college or university. He has twenty (20) years of internal experience at the City and County of San Francisco, encompassing the following roles:

- PUC-1042-IS Engineer: August 29, 2005 – March 12, 2007
- DPW-1054-IS Business Analyst-Principal: March 12, 2007 – January 15, 2008
- CON-1044-IS Engineer-Principal: January 15, 2008 – December 21, 2024

#### **Post-Referral Selection Process**

This was a Permanent Civil Service (PCS) appointment. The certification rule was Rule of the List. The Request to Fill (RTF) was submitted and approved, allowing for the recruitment and selection process to be conducted according to the Rule of the List. Twelve (12) eligibles were on the list. A notice of certification was sent out, and the top four (4) candidates, ranked from one (1) to four (4), were invited to participate in the interview process. All candidates were asked the same set of job-related, standardized questions designed to assess the knowledge, skills, and abilities required for the position, ensuring a consistent and equitable interview process. The appointee received the highest score in the interview and was subsequently appointed to the position.

The hiring manager for this position was 0941-Chief Information Officer.

### **Review of Documents/Findings**

The appointee meets the minimum qualifications for the position/appointment. Verification of qualifications and confirmation of qualifying experience were conducted through City and County San Francisco (CCSF) People and Pay job summary.

On December 21, 2024, DPW appointed the appointee to the position. The appointee met the minimum qualifications, was a reachable eligible, and successfully completed a competitive selection process.

## **SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION**

### **0933 Manager V**

#### **About the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission**

The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (PUC) provides retail drinking water and wastewater services to the City of San Francisco, wholesale water to three Bay Area counties, and green hydroelectric and solar power to our municipal departments.

#### **Overview**

The Chief People Officer of Human Resource Services for PUC was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted with the assistance of the Talent Acquisition Manager.

Class 0933 Manager V Wholesale and Retail Services Manager- Power Enterprise – Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

#### **Job Announcement**

The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (PUC) announced the PCS Manager V 0933 (Wholesale and Retail Services Manager- Power Enterprise) position on July 3, 2024. On July 16, 2024, the filing deadline was extended, and the job announcement was closed on July 31, 2024. The certification rule was Rule of the List.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

- Possession of a baccalaureate degree from an accredited college or university.
- At least eight (8) years of professional experience in planning and implementing electric service functions such as electric load forecasting, electric meter data management, energy scheduling practices, or electric metering and billing operations of which three (3) years must include experience supervising professionals.

#### **Substitution:**

Additional qualifying experience may be substituted for the required education on a year-for-year basis up to two (2) years. Thirty (30) semester units or forty-five (45) quarter units equal one (1) year of work experience. An advanced degree in relevant fields of study such as engineering, business, computer science, economics, administration or policy may substitute for one (1) year of experience.

### **Qualifications of Appointee:**

The appointee holds a bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university. She has over eight (8) years of professional experience with the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC), including three (3) years in a supervisory role. Her experience is further detailed as follows:

- PUC-5602 Utility Specialist: July 13, 2009 – April 8, 2017
- PUC-0931 Manager III: April 8, 2017 – December 21, 2024

### **Post-Referral Selection Process:**

This was a Permanent Civil Service (PCS) appointment. The certification rule was Rule of the List.

The Request to Fill (RTF) was submitted and approved, allowing for the recruitment and selection process to be conducted according to the Rule of the List. Only one (1) eligible candidate met the minimum qualifications and successfully passed the examination. The top-ranked candidate was placed on the adopted eligible list, which was referred to the division on September 20, 2024.

The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (PUC) offered the Class 0933 Manager V position to the appointee on December 21, 2024. She was selected without an interview, and her minimum qualifications were verified through official documentation, including her baccalaureate degree, CCSF job summary, job announcement, and class specification, which outlined her previous experience at PUC.

The hiring managers for this position were:

- (0941 Manager VI)
- (0955 Deputy Director V)

### **Review of Documents/Findings**

The appointee meets the qualifications for the position/appointment. Verification of qualifications and confirmation of qualifying experience were conducted through City and County San Francisco (CCSF) People and Pay job summary.

The appointee met the minimum qualifications, was a reachable eligible, and successfully completed a competitive selection process.

**SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION**

## **Class 0932 Manager IV**

### **Job Announcement**

The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (PUC) announced the PCS Manager IV 0932 (Energy Data Systems Manager - Power Enterprise) position. The job announcement was posted on August 6, 2024, and closed on August 20, 2024. The certification rule was Rule of the List.

#### **Minimum Qualifications:**

**Education:** Possession of a baccalaureate degree from an accredited college or university.

**Experience:** Five (5) years of professional work experience in data collection, processing, analysis, and reporting; and information technology support or data system development and integration experience. This experience must include three (3) years supervising professionals.

**Substitution:** Additional qualifying experience may be substituted for the required education on a year-for-year basis up to two (2) years. Thirty (30) semester units or forty-five (45) quarter units equal one (1) year of work experience.

#### **Qualifications of Appointee:**

The appointee holds a Bachelor of Science degree from an accredited college or university. He has over five (5) years of professional experience with the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC) as follows:

- PUC-5601 Utility Analyst: January 21, 2003 – July 30, 2007
- PUC-5602-Utility Specialist: July 30, 2007 - December 5, 2011
- PUC-0931 Manager III: December 5, 2011 – June 10, 2023
- PUC-0932 Manager IV: June 10, 2023 – January 18, 2025

**Selection Process:** This was a Permanent Civil Service (PCS) appointment. The certification rule was Rule of the List. The Request to Fill (RTF) was submitted and approved, allowing for the recruitment and selection process to be conducted according to Rule of the List. The department received an adopted eligible list with four (4) eligibles on October 3, 2024. Upon request, the department reviewed the redacted application of the top-ranked candidate and proceeded with hiring ranked 1 without an interview.

The hiring managers for this position were:

- (0941, Manager VI)

- (0955, Deputy Director)

The appointee was offered the Class 0932 Manager IV position by the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission on January 18, 2025.

### **Review of Documents/Findings**

The appointee meets the minimum qualifications for the position/appointment. His minimum qualifications were verified through his degree transcript, City and County of San Francisco (CCSF) job summary, job announcement, and class specification detailing his previous experience at PUC.

The appointee met the minimum qualifications, was a reachable eligible, and successfully completed a competitive selection process.

## **SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION**

### **Class 0933 Manager V**

#### **Job Announcement**

The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (PUC) announced the PCS Manager V 0933 (Budget Director- Business Services Bureau) position on April 19, 2024, and the job announcement was closed on May 10, 2024. The certification rule was Rule of the List.

#### **Minimum Qualifications**

**Education:** Possession of a baccalaureate degree from an accredited college or university.

**Experience:** Five (5) years of progressively responsible financial experience coordinating, preparing, and managing large and complex budgets, of which at least three (3) years include supervising professional staff.

**Substitution:** Additional qualifying experience as described above may be substituted for the required education on a year-for-year basis (up to a maximum of two (2) years). Thirty (30) semester units or forty-five (45) quarter units equal one (1) year of work experience.

#### **Qualifications of Appointee:**

The appointee holds a Bachelor of Arts degree from an accredited college or university and has over five (5) years of professional experience with the San Francisco City and County (CCSF) as follows:

- ADM - 9920-Public Service Aide - Assistant to Professionals: September 25, 2017 - December 2, 2017
- HRD -1801-Analyst Trainee: January 16, 2018 - October 29, 2018
- MYR -0889-Mayoral Staff IX: October 29, 2018 - August 24, 2019
- MYR- 0892-Mayoral Staff XII: August 24, 2019 - July 11, 2020
- MYR -0901-Mayoral Staff XIII: July 11, 2020 - December 24, 2022
- MYR - 0905-Mayoral Staff XVII: December 24, 2022 – January 18, 2025

**Post-Referral Selection Process:** This was a Permanent Civil Service (PCS) appointment. The certification rule was Rule of the List.

The division received an adopted eligible list with eleven candidates on July 29, 2024. These redacted applications were evaluated based on merit, including experience in developing and managing complex budgets, supervisory experience, and knowledge of government budgeting

practices. Five candidates who met the criteria were invited for an interview. The appointee emerged as the top candidate.

The hiring manager for this position was 0941 Deputy Chief Financial Officer.

The appointee was offered the Class 0933 Manager V position by the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission on January 18, 2025.

### **Review of Documents/Findings**

The appointee meets the minimum qualifications for the position/appointment. Her minimum qualifications were verified through her degree transcript, San Francisco City and County (CCSF) job summary, job announcement, and class specification detailing her previous experience at the PUC.

The appointee met the minimum qualifications, was a reachable eligible, and successfully completed a competitive selection process.

## **RECREATION AND PARKS DEPARTMENT**

### **0922 Manager I**

#### **About the Recreation and Parks Department**

The San Francisco Recreation & Parks Department began in 1871 when city officials responding to residents' demands for a large public park established the Park Commission to oversee the development of. As San Francisco grew over the years, parks and facilities were added all over the city. The department is responsible for governing and maintaining all city owned parks and recreational facilities which include overseeing playgrounds and play areas, twenty-five (25) recreation centers and clubhouses, nine (9) public swimming pools, five (5) golf courses, tennis courts, basketball courts, soccer fields, numerous baseball diamonds, and other sports venues. The department also runs Sharp Park – Gold Course in and Camp Mather in Yosemite Valley -. Also, included in the department's responsibilities are the Marina Yacht Harbor, the San Francisco Zoo, and Lake Merced.

#### **Overview**

The Director of People and Organizational Culture for Recreation and Park Department was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted with the assistance of the Talent Acquisition Manager.

Class 0922 Manager I, Recreation Manager, Aquatics– Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

#### **Job Announcement:**

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department (REC) announced the Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Manager I 0922 (Recreation Manager, Aquatics) position on January 26, 2024, and the eligible list was adopted on June 10, 2024. The job announcement was closed on October 11, 2024. The certification rule was Rule of the List.

The 0922 Recreation Manager, Aquatics listed under Eligible List #139867

#### **Minimum Qualifications:**

**Education:** Possession of a bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university in Park and / Recreation Administration or a related field:

**Experience:** Three (3) years of progressively responsible experience supervising employees engaged in the planning/implementation of a broad range of recreational activities: Possession of a valid California Driver's License at the time of appointment.

**Substitution:** Additional experience as described above in minimum qualifications #2 may be substituted for the required degree on a year-for-year basis (up to a maximum of two (2) years). One (1) year is equivalent to thirty (30) semester unit/forty-five (45) quarter units.

### **Desirable Qualifications**

Possession of the following certifications:

1. Certification as an Aquatic Facility Operator (National Recreation and Parks Association) or Certified Pool Operator (National Swimming Pool Foundation)
2. Certification as Water Safety Instructor (American Red Cross or equivalent)
3. Certification as Lifeguard Training Instructor (American Red Cross or equivalent)
4. Certification in CPR Professional Rescuer

- Experience providing recreation programs, services and outreach to underserved and marginalized communities.
- Experience/Competence: Progressively responsible experience, and accomplished results demonstrating positive organizational impact.
- Strong, astute leader and communicator who can align the department's vision and values by inspiring, advising and facilitating goal accomplishment.
- Demonstrated expertise in successful team building by developing direction and structure for subordinates to facilitate accomplishment of identified goals.
- Solid experience in managing work groups by instructing and advising staff, assigning and delegating workload and tracking and evaluating performance.

### **Qualifications of Appointee:**

The appointee holds a Bachelor of Arts from an accredited college or university and has over twelve (12) years of City and County San Francisco (CCSF) professional experience as follows:

- 3215-Aquatics Facility Supervisor: May 26, 2012, to August 17, 2012
- 3289-Recreation Supervisor: December 31, 2016, to December 21, 2024

### **Post-Referral Selection Process:**

This was a Permanent Civil Service (PCS) appointment. The certification rule was the Rule of the List.

On October 4, 2024, REC sent a Notice of Inquiry (NOI) to all eligible candidates on List 139867. A total of six (6) candidates expressed interest in the position. All applications were reviewed to identify candidates who met the desirable qualifications.

On November 6, 2024, three (3) qualified candidates were invited to participate in a panel interview on November 14, 2024, at the McLaren Lodge - Annex.

One (1) candidate did not show up for the interview. The remaining two (2) eligibles were interviewed by a panel of three (3) panelists, who used structured interviews with the same set of job-related questions and rating criteria to evaluate them.

The panelists were as follows:

- 0922 Manager I
- 0923 Manager II
- 0953 Deputy Director

The hiring manager for this position was 0953, Superintendent.

The appointee was offered the Class 0922 Manager I position by the San Francisco Recreation and Park Department (REC) on December 21, 2024.

### **Review of Documents/Findings**

The appointee's qualifications were verified through his degree transcript, San Francisco City and County (CCSF) job summary, job announcement, and class specification. He meets the qualifications for the position. Verification of qualifications and confirmation of experience were conducted through the CCSF People and Pay job summary.

The appointee met the minimum qualifications, was a reachable eligible, and successfully completed a competitive selection process.

## **SAN FRANCISCO DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH**

### **0941 Manager VI**

#### **About the Department of Public Health**

The department has three main divisions — the San Francisco Health Network, Population Health and Behavioral Health.

The SF Health Network (SFHN) provides the direct health care to more than 125,000 insured and uninsured San Franciscans annually. The network includes Zuckerberg San Francisco General, Laguna Honda Hospital and Rehabilitation Center, and more than 14 primary care clinics throughout the city.

The Population Health Division (PHD) provides core public health services to all of San Francisco and addresses public health concerns, including consumer safety, health promotion and prevention, the preparation and response to public health emergencies, and the monitoring of emerging public health issues. The Behavioral Health Services (BHS) division is the largest provider of mental health and substance use prevention, early intervention, and treatment services in the City.

#### **Overview**

The Director of Human Resources for the Department of Public Health was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted with the assistance of the Human Resources Operations Manager.

Class 0941 Manager VI, Director of Dental Services— Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

#### **Job Announcement:**

The job announcement for Director of Dental Services (PBT-0941-146732) was announced on May 7, 2024, and the announcement was closed on May 20, 2024. The eligible list was adopted on July 8, 2024, with a certification rule of Rule of the List.

#### **Required Minimum Qualifications:**

**EDUCATION:** Possession of a valid license to practice dentistry issued by the Dental Board of California.

**EXPERIENCE:** Four (4) years of managerial experience in a health care entity, of which all must include supervising professionals; AND one (1) year of dentistry practice experience.

**Qualifications of Appointee:**

The appointee holds a Bachelor of Science degree from an accredited college or university and possesses the required Dental Board of California license. She has over fifteen (15) years of professional experience as a lead Dentist and Interim Dental Director in a healthcare entity as follows:

- Dental Director/Dentist (Organization North-East Medical Services): February 13, 2006, to January 7, 2022
- 2210 Dentist DPH: January 8, 2022, to January 4, 2025

**Post-Referral Selection Process:**

This was a Permanent Civil Service (PCS) appointment. The certification rule was Rule of the List. The referral was issued on July 19, 2024, including all five (5) ranks and a total of nine (9) reachable candidates. Three (3) candidates declined the interview invitation, and the hiring manager proceeded to interview the remaining six (6) eligibles. All candidates were asked the same set of job-related, standardized questions designed to assess the knowledge, skills, and abilities required for the position, ensuring a consistent and equitable interview process. The appointee was selected based on obtaining the highest interview score for the Director of Dental Services 0941 Manager VI position. She met the minimum qualifications and was deemed qualified for the classification.

The hiring manager for this position was 0942 - Director of Primary Care

Interview panelists were:

- 0942 Manager VII
- 0943 Manager VIII
- 0953 Deputy Director III

The appointee was offered the Class 0941 Manager VI position by the San Francisco Department of Public Health (DPH) on January 4, 2025.

**Review of Documents/Findings**

Appointee's minimum qualifications were verified through her degree transcript, San Francisco City and County (CCSF) job summary, job announcement, and class specification detailing her previous external experience.

The appointee met the minimum qualifications, was a reachable eligible, and successfully completed a competitive selection process.

## **DEPARTMENT OF HOMELESSNESS & SUPPORTIVE HOUSING**

### **0932 Manager IV**

#### **About the Department of Homelessness & Supportive Housing**

The Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing (HSH) launched on July 1, 2016. The department combines key homeless-serving programs and contracts from the Department of Public Health (DPH), the Human Services Agency (HSA), the Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development (MOHCD), and the Department of Children Youth and Their Families (DCYF). This consolidated department has a singular focus on preventing and ending homelessness for people in San Francisco.

#### **Overview**

The Human Resources and Operations Director for the department was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted with the assistance of the Human Resources and Operations Director.

Class 0932 Manager IV, Director of Outreach Shelter - Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

#### **Job Announcement:**

The San Francisco Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing (HOM) announced the Permanent Civil Service (PCS) 0932 Manager IV (Director of Outreach and Temporary Shelter) position on November 14, 2024. The job announcement closed on December 2, 2024.

The certification rule was Rule of the List and listed under recruitment ID: RTF0145585-01137199, Position Based Test (PBT) 0932-145586. List type was: Combined Promotive and Entrance.

#### **Required Minimum Qualifications**

**EDUCATION:** Possession of a bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university.

**EXPERIENCE:** Five (5) years of professional experience delivering and overseeing homeless services or other social services programs, including three (3) years of experience supervising professionals.

**Substitution:** May substitute up to two (2) years of education for Bachelor of Art degrees with additional years of experience.

### **Qualifications of Appointee:**

The appointee holds a master's degree from a degree from an accredited college or university and has over five (5) years of professional City and County San Francisco (CCSF) experience as follows:

- HSA-2924 - Medical Social Work Supervisor: January 21, 2014, to February 15, 2016
- DPH/HOM-2932 - Senior Behavioral Health Clinician: February 15, 2016, to August 20, 2018
- HOM-2917 - Program Support Analyst: August 20, 2018, to November 14, 2020
- HOM-0923 - Manager II: November 14, 2020, to October 12, 2024
- HOM-0932 - Temporary Exempt (TEX) Manager IV: October 12, 2024, to January 18, 2025

### **Post-Referral Selection Process:**

This was a Permanent Civil Service (PCS) appointment. The certification rule was Rule of the List. The process of creating the eligible list included two components: the Management Test Battery (40%) and the Training and Experience Questionnaire (60%). Of the seventeen (17) applicants, only three (3) met the minimum qualifications and were scheduled by DHR to take the Management Test Battery. The results were as follows: one (1) candidate did not show up, one failed, and one (1) passed. The Training and Experience Questionnaire was scored only for the passing candidate.

During the Post-Referral Selection Process, a Notice of Inquiry (NOI) was sent to the single eligible candidate, who expressed interest. This candidate, already serving as a Temporary Exempt (TEX) 0932, was the only option. After consulting with the hiring manager, the decision was made to proceed with vetting and offering the position to the appointee.

As only one (1) candidate passed both exam components, this candidate was the sole individual on the eligible list. The appointee was offered the Class 0932 Manager IV position by the San Francisco Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing on January 18, 2025.

### **Review of Documents/Findings**

Appointee's minimum qualifications were verified through her degree transcript, San Francisco City and County (CCSF) job summary, job announcement, and class specification detailing her experience.

The appointee met the minimum qualifications, was a reachable eligible, and successfully completed a competitive selection process.

## **SAN FRANCISCO OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**

### **0931 Manager III**

#### **About the Controller's Office**

The Controller is the chief financial officer and auditor for the City and County of San Francisco. Our team includes financial, tech, accounting, analytical and other professionals who work hard to secure San Francisco's financial integrity and promote efficient, effective, and accountable government. We hold ourselves to high standards and strive to be a model for good government. We value the diverse backgrounds, perspectives and lived experiences of our teams and clients in everything we do. We work in a collaborative and inclusive environment, promote equal opportunity, and invest in the professional development and wellbeing of our team members. Our employees are committed to serving the public with integrity and want to see positive impacts from our work. We strive to be a model for good government and to make the City a better place to live and work.

#### **Overview**

The Human Resources Manager for the department was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted with the Senior Human Resources Analyst.

#### **Class 0931 Manager III Refuse Rates Administrator - Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status**

#### **Job Announcement:**

San Francisco Office of the Controller (CON) announced the Permanent Civil Service (PCS) 0931 Manager III position on May 29, 2024, and the announcement closed on June 14, 2024. The announcement was listed under a Position Based Test (PBT) List ID: 147222. The eligible list was adopted on September 6, 2024. The certification rule was Rule of the List.

#### **Minimum Qualifications:**

Five (5) years of professional experience performing complex rate setting, rate administration, complex departmental fee, or financial and administration support including responsibilities such as public hearing administration and executive level oversight duties of which three (3) year must include experience supervising professional staff or consultants.

#### **Desirable Qualifications:**

Experience with regulatory compliance, public transparency and timely reporting and response to the press and public information requests.

- Experience in complex rate setting and administration, subject to California Propositions 26 and 218.
- Experience developing rates and rate structures that ensure affordability, fairness, equity, and environmental sustainability by ratepayer type and service.
- Experience implementing regulations, pilot projects and applying lessons learned.

**EDUCATION:** Possession of a baccalaureate degree from an accredited college or university.

**Qualifications of Appointee:** The appointee holds a Masters and bachelor's in economics degree from an accredited college or university. The appointee has served as (PEX) 0931 Manager III – Refuse Rates Administrator at the Controller's Office since December 2022. He exceeds the minimum experience requirements with fourteen (14) years of service with the San Francisco Controller's office (CON) as follows:

- CON-9920-Public Service Aide - Assistant to Professionals - January 19, 2011 - September 19, 2011
- CON-1823-Senior Administrative Analyst - September 19, 2011 - December 21, 2015
- CON-1824-Principal Administrative Analyst - December 21, 2015 - October 20, 2018
- CON-0923-Manager II - October 20, 2018 - December 10, 2022

#### **Selection Process:**

This was a Permanent Civil Service (PCS) appointment. The certification rule was Rule of the List. A total of twenty-three (23) applications were received for the 0931 Manager III Refuse Rates Administrator position. Seven (7) candidates met the minimum qualifications and were invited to participate in the Supplemental Examination. In total, four (4) candidates submitted their examination responses.

The examinations were rated by two (2) qualified Subject Matter Experts from the following classifications:

- 0932 Manager IV Systems Division, Controllers Office
- 0931 Manager III Administration Division, Controllers Office

Four (4) candidates passed the exam and were ranked on the 0931 Manager III Refuse Rates Administrator eligible list.

Based on examination results and eligible list ranking, the division offered the 0931 Manager III Refuse Rates Administrator position to the top-ranked candidate, the appointee.

Hiring Manager: The 0931 Manager III (Refuse Rates Administrator) position reports directly to the 0955 Deputy Controller, formerly and currently.

The San Francisco Controllers Office offered the Class 0931 Manager III permanent civil service position to the appointee on September 28, 2024.

### **Review of Documents/Findings**

Appointee's minimum qualifications were verified through his degree transcript, San Francisco City and County (CCSF) job summary, job announcement, and class specification detailing his experience.

The appointee met the minimum qualifications, was a reachable eligible, and successfully completed a competitive selection process

## **San Francisco Airport Commission**

### **0941 Director VI**

#### **About the Airport Commission:**

The Airport Commission was established by City Charter in 1970. In accordance with the Charter, the Airport Commission is primarily a policy-making body, establishing the policies by which the airport operates. The Commission is prohibited by Charter from involving itself in the day-to-day operation of the airport. That function is vested in the Airport Director.

#### **Overview:**

The Director of People, Performance & Development/Operations for the department was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted with the Talent Acquisition Program Manager.

Class 0941 Director VI Director of ITT Operations job advertisement- Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

#### **Job Announcement:**

San Francisco Airport Commission announced the Permanent Civil Service (PCS) 0941 Director VI (Director of ITT Operations) job advertisement on August 15, 2024, and the job announcement was closed on August 22, 2024. The announcement was listed under the Position Based Test (PBT) 0941-149839. The recruitment process included a minimum qualification supplemental questionnaire and a supplemental questionnaire evaluation, weighted at 100%. The certification rule was Rule of the List.

#### **Required Minimum Qualifications:**

**Education:** Bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university

**Experience:** Four (4) years of verifiable managerial experience overseeing IT infrastructure, development, operations, and maintenance of information systems, all of which must include supervisory experience. Experience with significant budgetary responsibilities and project management of complex information systems is required.

**Substitution:** Additional qualifying full-time work experience (2,000 hours equals one year) may be substituted for up to two (2) years of the required education. One (1) year of work experience equals to 30 semester units/45 quarter units OR Possession of a master's degree from an accredited college or university may substitute for two (2) years of the required work experience.

One-year full-time employment is equivalent to 2,000 hours (2,000 hours of qualifying work experience is based on a 40-hour work week). Any overtime hours that you work above 40 hours per week are not included in the calculation to determine full-time employment.

### **Qualifications of Appointee:**

The appointee holds a Master of Science degree from an accredited college or university and has over eight (8) years of verified relevant work experience as follows:

- Ultra Electronics Airport Systems (Vice President of Sales - Americas) – February 25, 2014 - July 1, 2018
- Arup (Digital Aviation Leader) – July 2, 2018 – August 27, 2021
- Materna IPS USA Corp (Chief Operating Officer) – August 30, 2021 - August 31, 2022

### **Post-Referral Selection Process:**

This was a Permanent Civil Service (PCS) appointment. The certification rule was Rule of the List. SFO received a total of seventy-five (75) applications, of which forty-nine (49) met the minimum qualifications. Forty-nine (49) eligibles were invited to participate in the examination process, and thirty-seven (37) eligibles who passed the examination were placed on the eligible list (ID 149839) on September 27, 2024. The post-referral selection process involved a de-identified application review of the thirty-seven (37) eligibles. The hiring manager identified six (6) candidates based on the desired qualifications outlined in the job posting. All candidates were asked the same set of job-related, standardized questions designed to assess the knowledge, skills, and abilities required for the position, ensuring a consistent and equitable interview process.

On October 9, and 10, 2024, six (6) eligibles were interviewed. The appointee was selected as the top eligible and invited to a second-round interview on October 16, 2024.

The hiring manager for this position was 0955 - Chief Digital Transformation Officer.

The San Francisco Airport Commission offered the Class 0941 Director VI Director of ITT Operations permanent civil service position to the appointee on January 4, 2025.

### **Review of Documents/Findings**

The appointee's minimum qualifications were verified through his degree transcript, external employment verifications, job announcement, and class specifications detailing his experience. The appointee met the minimum qualifications, was a reachable eligible, and successfully completed a competitive selection process.

## **San Francisco Department of Children, Youth and Their Families**

### **0953 Deputy Director III (PEX)**

#### **About the Department of Children, Youth and Their Families:**

In 1991, San Francisco residents approved the Children and Families First Initiative, allocating property tax revenues to benefit the city's youth and their families. The Department of Children, Youth and Their Families (DCYF) oversees the distribution of the Children and Youth Fund. DCYF envisions a robust San Francisco where all young people are:

- Supported by nurturing families and communities
- Physically and emotionally healthy
- Ready to learn and succeed in school
- Prepared for college, work, and productive adulthood

#### **Overview:**

The Chief Financial Officer for the department was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted in collaboration with the Department of Human Resources (DHR) client service consultant.

Class 0953 Deputy Director III job advertisement- Permanent Exempt (PEX) Status

#### **Job Announcement:**

The Permanent Exempt (PEX) 0953 Deputy Director III position at the San Francisco Department of Children, Youth, and Their Families was an exempt recruitment. There was no civil service selection process for this exempt appointment.

#### **Required Minimum Qualifications:**

**Education:** Bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university

**Experience:** Six (6) years of senior-level management experience in the public, private or nonprofit sector, with a focus on services for children and youth. Responsibilities must have included: direct supervision of staff and their activities, program development, program implementation, and strategic collaboration across organizations or systems.

**Substitution:** May substitute up to two (2) years of education with additional years of experience. A master's degree in public administration, public policy, social work or another related field may substitute for one (1) year of the required management experience.

**Qualifications of Appointee:** The appointee, the appointee, holds a Bachelor of Arts degree from an accredited college or university and has over twelve (12) years of verified relevant work experience with the San Francisco Department of Children, Youth and Their Families as follows:

- Department of Children, Youth and Their Families (CHF)- 9774-Senior Community Development Specialist I – from April 16, 2012 - January 16, 2016
- Department of Children, Youth and Their Families (CHF)- 9775-Senior Community Development Specialist II – from January 16, 2016 - June 3, 2017
- Department of Children, Youth and Their Families (CHF)- 922-Manager I – from June 3, 2017 - August 25, 2021
- Department of Children, Youth and Their Families (CHF)- 0931-Manager III – from August 25, 2021 - June 12, 2023

**Selection Process:**

The 0953 Deputy Director III position was not publicly posted. For this exempt appointment, the hiring manager evaluated the requirements for the role and assessed the skills and experience of current staff to determine who could meet the criteria. Since exempt appointments do not require a civil service selection process, the department was only required to show how the appointee met the minimum qualifications for the position.

**Review of Documents/Findings:**

the appointee's minimum qualifications were verified through her degree transcript, her city and county of San Francisco (CCSF) job summary, and class specifications detailing his experience.

The appointee met the minimum qualifications, was a reachable eligible, and successfully completed a competitive selection process

## **SAN FRANCISCO ART COMMISSION**

### **O951 Deputy Director (PEX)**

#### **About the Art Commission**

#### **Overview**

The Deputy Director of Finance & Administration for the department was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted with the Department of Human Resources (DHR) client service consultant.

Class 0951 Deputy Director of Programs - Permanent Exempt (PEX)

#### **Job Announcement:**

The San Francisco Arts Commission (ART) announced the Permanent Exempt (PEX) 0951 Deputy Director position under Recruitment ID RTF0148713-01144704. The job was posted on July 1, 2024, and closed on July 23, 2024.

#### **Required Minimum Qualifications:**

**EDUCATION:** Possession of a baccalaureate degree from an accredited college or university.

**EXPERIENCE:** 5 years of managerial experience, preferably in an arts and/or cultural institution of which all 5 years must include experience supervising professionals.

**Substitution:** May substitute additional years of experience for up to 2 years of education towards a Bachelor of Art degree. One year of full-time employment is equivalent to 2,000 hours of qualifying work experience (one year if performed full-time at 40 hours per week).

#### **Qualifications of Appointee:**

The appointee holds a Master of Business Administration degree from an accredited college or university and has over five (5) years of professional experience as follows:

- San Francisco African American Arts and Cultural District (Operation Director): January 1, 2019 - January 2, 2023

- San Francisco Office of the Economic Workforce Development (9774-Senior Community Development Specialist I): January 2, 2023 - September 3, 2024.

### **Selection Process:**

This Permanent Exempt (PEX) 0951 Deputy Director of Programs recruitment was open for three (3) weeks, from July 1, 2024 to July 22, 2024. A total of 140 applications were received, and 106 candidates met the minimum qualifications. After reviewing and finalizing the applicant list, thirty (30) candidates were invited to the first-round interview. One (1) candidate did not attend. The remaining twenty-nine (29) candidates, who met the minimum qualifications for the 0951 Deputy Director of Programs role, participated in 30-minute phone screenings.

The remaining twenty-nine (29) eligibles had managerial experience in arts and/or cultural institutions. The phone screenings assessed verbal communication, interpersonal skills, commitment to diversity, equity, and inclusion, and listening skills. Nine (9) eligibles advanced to the second round, which consisted of a 45-minute in-person interview.

Four (4) eligibles moved on to the final round, a 60-minute in-person interview. The appointee was selected as the top candidate. Interview questions followed the Department of Human Resources (DHR) structured interview guidelines, and candidates were evaluated using a five-point scoring system. All candidates were asked the same set of job-related, standardized questions designed to assess the knowledge, skills, and abilities required for the position, ensuring a consistent and equitable interview process.

The hiring manager for this position was Director of Cultural Affairs at the San Francisco Arts Commission.

The San Francisco Art Commission offered the Class 0951 Deputy Director position to the appointee on August 31, 2024.

### **Review of Documents/Findings**

Appointee's minimum qualifications were verified through his degree transcript, San Francisco City and County (CCSF) job summary, and external employment verification, job announcement, and class specification detailing his experience.

The appointee met the minimum qualifications, was a reachable eligible, and successfully completed a competitive selection process.