



Committee on Information Technology

Office of the City Administrator

San Francisco City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 352

Final Minutes

COIT Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board Meeting
City and County of San Francisco

Thursday, February 27, 2025

1:30 PM – 3:30 PM

City Hall, Room 305 and Webex Online Event

Members

Mike Makstman – Chair, City Chief Information Officer, Executive Director, Department of Technology
Edward McCaffrey – Director, Committee on Information Technology
Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport
Mikela Clemmons – Technical Director, Digital Services
Tania Jogesh – Senior Data Scientist, Digital and Data Services
Molly Peterson – Contract Reform Manager, Office of the City Administrator
Georg Wolfl – IT Audit Manager, Controller's Office
Mariam Abdel-Malek – Public Member

1. Call to Order by Chair

Mike Makstman called the meeting to order at 1:31 PM, provided instructions on how to give public comment, and conducted the roll call.

2. Roll Call

Present

Mike Makstman – Chair, City Chief Information Officer, Executive Director, Department of Technology
Edward McCaffrey – Director, Committee on Information Technology
Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport
Tania Jogesh – Senior Data Scientist, Digital and Data Services
Molly Peterson – Contract Reform Manager, Office of the City Administrator

Absent

Mikela Clemmons – Technical Director, Digital Services
Georg Wolfl – IT Audit Manager, Controller's Office
Mariam Abdel-Malek – Public Member

COIT Staff

Julia Chrusciel – Privacy Analyst, Committee on Information Technology
Damon Daniels – Technology Portfolio Manager, Committee on Information Technology
Danny Thomas Vang – Policy Analyst, Committee on Information Technology

3. General Public Comment

There was no public comment.

4. Approval of Meeting Minutes from November 7, 2024 (Action Item)

There was no public comment.

Molly Peterson made a motion to approve the minutes, Guy Clarke seconded.

The motion was approved by the following members. There were no votes in opposition.

Mike Makstman – City Chief Information Officer, Executive Director, Department of Technology

Edward McCaffrey – Director, Committee on Information Technology

Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport

Tania Jogesh – Senior Data Scientist, Digital and Data Services

Molly Peterson – Contract Reform Manager, Office of the City Administrator

5. Department Updates & Announcements

Mike Makstman welcomed the new COIT Director Eddie McCaffrey, announced that Eddie will be transitioning into the chair role, and informed members that Nathan Sinclair will be transitioning into the seat designated for the Department of Technology. Julia Chrusciel provided an overview of the amendments to the Chapter 19B Ordinance, and Molly Peterson spoke about the update to the procurement system used for privacy checks. Damon Daniels informed members about the status of the ICT Plan.

Questions posed by members of the subcommittee include:

- What causes a policy amendment to come back to COIT?
- How does the subcommittee get visibility into department proposed amendments that are sent back by the Board of Supervisors?
- Do departments have to post bi-annual reports on their websites, or just their policies?

6. Surveillance Technology Policy Review: Cameras, Non-Security (Action Item)

Sohail Warsi, Nabil Arnaoot, and Monica Giese presented on behalf of the Municipal Transportation Agency on their Automated Red Light and No Turn Enforcement Camera Policy.

There was no public comment.

Edward McCaffrey made a motion to move the policy to the Board of Supervisors, Molly Peterson seconded.

The motion was approved by the following members. There were no votes in opposition.

Mike Makstman – City Chief Information Officer, Executive Director, Department of Technology

Edward McCaffrey – Director, Committee on Information Technology

Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport

Tania Jogesh – Senior Data Scientist, Digital and Data Services

Molly Peterson – Contract Reform Manager, Office of the City Administrator

7. Surveillance Technology Policy Review: Temporary ID and Contact Tracing System (Action Item)

Marc Upchurch presented on behalf of the Department of Public Health on their Temporary Visitor Registration, ID & Tracking System Policy.

Questions posed by members of the subcommittee include:

- If a visitor comes in without an ID, will they not be able to see the patient?
- Is this ID verification practice currently enforced?
- Who maintains the watchlist database?
- What would be required for the department to provide law enforcement information, such as who visited a patient?
- Is the data on-premises, and does the vendor have access to this data?

Suggestions from members of the subcommittee include:

- Under the section labeled Internal Data Sharing, include the template language for engagement with law enforcement
- Under the section labeled Benefits, be more explicit about increased safety for staff and visitors

There was no public comment.

Edward McCaffrey made a motion to move the policy to the Board of Supervisors with the proposed amendments, Guy Clarke seconded.

The motion was approved by the following members. There were no votes in opposition.

Mike Makstman – City Chief Information Officer, Executive Director, Department of Technology

Edward McCaffrey – Director, Committee on Information Technology

Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport

Tania Jogesh – Senior Data Scientist, Digital and Data Services

Molly Peterson – Contract Reform Manager, Office of the City Administrator

8. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 2:22 PM.