



Committee on Information Technology

Office of the City Administrator

San Francisco City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 352

Draft Minutes

COIT Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board Meeting
City and County of San Francisco

Thursday, April 24, 2025

1:30 PM – 3:30 PM

City Hall, Room 305 and Webex Online Event

Members

Edward McCaffrey – Chair, Director, Committee on Information Technology
Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport
Mikela Clemmons – Technical Director, Digital Services
Sam Glaser-Nolan – Technical Project Manager, Office of the City Administrator
Soumya Kalra – Chief Data Officer, Digital and Data Services
Nathan Sinclair – Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology
Georg Wolf – IT Audit Manager, Controller's Office
Mariam Abdel-Malek – Public Member

1. Call to Order by Chair

Edward McCaffrey called the meeting to order at 1:32 PM, provided instructions on how to give public comment, and conducted the roll call.

2. Roll Call

Present

Edward McCaffrey -- Chair, Director, Committee on Information Technology
Guy Clarke -- IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport
Mikela Clemmons -- Technical Director, Digital Services
Sam Glaser-Nolan -- Technical Project Manager, Office of the City Administrator
Soumya Kalra -- Chief Data Officer, Digital and Data Services
Nathan Sinclair -- Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology
Georg Wolf -- IT Audit Manager, Controller's Office
Mariam Abdel-Malek -- Public Member

COIT Staff

Julia Chrusciel – Privacy Analyst, Committee on Information Technology
Damon Daniels – Technology Portfolio Manager, Committee on Information Technology
Danny Thomas Vang – Policy Analyst, Committee on Information Technology

3. General Public Comment

There was no public comment.

4. Approval of Meeting Minutes from February 27, 2025 (Action Item)

There was no public comment.

Guy Clarke, San Francisco International Airport, made a motion to approve the minutes.
Nathan Sinclair, Department of Technology, seconded the motion.

The motion was approved by the following members. There were no votes in opposition.

Edward McCaffrey - Chair, Director, Committee on Information Technology

Guy Clarke - IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport

Mikela Clemmons - Technical Director, Digital Services

Sam Glaser-Nolan - Technical Project Manager, Office of the City Administrator

Nathan Sinclair - Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology

Georg Wolfl - IT Audit Manager, Controller's Office

5. Department Updates & Announcements

Edward McCaffrey informed subcommittee members that the 2024 Annual Surveillance Report was presented and recommended with a positive recommendation by the Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee on Monday, April 21. This item will be heard on Tuesday, April 29, 2025, at the full Board of Supervisors. He noted that the reporting schedule for 2025 and 2026 will differ from previous years, and COIT staff is currently working to distribute the updated timeline to departments. Edward McCaffrey also welcomed Sam Glaser-Nolan and Soumya Kalra to the subcommittee. They will be serving as delegates for Molly Peterson and Tania Jogesh.

There was no public comment.

6. Surveillance Technology Policy Review: Camera, Non-Security (Action Item)

Carl Nicita, Kara Lacy, and Lt. Jonathan Ozol presented on behalf of the Police Department on their body-worn cameras policy.

Subcommittee members inquired about the definitions and criteria for specific terminology, the video retention timeline, the access levels for audit logs, the frequency of audit log reviews conducted by staff, the tools utilized for video redaction, the volume of video footage stored, the function of the buffer mode, and the technology's connection to the mayor's street team response effort.

The Police Department explained that baseline regulatory requirements can be found in state laws, which are further supported by internal policies that establish specific processes and protocols for these frameworks. The department's technology team is available to provide further technical and statistical information upon request. They also emphasized that video storage presents ongoing challenges due to the need to retain footage related to criminal cases, particularly to preserve evidence for potential future appeals. Notably, regulatory standards primarily focus on minimum retention requirements, rather than maximum limits.

Subcommittee members recommended directly referring to external regulatory language for additional clarity where appropriate and suggested categorizing video retention into two distinct groups. Footage not associated with an arrest is subject to expedited deletion, whereas footage linked to an arrest may be retained indefinitely.

There was no public comment.

PSAB members recommend the policy to the Board of Supervisors, pending the following changes:

- Summarize the audit log process and audit playbook to include the protocol for authorized users when accessing the database, details related to the time and date when videos are accessed, the system that is used, a list of authorized users who flag any anomalies which may arise, what data is regularly deleted and what is retained, and information on how long are the audit logs are retained (to be added to Data Security section, pg. 6-7, STP)
- Detail data access in terms of roles, specifically which roles can view, download, and share footage, as well as defining “need to know” and “right to know” roles within the policy (to be added to Access section, pg. 4-5, STP)
- Include information about current storage costs and projections for storage costs in the future, including the average size of a file that is stored (to be added to Data Storage section, pg. 7, STP)
- Clarify the exemption process for the Chief of Police and the Chief’s delegate, such as identifying specific criteria that would make something exempt from typical retention standards (to be added to Data Retention section, pg. 10, STP)

Mikela Clemmons, Digital and Data Services, made a motion to move the policy to the Board of Supervisors, pending the changes outlined above.

Guy Clarke, San Francisco International Airport, seconded the motion.

The motion was approved by the following members. There were no votes in opposition.

Edward McCaffrey -- Chair, Director, Committee on Information Technology

Guy Clarke -- IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport

Mikela Clemmons -- Technical Director, Digital Services

Sam Glaser-Nolan -- Technical Project Manager, Office of the City Administrator

Soumya Kalra -- Chief Data Officer, Digital and Data Services

Nathan Sinclair -- Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology

Georg Wolfl -- IT Audit Manager, Controller’s Office

7. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 2:56 PM.